



CITY OF DULUTH
REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR
ATHLETIC VENUES REINVESTMENT INITIATIVE ACTION
PLAN RFP NUMBER 24-99342
ISSUED FEBRUARY 27, 2024

PROPOSALS DUE 4:30 pm MARCH 22, 2024

SUBMIT TO
CITY OF DULUTH
ATTN: PURCHASING DIVISION
CITY HALL, ROOM 120
411 WEST 1ST STREET
DULUTH, MN 55802

PART I - GENERAL INFORMATION

I-1. Project Overview. The City of Duluth is soliciting qualified professional consulting services for the development of an Athletic Venues Reinvestment Initiative (AVRI) Action Plan for thirteen existing outdoor athletic venues and one or two, new or renewed, indoor athletic venues. City funding for reinvestment will be sourced primarily from a local tourism tax that may only be spent on facilities that support “sports tourism.” Qualifying facilities are defined as athletic venues that already host or, if improved, would host athletic competitions that regularly draw numerous participants from outside the Duluth area.

Additional detail is provided in **Part IV** of this RFP.

I-2. Calendar of Events. The City will make every effort to adhere to the following schedule:

Activity	Date
Virtual Pre-proposal Meeting	Monday, March 11, 2024 at 9:00 am
Deadline to submit Questions via email to purchasing@duluthmn.gov	Wednesday, March 13, 2024
Answers to questions will be posted to the City website no later than this date.	Friday, March 15, 2024
Proposals must be received in the Purchasing Office by 4:30 PM on this date.	Friday, March 22, 2024

I-3. Rejection of Proposals. The City reserves the right, in its sole and complete discretion, to reject any and all proposals or cancel the request for proposals, at any time prior to the time a contract is fully executed, when it is in its best interests. The City is not liable for any costs the Bidder incurs in preparation and submission of its proposal, in participating in the RFP process or in anticipation of award of the contract.

I-4. Pre-proposal Meeting. The City will hold an optional pre-proposal meeting as specified in the Calendar of Events. Interested Bidders can attend Microsoft Teams.

I-5. Questions & Answers. Any questions regarding this RFP must be submitted by e-mail to the Purchasing Office at purchasing@duluthmn.gov **no later than** the date indicated on the Calendar of Events. Answers to the questions will be posted as an Addendum to the RFP.

I-6. Addenda to the RFP. If the City deems it necessary to revise any part of this RFP before the proposal response date, the City will post an addendum to its website <http://www.duluthmn.gov/purchasing/bids-request-for-proposals/> . Although an e-mail

notification will be sent, it is the Bidder's responsibility to periodically check the website for any new information

I-7. Proposals. To be considered, hard copies of proposals must arrive at the City on or before the time and date specified in the RFP Calendar of Events. **The City will not accept proposals via email or facsimile transmission.** The City reserves the right to reject or to deduct evaluation points for late proposals.

Proposals must be signed by an authorized official. If the official signs the Proposal Cover Sheet attached as Appendix A, this requirement will be met. Proposals must remain valid for 60 days or until a contract is fully executed.

Please submit one (1) paper copy of the Technical Submittal and one (1) paper copy of the Cost Submittal. The Cost Submittal should be in a separate sealed envelope. In addition, Bidders shall submit one copy of the entire proposal (Technical and Cost submittals, along with all requested documents) on flash drive in Microsoft Office-compatible or pdf format.

All materials submitted in response to this RFP will become property of the City and will become public record after the evaluation process is completed and an award decision made.

I-8.Small Diverse Business Information. The City encourages participation by minority, women, and veteran-owned businesses as prime contractors, and encourages all prime contractors to make a significant commitment to use minority, women, veteran-owned and other disadvantaged business entities as subcontractors and suppliers. A list of certified Disadvantaged Business Enterprises is maintained by the Minnesota Unified Certification Program at <http://mnuccp.metc.state.mn.us/> .

I-9. Award. The agreement award will be based on the time and materials submitted in the proposal, but will be a lump-sum, not-to-exceed agreement.

I-10. Term of Contract. The term of the contract will begin once the contract is fully executed and is anticipated to end by **March 31, 2025**. The selected Proposer shall not start the performance of any work nor shall the City be liable to pay the selected Proposer for any service or work performed or expenses incurred before the contract is executed.

I-11. Prompt Payment of Subconsultants. Per MN Statute 471.425, Subd. 4a., Each contract of a municipality must require the prime contractor to pay any subcontractor within ten days of the prime contractor's receipt of payment from the municipality for undisputed services provided by the subcontractor. The contract must require the prime contractor to pay interest of 1-1/2 percent per month or any part of a month to the subcontractor on any undisputed amount not paid on time to the subcontractor. The minimum monthly interest penalty payment for an unpaid balance of \$100 or more is \$10. For an unpaid balance of less than \$100, the prime contractor

shall pay the actual penalty due to the subcontractor. A subcontractor who prevails in a civil action to collect interest penalties from a prime contractor must be awarded its costs and disbursements, including attorney's fees, incurred in bringing the action.

I-12. Mandatory Disclosures. By submitting a proposal, each Bidder understands, represents, and acknowledges that:

1. Their proposal has been developed by the Bidder independently and has been submitted without collusion with and without agreement, understanding, or planned common course of action with any other vendor or suppliers of materials, supplies, equipment, or services described in the Request for Proposals, designed to limit independent bidding or competition, and that the contents of the proposal have not been communicated by the Bidder or its employees or agents to any person not an employee or agent of the Bidder.
2. There is no conflict of interest. A conflict of interest exists if a Bidder has any interest that would actually conflict, or has the appearance of conflicting, in any manner or degree with the performance of work on the project. If there are potential conflicts, identify the municipalities, developers, and other public or private entities with whom your company is currently, or have been, employed and which may be affected.
3. It is not currently under suspension or debarment by the State of Minnesota, any other state or the federal government.
4. The company is either organized under Minnesota law or has a Certificate of Authority from the Minnesota Secretary of State to do business in Minnesota, in accordance with the requirements in M.S. 303.03.

I-13. Notification of Selection. Bidders whose proposals are not selected will be notified in writing.

PART II - PROPOSAL REQUIREMENTS

II-1. Proposal Criteria and Structure. Proposals should include the following criteria and be structured accordingly:

1. Cover Letter (format provided in Appendix A)
2. Firm Information
 - A. Name of Firm/Discipline
 - B. Contact Information
 - C. Staff Size
3. Overview and description of the firm's total qualifications including any special or unique services it may provide.

4. Description of your firm's experience in completing work of this type including three (3) specific examples and project references (include reference name, phone number, and email, and links or copies of previously completed plans/projects). Projects that reflect the firm's national experience designing indoor *and* outdoor athletic facilities, and any past efforts to address athletics facilities at a system-wide level are desired.
5. Specific name and qualifications of the lead member of the project team who will be the primary contact and have full responsibility for the project. Complete qualifications must be submitted for other members of the project team, as well.
6. List whether or not your agency will be the sole consultant for the entire project. Include any sub-contractors who will be working with your firm on this project, their responsibilities, and a summary of applicable experience and qualifications.
7. Summary of your firm's understanding of the project including your firm's scope of services necessary to perform and fulfill the objectives and methods of how your firm plans to fulfill those objectives.
8. Proposed schedule for the project, including anticipated number and timing of meetings and community outreach with community members, City Council, Parks and Recreation Commission, Parks and Recreation staff, Indoor Athletics Venues Task Force, and other commissions and key stakeholder groups as needed.
9. Indicate if your company has a Diversity and Inclusion policy or program. If so, briefly describe the policy or program and how your company directly integrates this into your services.
10. Cost of your services. We will evaluate Technical Proposals first. Cost will be a factor after the Technical Evaluation is completed. Provide a lump sum, not-to-exceed total project cost including any sub-consultant fees, along with the following information:
 - A. Hours by task for each employee.
 - B. Identification of anticipated direct expenses.
 - C. Include miscellaneous charges, such as mileage and copies.
 - D. Identification of any assumptions made while developing the cost proposal.
 - E. Identification of any cost information related to additional services or tasks, include this in the cost proposal, but identify it as additional costs and do not make it part of the total project cost.
 - F. A work plan and detail on the scope of service and deliverables for an amount not to exceed xxx.

11. Responses to the following prompts in a narrative format:

- A. Proposers will need to be familiar with Duluth and the Duluth park system in order to provide comprehensive recommendations. If your team is already familiar with Duluth and the park system, please explain how. If your team is not familiar with Duluth and the park system, please explain how you intend to gain a deeper understanding.
- B. Proposers will need to have the technical capability to analyze and plan for reinvestments in existing *outdoor* athletic venues, as well as to plan for the reinvestment or new construction of multi-use *indoor* athletic venues. How will your proposal and team meet both of these specialized areas, without compromising one for the other?
- C. How does Duluth's cold-weather climate change your approach to both indoor and outdoor athletic venue planning? If possible, use previous project experience in cold-weather climates to support your response.
- D. Describe how you will approach producing accurate local market-based cost estimates, from pre-design through construction, for the investment recommendations that will come out of this Action Plan.
- E. Describe your experience developing operational models related to maintenance, staffing, fee structures, use patterns, etc. to inform facility operational cost and revenue projections, and to enhance efficiency and user experiences. If possible, include examples of both internal/self-maintained and operated facilities and third-party maintained and operated facilities.
- F. Describe your experience developing funding models that leverage private funding to create high-quality athletic venues. Examples may include development of sponsorship levels, private solicitations, local or national foundations, etc.
- G. Describe the approach and strategies you will use to incorporate sustainable site plans and to accommodate City and State energy efficiency standards (i.e. B3, and City OPR).

PART III - CRITERIA FOR SELECTION

III-1. Criteria for Selection. The proposals will be reviewed by a review panel comprised of City Staff and a representative from the Indoor Athletics Venues Task Force. The intent of the selection process is to review proposals and make an award based upon qualifications as described therein. A 100-point scale will be used to create

the final evaluation recommendations. The factors and weighting on which proposals will be judged are:

1. Firm and staff qualifications and project experience with comprehensive park planning and athletic facilities planning for both indoor and outdoor athletic venues of similar size and scope and in cold-weather climates (25%)
2. Effectiveness of proposed services and project understanding (25%)
3. Demonstration of local knowledge and ability to have primary consultant or sub-consultant staff present in Duluth (15%)
4. Demonstration of an effective community engagement process and ability to facilitate engagement events with diverse user groups (15%)
5. Timeline and previous demonstrated ability to stay on schedule (5%)
6. Cost to complete the project (15%)

The City reserves the right to approve or refuse subcontractors and/or subconsultants included in the Proposal.

PART IV – PROJECT DETAIL

IV-1. Overview. The City of Duluth is soliciting qualified professional consulting services for the development of an Athletic Venues Reinvestment Initiative (AVRI) Action Plan for thirteen existing outdoor athletic venues and one or two, new or renewed, indoor athletic venues. City funding for reinvestment will be sourced primarily from a local tourism tax that may only be spent on facilities that support “sports tourism.” Qualifying facilities are defined as athletic venues that already host or, if improved, would host athletic competitions that regularly draw numerous participants from outside the Duluth area.

For the purposes of this plan process, indoor athletic venues are defined as venues in which athletic games, matches, competitions etc. may take place inside of the venue itself. Outdoor athletic venues are defined as venues in which athletic games, matches, competitions, etc. may take place on an outdoor athletics amenity (outdoor field, rink, court, etc.). Some outdoor athletic venues may be located on the same site as a community center, field house, or other building type, which may enhance outdoor athletic activities by providing changing rooms, rest room facilities, concessions, storage, etc. However, because these community centers, field houses, and other building types do not allow for athletic activities to be conducted indoors, these buildings are not considered indoor athletic venues.

IV-2. Guiding Principles. The Action Plan should be guided by State law and prior City Council action, including the park system’s comprehensive plan, Essential Spaces: Duluth Parks, Recreation, Open Space and Trails Plan. The aims of AVRI are to:

1. Sustain and increase sports tourism (legal requirement)
2. Address deferred maintenance
3. Reduce routine maintenance burdens
4. Maximize multiple use opportunities
5. Invest equitably across western, central, and eastern Duluth
6. Lower barriers to athletic participation
7. Make better use of existing City, K-12, and higher ed athletic venues through improved interagency cooperation
8. Decrease City carbon emissions

IV-3. Planned Financial Investments. The Minnesota Legislature and the City Council have authorized a total of \$36 million of tourism tax funding for AVRI. It is anticipated that the funds will be expended over a period of ten years. City Council has allocated funding for both indoor and outdoor athletic venues.

For indoor athletic venues, the City anticipates investing \$2 million of AVRI funding to support the construction of sport court facilities within a future multi-purpose community center (Spirit Valley), which will be developed outside of this Action Plan. Additionally, the City plans to invest at least \$8 million of AVRI funding for investment in one or more new or renewed indoor athletic venues, the location(s) of which will be determined as part of this plan process. The City’s target for the new indoor venue(s) is to use its \$8 million investment to leverage an additional \$24 million (\$8 million from private contributions and \$16 million from the State of Minnesota) for a total indoor venue(s) project budget of \$32 million.

The remaining \$26 million of AVRI funding is intended for reinvestment in the following existing outdoor athletic venues:

- \$4.8 million will be invested in time-sensitive improvements to four facilities, *which will be completed in 2024 ahead of this Action Plan.*
- \$14.2 million to be invested in primary sports tourism sites in 2025 - 2026, including:
 - \$2 million at Wheeler Athletic Complex
 - \$2 million at Wade Stadium
 - \$4 million at Lake Park Fields Athletic Complex
 - \$2.2 million at Arlington Athletic Complex
 - \$2 million at Portman Park
 - \$2 million at Duluth Heights Park

- \$7 million to be invested in other potential sports tourism sites in 2029 and beyond, which may include investments at: Morgan Park, Piedmont Park, Woodland Park (including Fryberger Arena), Como Park (Glen Avon), Irving Park, Longview Tennis, and the Enger Park Golf Course clubhouse. Other locations may be considered if the necessary criterion is met. It is not clear how much, if any, additional funding may be available for each of these projects. The consultant's site-specific investment recommendations will need to be prioritized to reflect a range of possible investment levels.

IV-4. Planning Approach. Successful completion of this Action Plan will require a team with expertise in both indoor athletic venues and outdoor athletic venues, including experience related to venues located in cold-weather climates.

For indoor and outdoor venues, robust, inclusive community engagement will be essential to develop the right plan and cultivate community support. The City expects the consultant to engage with City staff, as well as the broader community, with a particular emphasis the nonprofit sports organizations that provide sports programming and coaching, and a significant portion of the routine maintenance at Duluth's athletic venues. Our staff and our nonprofit partners – and the volunteers, coaches, parents, and kids they represent – have indispensable insight on the community's athletic venue needs and how well our current facilities meet those needs.

Planning for investment in new or renewed *indoor* athletics venues will be undertaken with input from an appointed Indoor Athletics Venues Task Force – a 26-person body that will, with support from consultants and City staff, receive, review, and provide feedback on draft consultant deliverables and, ultimately, issue their own recommendations. A separate consultant has been selected to facilitate the Task Force process so that the consultant selected from this RFP process need only provide the deliverables specified here.

IV-5. Existing Documents and Data. The City of Duluth has compiled data pertaining to the condition and quality of athletic facilities, and has completed previous planning that will provide valuable background information for the selected firm, including:

- The City completed a comprehensive plan for the park system, Essential Spaces: Duluth Parks, Recreation, Open Space and Trails Plan, which included robust community engagement and a broad assessment of park conditions.
- The City maintains an Asset Management Inventory with facility assessments completed by CR-BPS.
- In summer 2023, CR-BPS completed a comprehensive facility & site asset management study of the Fryberger Arena, including updating of facility data (condition and age of facility and site systems) and cost estimates to bring the facility to a new condition.

IV-6. Primary Plan Components. The primary components needed out of an AVRI Action Plan, include:

1. **System-wide athletic venue needs analysis** inclusive of outdoor and indoor facilities. Tasks related to the athletic venue needs analysis include:
 - a. Solicitation, compilation, and analysis of annual sports venue use schedules from the City and key stakeholder groups;
 - b. A review and analysis of CR-BPS reports and other existing data resources;
 - c. Analysis and incorporation of input received as part of the community engagement process;
 - d. Documenting professional conclusions on the state of the system, pros/cons of existing assets, system gaps, and both individual and system-wide facility needs.

2. **Outdoor athletic venue reinvestment action plan** for existing outdoor, multi-use athletic venues throughout the system. Tasks related to the outdoor athletic venue reinvestment action plan include:
 - a. Apply conclusions from the needs analysis to develop recommendations for flexible and multi-use spaces to sites identified in section IV-3, including development of conceptual site plans for each location (which may include both athletic amenities and non-athletic amenities), and detailed specifications for reinvestment in each athletic amenity;
 - b. Prioritize investment recommendations and provide market-based cost estimates for recommended improvements at each site. Market-based cost estimates must include all project costs that the City will incur to implement each project, from pre-design through construction. Construction cost estimates should include a sufficient contingency and cost escalation factors in-line with current regional and market-based construction cost trends;
 - c. Provide best practices and recommendations related to operational models and fee structures.

3. **Indoor athletic venue reinvestment action plan** for one or two, new or renewed, multi-use indoor athletic venues. Tasks related to the indoor athletic venue needs analysis include:
 - a. Apply conclusions from the needs analysis and input from the Task Force to develop recommendations related to the number of new or renewed indoor venues, site selection/location, amenities at each location, site plan development, and artistic renderings;
 - b. Prioritize investment recommendations and provide market-based cost estimates for construction. Market-based cost estimates must include all project costs that the City will incur to implement each project, from pre-design through construction. Construction cost estimates should include a

sufficient contingency and cost escalation factors in-line with current regional and market-based construction cost trends;

- c. Provide best practices and recommendations on optimum public, private, and non-profit roles for financing new or renewed venues, including corporate sponsorship, City revenue bonding, state funding, and private giving.
 - d. Provide best practices and recommendations on operational models, programming opportunities, staffing needs, revenue opportunities, fee structures, annual operating costs, and a cost recovery plan, including detailed revenue projections.
4. **Community Engagement Summary** inclusive of documented community engagement efforts (including those identified in section IV-7) and a summary of input received from the community, City Council, Parks and Recreation Commission, Indoor Athletics Venues Task Force, and other commissions and stakeholder groups. Community engagement opportunities should include input from a diverse range of individuals. Diversity includes, but is not limited to, geographic, generational, racial, ethnic, socio-economic, and ability diversity.

IV-7. Deliverables. Deliverables of the AVRI Action Plan and planning process must include:

1. Development and facilitation of **community and stakeholder engagement opportunities** to gather public opinion regarding needs of existing athletic facilities and preferred future investments, and to share findings and recommendations. At a minimum, community engagement efforts should include:
 - A. A formal survey or online mapping tool for community input.
 - B. At least 6 focus group meetings (in person) with sport-specific stakeholders related to diamond fields, rectangular fields, rinks, multi-use courts, and with City of Duluth staff, and Task Force members. A list of Key Stakeholder Groups can be found below (see Part IV-8).
 - C. At least 6 community-wide input sessions/workshops (in-person) for site-specific outdoor athletics venue locations.
 - D. At least 3 community-wide input sessions/workshops related to new or renewed indoor athletic facilities.
 - E. At least 5 check-in meetings with the Indoor Athletics Venues Taskforce (in-person or virtual)
 - F. At least 4 formal presentations to various governing bodies (in-person)

All engagement related exhibits and documents must be compiled and delivered in editable format, to include format(s) that are sharable to the public and web-friendly.

2. Regular **communication** with City staff, including project leads from the Parks and Recreation division, Park Maintenance division, and the Property and Facilities Management division. Provide presentations to policy makers and formalized groups, including: City Council, Parks and Recreation Commission, Indoor Athletics Venues Task Force, and other commissions and stakeholder groups as needed.
3. **Maintain documentation** from all meetings, correspondences, site visits and workshops.
4. **Conduct research** pertaining to plan components and best practices for tourism-focused athletic facilities, maintenance and replacement schedules, financial and operational models, etc.
5. **Supply quality photos** of Duluth's athletic facilities and of the public engagement events for presentations, outreach materials, Draft Plan, and Final Plan.
6. Submit and present **Draft Plan** for Parks and Recreation Commission and the Athletics Venues Task Force for review, including the four plan components identified in section (IV-6), concept plans for key athletic facility sites, and other illustrations and figures.
7. **Develop, propose, and present plan amendments** based on feedback received on the Draft Plan – at least 2 rounds of review and edits.
8. Submit **Final Plan** to include, at a minimum, executive summary, introduction, planning process and findings, system-wide athletic venue needs analysis, an outdoor athletic venue reinvestment action plan and an indoor athletic venue reinvestment action plan, including final recommendations for each action plan, conceptual site plans for each indoor and outdoor venue location, at least two artistic renderings for the indoor venue(s), market-based cost estimates, financing tools, implementation tools and schedules, operations and maintenance recommendations, appendices, quality images, etc.
 - A. All parent files of graphics, photos, tables, maps and illustrations shall be provided to the City in digital format for future use.
 - B. Final Plan in editable format and in PDF with ADA compliant format.
9. Provide a **Final Plan Summary Deck** for formal presentation and public sharing.

IV-8. Resources.

- *Essential Spaces: Duluth Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Trails Plan:*
<https://duluthmn.gov/media/14188/10-10-22-essential-spaces-plan-for-council.pdf>

- *Athletic Venue Reinvestment Initiative webpage* (includes link to informational presentation):
<https://duluthmn.gov/parks/parks-planning/progress-in-the-parks/athletic-venue-reinvestment-initiative/>

- *St. Louis River Corridor Initiative* (previous initiative by City of Duluth funded by tourism-tax revenues): project information:
<https://duluthmn.gov/parks/parks-planning/st-louis-river-corridor/>

- *Enger Park Golf Course Plan:*
<https://duluthmn.gov/media/12707/enger-park-golf-course-renovation-plan-final.pdf>

- *List of Key Stakeholders* includes, but is not limited to:
 - Diamond Field Sports – Softball; Baseball
 - Arrowhead Fastpitch League
 - Duluth Girls Fastpitch
 - Duluth Huskies
 - Duluth Little League
 - Duluth Softball Players Association
 - Duluth Area Youth Softball Association (DAYSA)
 - Lake Park Baseball
 - West Duluth Legion Baseball
 - Western Little League

 - Rectangular Field Sports – Soccer; Lacrosse; Ultimate Frisbee; Football
 - Arrowhead Youth Soccer Association (AYSA)
 - Duluth Ultimate Community
 - Duluth Wolfpack Lacrosse
 - East Select Soccer
 - Gitchi Gummi Soccer Club

- Rink Sports – Hockey
 - Duluth Amateur Hockey Association (DAHA)
 - Duluth Heights Hockey Club
 - Glen Avon Hockey Club
 - Lower Chester / Congdon Hockey Club
 - Morgan Park Hockey Club
 - Piedmont Hockey Club
 - Portman Hockey Club
 - Woodland Hockey Club

- Court Sports – Basketball; Pickleball; Tennis
 - Duluth Amateur Youth Basketball Association (DAYBA)
 - Duluth Area Pickleball Association
 - Homeres Hoop Stars
 - Longview Tennis Club / Duluth Friends of Tennis
 - Northland Youth Basketball Alliance (Starks Academy)
 - Salvation Army Rookie Basketball Association

- Other Stakeholders
 - Bocce Ball League
 - College of St. Scholastica
 - Friends of Duluth Public Golf
 - Independent School District (ISD) 709
 - Northland Adaptive Recreation
 - University of Minnesota – Duluth

**APPENDIX A - PROPOSAL COVER SHEET
CITY OF DULUTH
RFP# 24-99342
ATHLETIC VENUES REINVESTMENT INITIATIVE ACTION PLAN**

Bidder Information:	
Bidder Name	
Mailing Address	
Contact Person	
Contact Person's Phone Number	
Contact Person's E-Mail Address	
Federal ID Number	
Authorized Signature	
Name & Title of Authorized Signer	
Email of Authorized Signer	