HISTORIC RESOURCES INVENTORY FOR THE EAST END RESIDENTIAL AREA-PHASE V DULUTH, SAINT LOUIS, MINNESOTA

Authorized and Sponsored by: City of Duluth Community Development 407 City Hall 411 West Fourth Street Duluth, MN 55802

Submitted by: Summit Envirosolutions, Inc. 1217 Bandana Boulevard North St. Paul, Minnesota 55108

> Principal Investigator: Andrew Schmidt, M.A.

Report Authors: Sara J. Nelson, Marjorie Pearson, Andrew Schmidt

October 2014

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Summit Envirosolutions, Inc. would like to thank the members of the Duluth Heritage Preservation Commission for the opportunity to work with them on this project: Ken Buehler, Kristi Johnson, Patricia Mullins, Thomas Vaughn, and David Woodward (Chair). Thank you to the Duluth Planning Department staff: Charles V. Froseth, Keith Hamre, and Ben VanTassel for their contributions to this project; as well as Maryanne Norton for her research assistance at the Duluth Public Library.

This historic resource survey report has been financed in part with Federal funds from the National Park Service, U.S. Department of the Interior. However, the contents and opinions expressed in this document do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the Department of the Interior, nor does the mention of trade names or commercial products constitute endorsement or recommendation by the Department of the Interior.

This program receives Federal financial assistance for identification and protection of historic properties. Under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, the U. S. Department of the Interior prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, color, national origin, or disability in its federally assisted programs. If you believe you have been discriminated against in any program, activity, or facility as described above, or if you desire further information, please write to: Office for Equal Opportunity, U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, 1849 C St., NW, Washington, D.C. 20240

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT LIST OF FIGURES INTRODUCTION RESEARCH DESIGN AND SURVEY METHODS	iii 1
OBJECTIVES METHODS	
Background Research Survey Evaluations	3
HISTORIC CONTEXTS	7
DEVELOPMENT OF DULUTH'S EAST END NEIGHBORHOOD RESIDENTIAL ARCHITECTURE OF THE STUDY AREA	
Single-Family Houses Multi-family Buildings	
ARCHITECTS OF THE STUDY AREA	14
SURVEY RESULTS	19
SUMMARY	19
Properties Currently Listed in the National Register Individual Properties Recommended for National Register Listing Properties Recommended for a Multiple Property Documentation Form Properties Recommended for Local Designation Properties Recommended Not Eligible for National Register or Local Designation Properties Demolished Since Being Inventoried	21 21 23 25
SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS REFERENCES CITED APPENDIX A: Surveyed Properties APPENDIX B: Survey Forms	29 32

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Project Location	2
Figure 2. East End Phase V Survey Results	20
Figure 3. East End Phase V Properties Recommended for a Multiple Property Documentation	tion
Form	24

INTRODUCTION

The East End Residential Area-Phase V project was initiated by the Duluth Heritage Preservation Commission (DHPC) in order to document the historic resources within the area of the East End closest to downtown, roughly bounded as follows: on the southwest, North Lake Avenue; on the southeast, East 2nd Street and East Superior Street; on the northeast, North 6th Avenue East; and on the northwest East 6th Street (Figure 1). The survey population consisted of 298 properties: 115 single-family residential, 62 multiple-family residences (includes duplexes, triplexes, and apartment buildings), seven mixed commercial-residential, 23 commercial properties, seven religious buildings, two schools, two hospitals and four medical offices, two fire stations, two clubhouses, and one of each of the following: gas station, motel, mortuary, former casket manufacturing plant, and recreational (YMCA) building.

This survey is the last of five surveys of the East End that were begun in 2006. The first four surveys, Phases I, II, III, and IV, were completed in 2007, 2009, and 2012 (III and IV). The surveys have documented historic buildings within the East End of the city and established a database of information on those buildings to assist the DHPC in developing strategies for preservation, to serve as a reference for the general public, to guide property owners in strategies that protect and preserve their neighborhoods, and to help the City Planning Division in administering the Unified Development Code and in implementing the Comprehensive Land Use Plan.

The project was financed through a grant from the United States Department of the Interior, administered through the Minnesota Historical Society, under the authority of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966. Matching funds were also received from the Community Development Block Grant Program of the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development.

Figure 1. Project Location

RESEARCH DESIGN AND SURVEY METHODS

OBJECTIVES

The objective of the historic resources survey was to identify individual properties and historic districts that have potential for designation as city landmarks and/or nomination to the National Register of Historic Places (National Register). An intensive field survey was conducted throughout the study area to document the properties that retain integrity and are eligible for National Register listing or local landmark designation. These properties consisted of mostly residential properties above East 3rd Street, and mostly commercial and institutional properties on East 2nd and East 1st streets. The St. Mary's Medical Center campus dominates the eastern and southern portions of the survey area. The survey area is roughly bounded by North Lake Avenue, East 2nd Street and East Superior Street, North 6th Avenue East, and East 6th Street.

METHODS

Background Research

Summit began by reviewing results of previous surveys and studies at the Duluth Community Development office and the survey files and Review and Compliance files at the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO). Two previous architectural history studies have included the current survey area. In 1974, the City of Duluth published *Duluth's Legacy: Volume 1 Architecture* which examined properties as part of the central area of the city.¹ A more comprehensive survey, *Duluth Historic Resources Survey Final Report*, was carried out by the St. Louis County Historical Society in 1984.² These studies identified properties within the current survey area that were historically significant or had notable architectural characteristics and classified them as Group I (significant and National Register eligible), Group II (some significance, may be eligible), or Group III (not eligible but worthy of preservation). These properties are discussed under Survey Results in this report.

Other secondary sources were reviewed, including: books and articles; previous cultural resources reports and National Register nominations; and existing Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) historic contexts. Those secondary sources were synthesized and summarized as they relate to the survey area. The review and refinement of the contexts identified the property types, based on significant events and themes, persons, and local architecture, to be targeted during the survey.

In addition, *Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps*, other historic maps, and aerial photographs aided in identifying early areas of development and concentrations of resources prior to fieldwork. The analysis was particularly useful for identifying areas for potential historic districts.

Survey

Before beginning the field survey, Summit received information from the City of Duluth on all properties within the study area. This included property identification numbers, addresses, and

¹ James Allen Scott, Duluth's Legacy: Volume 1 Architecture (Duluth: City of Duluth Department of Research and Planning, 1974).

² Lawrence J. Sommer, Duluth Historic Resources Survey Final Report (Duluth: St. Louis County Historical Society, 1984).

building dates. All properties that were at least fifty years old were identified as potential historic resources for assessment during the field survey. In addition, all previously inventoried properties that remained extant were identified for recording in the field survey.

Reports from previous studies and the related inventory data provided a starting point for the current survey. Previously surveyed properties were compared with the current list of properties to ensure that previous survey information was updated. Properties already locally designated as historic resources, listed in the National Register, or previously evaluated as eligible for local designation or National Register listing were inventoried in the field to update the status of their historic integrity.

During the field survey, a team of qualified architectural historians walked all streets to assess properties for historic integrity. Unless they had been previously inventoried, properties with alterations incompatible with their historic appearances were ruled out for consideration, and those properties were not recorded as part of the inventory. In cases where a building has lost a substantial amount of historic materials or a substantial addition has been constructed, its integrity was considered to be compromised, and it was deemed to have no potential to be listed or designated as a historic resource. For example, if windows and siding have been replaced with modern synthetic products, a building would have little or no potential to be eligible for local designation or National Register listing. Also if a building has had additions or removal of historically significant features, such as a prominent porch, it would have little or no potential to be eligible for local designation or National Register listing.

If a building retained most of its integrity, it was identified as having potential to be a historic resource (eligible for National Register listing or local designation as an individual property or contributing to a historic district). The properties identified as having some potential to be historic resources were inventoried on SHPO inventory forms. In addition, updated inventory forms were prepared for all previously inventoried properties even if the property had lost integrity. The surveyed, resurveyed, and National Register listed properties were documented with the following:

- At least two high-resolution digital photographs (400 dpi) showing the property. Due to the high density neighborhood, and numerous trees and shrubs located in front of structures, only one photo was possible for some of the properties.
- An Excel spreadsheet of each digital photograph completed; this was done in accordance with the SHPO *Guidelines for History/Architecture Projects in Minnesota*.
- Mapped location on a field map using a USGS map. Location of the properties will be marked with site numbers.

The main sources used to identify styles of the properties through the East End neighborhood were A Field Guide to American Houses and The Buildings of Main Street: A Guide to American Commercial Architecture.³

³ Virginia McAlester and Lee McAlester, *A Field Guide to American Houses* (New York: Knopf, 1989); Richard Longstreth, *The Buildings of Main Street: A Guide to American Commercial Architecture* (Washington, D.C.: The Preservation Press, 1987).

Evaluations

Additional research was completed for the individual properties with potential eligibility for listing in the National Register and for City historic landmark designation. This research included identifying original building configurations and uses from Sanborn maps; owners from city directories; and owners, architects/builders, and contractors from city building permits. Information from building permits was obtained by an intern and city staff with the City of Duluth. Original building permits were not available for all buildings, however, particularly for those constructed prior to about 1890. This information was supplemented by research in the Special Collections of the Duluth Public Library. This information was entered into the database for each property inventoried.

National Register. There are four National Register criteria of significance; a property must meet at least one of the criteria to be eligible for listing. The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association, and:

A. that are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history;

B. that are associated with the lives of significant persons in or past;

C. that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or

D. that have yielded or may be likely to yield, information important in history or prehistory.

City of Duluth. The City of Duluth has a separate set of criteria for designation of properties by the City as historic landmarks. A property is eligible for local designation if it:

A. has character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City of Duluth, State of Minnesota, or the United States;

B. is the location was a site of a significant historical event;

C. is identified with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the cultural development of the City of Duluth, State of Minnesota, or the United States;

D. embodies a distinguishing characteristic of an architectural type;

E. is identified as the work of an architect or master builder whose individual work has influenced the development of the City of Duluth or the State of Minnesota;

F. embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials, and craftsmanship which represent significant architectural innovation; or

5

G. has unique location or singular physical characteristics that represent an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the City as a whole.

Note: numerous properties within the survey area were not inventoried due to poor historic integrity or were recommended not eligible for listing in the National Register due to compromised historic integrity. If, in the future, any of those properties are rehabilitated to their historic appearance, they could be eligible for listing in the National Register if they also meet the criteria of significance.

HISTORIC CONTEXTS

The following sections provide relevant historic contexts for the architectural history properties inventoried during the survey. These contexts constitute research themes within which properties can be evaluated for National Register significance, and they are consistent with the statewide contexts "Urban Centers, 1870-1940;" "Railroads and Agricultural Development, 1870-1940;" "Northern Minnesota Lumbering, 1870-1930s;" and "Minnesota's Iron Ore Industry, 1880s-1945." These contexts have been extensively discussed in the document, "Duluth's Central Business District, 1872-1933."⁴ The contexts are also based on the previously developed Duluth contexts, "Neighborhoods, 1880-1940;" "Community Institutions, 1870-1940;" "Recreational Resources, 1880-1940;" and "Industry and Commerce, 1870-1940."⁵

DEVELOPMENT OF DULUTH'S EAST END NEIGHBORHOOD

The development of the East End Neighborhood extending northeast of North 6th Avenue East has been documented thoroughly in the four earlier phases of this survey.⁶ Information from those survey reports is used in the following discussion.

The city of Duluth is located at the west end of Lake Superior, the largest freshwater lake by area in the world. Its site, along the north shore of the lake, became part of a fur trade route and the site of trading posts beginning in the late eighteenth century. The Treaty of La Pointe with the Ojibwe Indians in 1854 opened the north shore to Euro-American settlement. A town called Duluth at the base of Minnesota Point on Superior Bay was platted in 1856 and incorporated in 1857. Ten other settlements were also platted along the north shore. Among them were Portland, located east of Duluth and platted in 1855 from North 2nd Avenue East to North 9th Avenue East up the hill to what is now Portland Square, and Endion, platted into "suburban" lots for "capitalists doing business in Superior." However, the financial panic of 1857 quickly halted further development.⁷

Twelve years later, Duluth's fortunes began to revive when financier Jay Cooke determined to make Duluth a major railroad and shipping hub. By July 1870, the population reached 3,500, Duluth received a city charter, and it had annexed Portland and Endion, along with several other neighboring towns. The streets of Portland were replatted so they would line up with those of Duluth to the west.⁸ Construction workers, railroad workers, businessmen, and lumbermen were all part of the influx to Duluth.⁹

⁴ Michael Koop and Chris Morris, Historic Resources of Duluth's Central Business District, 1872-1933, National Register of Historic Places Multiple Property Documentation Form, prepared for Minnesota Historical Society and National Register of Historic Places, 2006.

⁵ Nancy Eubank, The Zenith City of the Unsalted Sea: Duluth Historic Context Study, prepared for the Duluth Heritage Preservation Commission, 1991.

⁶ Debra Kellner, Intensive Survey of Historic Resources in Duluth's East End Neighborhood, prepared for the Duluth Heritage Preservation Commission, 2009; Larson Fisher Associates, Intensive Survey of Historic Resources in Duluth's East End Neighborhood, prepared for the Duluth Heritage Preservation Commission, August 2007.

⁷ Koop and Morris, E:2-3; Sommer, 12.

⁸ Koop and Morris, E:4; Sommer, 12, 16.

⁹ Koop and Morris, E:4, quoting WPA Guide, 106.

Also by 1870, Duluth gained rail connections to the south and to the west as well as the newly constructed ship canal which provided direct access between the lake and Duluth Harbor. Duluth's fortunes crashed in 1873 in the aftermath of the failure of Cooke's banks and the nationwide financial panic that followed. In 1874 the population of the city dropped from over 5,000 to 1,300. The population began to recover by the late 1870s, as more and more grain was shipped through Duluth's port. The port expanded rapidly during the 1880s, and by 1886, the Duluth harbor shipped over 22 million bushels of grain. The city and harbor were also served by eleven railroads.¹⁰

During the 1880s and 1890s, the population of Duluth grew rapidly, aided by railroad expansion and grain shipments. The population was estimated at 30,000 in 1887 and continued growing during the 1890s as lumber milling and shipping through the harbor expanded.¹¹ Duluth was ideally situated to take advantage of the lumber boom that harvested the northern pine forests. Lumber mills in Duluth and Superior cut logs and supplied building materials that were shipped out on the railroads or on booms towed by steam barges on Lake Superior. Productivity was measured by board feet of lumber, which reached a high point of 443 million board feet in 1902. The amounts gradually declined through the 1910s as the pine forests were logged out.¹²

Even as logging and the lumber industry declined, the city experienced another economic boom from the iron ore industry. Iron ore began to be mined in the Mesabi, Vermilion, and Cuyana ranges north and west of Duluth in the 1880s. Rail lines were constructed to haul the ore from the mines to Duluth for shipping to eastern ports for processing. By the early years of the twentieth century, millions of tons were being shipped. "The city's population had grown to 53,000, and the Duluth-Superior harbor rivaled the cities at the Ruhr-Rhine confluence in Germany as one of the largest freshwater ports in the world." The resultant prosperity was key to what has been characterized as Duluth's "golden age."¹³

A prosperous commercial downtown, prominent civic buildings, and a proposed "City Beautiful" plan were all manifestations of Duluth's golden age. The rapidly expanding population of Duluth needed places to live. Because of its geography Duluth became "a long and narrow city, clinging to the hillsides."¹⁴ James Allen Scott has characterized the situation in the early years:

People in the central downtown and hillside streets lived together with little regard for occupation or profession: large storeowners, successful manufacturers, brokers, wholesalers, small downtown shopkeepers, clerks and salesmen, school teachers, carpenters and contractors, and skilled workmen were mingled up Fifth Avenue West and along First, Second, and Third Streets... East Second Street, which ran up to the Heights, was lined with the homes of successful merchants.¹⁵

¹⁰ Koop and Morris, E:5-6.

¹¹ Koop and Morris, E:6.

¹² Koop and Morris, E:7-8.

¹³ Koop and Morris, E:9-10; WPA Guide, 107.

¹⁴ Eubank, 55. ¹⁵ Scott, 7-8.

Much of the residential area northeast of downtown was platted as the City of Duluth, Portland Division when the area was annexed by the City in 1870. While there was scattered development in the 1870s, residential construction only began in large numbers in the 1880s and 1890s. James Scott described the area and its residents:

The lower middle class – small shopkeepers, skilled artisans, better paid office and sales personnel – filled out the blocks along Third, Fourth, Fifth, Sixth, and Seventh Streets between Lake Avenue and Eight and Ninth Avenues East. Mixed in with them...were artisans whose work locations changed frequently or whose families depended on multiple employment which required a centrally located home near good crosstown transportation service. Houses – detached single family frame structures, two-family duplexes, three-deckers with one apartment per story and stores with apartments above them – filled in the narrow city lots. The commercial potential of land situated on main streetcar lines encouraged builders to construct apartments of multiple dwellings with stores on the first floor.¹⁶

By the 1870s and 1880s, the residential neighborhoods along 2^{nd} and 3^{rd} Streets East were expanding north towards 6^{th} Street East. Land values in the Central Hillside above the commercial district rose along with the population. As a result, multi-dwelling units that housed several families, and served as a source of income for the buildings' owners, were constructed in high numbers. The growing community was supported by the nearby hospitals, public institutions, and churches.

While residences dominated the area, it was also home to several important institutions. Portland School (nonextant), in the residential town of Portland, was built in 1866 on the lower side of East 1st Street between 3rd and 4th Avenues. Duluth's first school was built in 1856 on 42nd Avenue West. After the financial setbacks in the 1870s and annexation of surrounding towns, the city of Duluth began to construct public school buildings to serve the rapidly expanding population. Four of the early schools were in the central area of the city, including the Central School, at 15 East 2nd Street. The present building, which opened in 1892, was designed by Palmer, Hall and Hunt in an impressive Richardsonian Romanesque style.¹⁷

St. Mary's Hospital was founded in 1888 by the Benedictine Sisters of the diocese of Duluth. Upon outgrowing the property at 20th Avenue West and 3rd Street, the hospital relocated to a new building at 407 East 3rd Street. Several decades later, in 1934, the Miller Memorial Hospital opened at 504 East 2nd Street.

Many churches, as well as several synagogues, were located in the rapidly growing residential communities. First Presbyterian Church, 300 East 2nd Street, was built in 1890 and is within the survey area. St. Mark's African American Methodist Church circa 1913, 530 North 5th Avenue East is listed on the National Register of Historic Places. Other religious structures include the Calvary Baptist Church, 432 East 6th Street (circa 1900), Temple Adas Israel, 302 East 3rd Street (1901), Gloria Dei Lutheran Church, 219 North 6th Avenue East (1905), St. Mary Star of the Sea

¹⁶ Scott, 24.

¹⁷ Eubank, 43; Scott, 44.

Catholic Church, 325 East 3rd Street (1906), and St. Josephat Polish National Catholic Church, 417 North 3rd Avenue East (1908).

Social and recreational organizations also located in the area. The Duluth YMCA boys' department building was constructed at 2 East 2nd Street in 1916. The clubhouse of the Fraternal Order of the Owls has been located in a former house at 118 East 2nd Street since 1917.

Prior to the installation of the streetcar line, as Duluth recovered from the panic of 1873 and grew as a center for grain trade by 1881, the more wealthy merchants and professionals began to move east to establish private homes for themselves. The area roughly bounded by 3rd and 6th Avenues East and East 2nd and 4th Streets became known as Ashtabula Heights. Many of the neighborhood's residents came to Duluth from Ashtabula, Ohio to pursue industrial and professional endeavors. A social center in Duluth, it was from the "fine residences gracing this beautiful location [...] thence emanated all the laws and fashions, governing the social, moral, and political world."¹⁸ Among the many prominent residents to build here included:

Josiah and Rose Ensign (504 East 2nd Street), who came to Duluth from Ashtabula before the canal was dug. Ensign was elected mayor in 1880 and again in 1884, served as the St. Louis County Attorney, and spent thirty-two years as a district court judge. James Ray (403 East 2nd Street) and his son Robert (226 North 4th Avenue East) both built houses in the tony neighborhood in 1887. The Elder Ray, a native of Massachusetts, lived in Ashtabula before moving to Duluth in 1855. A founder of Portland Township, Ray was instrumental in the digging of the ship canal—which Ensign fought for in the courts during a seven-year legal battle with Wisconsin. Melvin Forbes (530 East 2nd Street) also built a home in Ashtabula Heights that, like many surrounding it, was designed by Oliver Traphagen.¹⁹

The city's wealthy did not settle in Ashtabula Heights for very long. Residential movement out of the central area was aided by a mule-pulled streetcar line that was installed in 1882 along Superior Street between Fifth Avenue West and Third Avenue East. In 1887 the streetcar was expanded as far east as 22nd Avenue East. In 1890 a new line extended along East Second Street to Sixth Avenue East, then north along Sixth Avenue East and east on East Fourth Street as far as 14th Avenue East. All the streetcar lines were electrified that same year. Duluth's business elite began moving east of 13th Avenue East and building large houses along Superior, First, and Second Streets.²⁰ Chester Creek, which flowed into Lake Superior between 13th Avenue East and 14th Avenue East, also formed a boundary between neighborhoods.

As the business elite and growing middle class moved further east, the substantial homes above the downtown hillside were converted to rental units for members of the working class. Maintenance and upkeep of the stately structures was cost prohibitive and "over the years they lost their architectural integrity and many became all but [un]inhabitable."²¹ The hospitals that

¹⁸ Van Brunt, 236.

¹⁹ Ibid

²⁰ Scott, 24; Eubank, 57.

²¹ Dierckins, Tony. *Lost Landmark: Ashtabula Heights*. Zenith City Online, 2012. <u>http://zenithcity.com/lost-landmark-ashtabula-heights/</u>

had been constructed to serve the community established during the late 19th century continued to expand during the 20th century, and most of the once-stately residences were demolished. St. Mary's grew along the entire block between East North 4th Avenue East and North 5th Avenue East and throughout the immediate community.²² Miller Memorial was renamed Miller-Dwan Hospital in 1971 after a 1968 \$2.4 million endowment from Mary C. Dwan. The gift spurred the hospital's growth along East 1st and 2nd Streets between North 4th and 6th Avenues East. Since 2001, the two hospitals have operated under the same ownership; the complexes and intermediate buildings are connected via a system of skyways. Today, the Essentia Health-Duluth campus encompasses roughly eight city blocks between East 1st and 5th Streets.

The Central Hillside underwent further changes during the 1960s and 1970s. The grand homes of Ensign, Ray, and Forbes in Ashtabula Heights were all demolished by 1966 for the hospitals. Many other residences were demolished to provide space for higher-density multi-family residences. St. Ann's Senior Living Apartments at 330 East 3rd Street (1963) continues to serve its original purpose as an assisted living residence for senior citizens. It was established by the Catholic diocese of Duluth but today is operated by an independent, nondenominational board. The Traphagen-designed Queen Anne house that stood on the property was built in 1890 for the Markell family. They moved to 2215 East 1st Street in 1907 and sold it to Robert and Sophia Whiteside. The Whiteside family sold the property to the Duluth diocese in 1961 when it was demolished to make way for St. Ann's.²³ Federal programs including the Housing and Urban Development Act in 1965 and the Congregate Housing Services Program in 1978 provided the Duluth Housing and Redevelopment Authority (HRA) the funding to construct high-density housing for low-income senior citizens. Grandview Manor, 301 East 2nd Street (1962), Tri-Towers, 222 N. 2nd Avenue (1972), and King Manor Apartments, 222 East 2nd Street (1978) were constructed for low-income senior housing, and continue to be operated by the Duluth HRA. The land encompassed by the Tri-Towers structure and parking lot was once occupied by nine single-family residences (four of which were converted to flats by 1950), five multi-family flats, and a church.

RESIDENTIAL ARCHITECTURE OF THE STUDY AREA

The residential architecture of the area reflects geographic constraints combined with patterns of rapid population growth, particularly in the last decade of the nineteenth century and the first decade of the twentieth century. As Nancy Eubank has commented:

Building houses on the hillside was not an easy undertaking. The slopes were quite steep in some places and the rock had to be blasted and elaborate stone retaining walls constructed. Nevertheless, the streets above Superior Street soon boasted a number of imaginatively carved latticed, gabled, and turreted frame houses of the well-to-do, along with the smaller but still comfortable residences of downtown shopkeepers, clerks, salesmen, contractors, and some skilled workers.²⁴

²² Eubank, 45; Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, 1909, vol. 2, sheet 180.

 ²³ Dierckins, Tony and Maryanne Norton. *Lost Duluth: Landmarks, Industries, Buildings, Homes, and the Neighborhoods in Which They Stood.* Duluth: Zenith City Press, 2012.
 ²⁴ Eubank, 57.

Single-Family Houses

The earliest residential development in the area was almost all freestanding single-family houses, as reflected in the 1888 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. It depicts an area partially developed with scattered houses between North Lake Avenue and 6th Avenue East from East 2nd Street to East 5th Street. By the time the 1909 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map was published, freestanding single-and multi-family residences had been constructed throughout the area. As development moved up the hill beyond East 5th Street, many of these houses were built on smaller lots and have smaller footprints. Some of the earlier, larger houses close to downtown were built for individual well-to-do owner-residents, and the area became known as Ashtabula Heights. These were the businessmen and industrialists that later moved farther out into the East End. However, it appears that many of the smaller, later houses were built by developers, contractors, and real estate investors, either for sale or rental to working-class residents.

The forms and styles of single-family houses are characteristic of popular types during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries seen throughout Minnesota communities. These include the Queen Anne, Stick Style, and Colonial Revival. Some of the larger, more distinguished examples were designed by Duluth architects. The majority follow vernacular examples based on plan shapes and roof forms, such as front-gable-form, intersecting gable form, and Foursquare.²⁵ Most of the single-family houses are frame construction, originally with wood clapboard and/or wood shingle siding, wood ornamental detail, and an open wood porch with ornamental columns or posts. Some have brick walls or brick facing over frame construction. Because of Duluth's geography and the availability of local bluestone (gabbro), they are often set on stone basements or foundations. Wood siding and ornament have been susceptible to deterioration and change over the years. It is unusual to find largely unaltered examples in the study area.

From the 1930s onward, many single-family houses were converted to duplexes with two dwelling units or apartments. Some became rooming houses or boarding houses.

Multi-family Buildings

Multi-family residential buildings of a variety of types are found throughout the area. Duluth was a rapidly growing community with limitations on space to build, so it was advantageous to construct multi-family dwellings.

Double Houses and Duplexes

Double houses and duplexes are located throughout the study area. Some of the earliest date from the 1880s, but most were constructed between 1890 and 1910. Both are buildings that were designed with two dwelling units, either side-by-side or on different floors. This study differentiates them by characteristics of form and plan.

Double houses are similar in form and stylistic characteristics to single-family houses, although they may occupy a larger footprint or the two units may be set side-by-side and may be mirror images. Like the single-family houses, they are often frame construction with wood siding and set on stone basements or foundations. Some are clad with brick. Each unit has its own doorway.

²⁵ Sommer, 35-36, characterizes these as the "Homestead" and "American Foursquare" styles.

The double house has an open porch extending across the front that is often carried up to the second story. The double house has a gabled or hipped roof, which reinforces the similarity to single-family houses.

Duplexes are similar in form to the larger row flats. They are two-story flat-roofed structures, usually of brick set on stone basements or foundations. The brick façade rises to a parapet, often with a decorative brick frieze or cornice. Each floor has a dwelling unit, and each unit has its own doorway. The building is fronted by an open porch, usually carried up to the second story.

Like the single-family houses, some double houses and duplexes were converted into more than two dwelling units from the 1930s onward.

Row Flats

What this study calls row flats, have been broadly identified as apartment buildings in the 1984 historic resources survey. "Flats" is the term used on Sanborn Fire Insurance maps to identify multi-family dwellings. These buildings, on their exteriors, look like the rowhouses found in many urban areas throughout the United States, especially where land was expensive and geography limited development.²⁶ Although more common elsewhere, the concentration of row flats in Duluth may be unique in Minnesota cities. One group appears on the 1888 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. Like the duplexes, most were constructed during the decades preceding and following the turn of the century. In the study area, each group of row flats has a consistent design, organized in three to six units, as seen on the facades. The buildings are of brick and set on stone basements or foundations. They are usually two stories above a basement whose height is partially dependent on the terrain. Sometimes the facades of the units are identical throughout the group. In other cases, the façades are differentiated within an overall pattern. Like the duplexes, the row flats have flat roofs. The façades rise to a continuous brick parapet, usually with a cornice or decorative frieze. Windows at the second story usually have an ornamental treatment. Each unit has its own doorway. Open porches extend across fronts of the units; often they are continuous for a group, although sometimes the units have their own porches.

Apartment Buildings

What this study calls apartment buildings have been categorized as apartment buildings in the 1984 historic resources survey. "Flats" is the term used on Sanborn Fire Insurance maps to identify multi-family dwellings. Apartments are larger in height, scale, and footprint than the row flats. Most were constructed in the 1890s and 1900s and located on the streets between North 1st and 2nd Avenues East. Typically they are brick buildings, two or three stories in height, with a single entrance. The façades are often ornamented and rise to parapets above cornices and decorative friezes. They often display elements of the Romanesque Revival, Neo-Classical Revival, or Georgian Revival styles.

The survey area underwent a significant amount of redevelopment during the 1960s and 1970s. Several apartment buildings were constructed that served as public or subsidized housing for seniors. All of these apartment buildings were constructed in a Modern style on a larger scale

²⁶ Philip Kent Wagner, "The Historical Geography of Apartment Housing in Minneapolis, Minnesota, 1870 to 1930" (Ph.D. diss., University of Minnesota, 1991), 145-145, discusses row flats as a type of apartment building.

than the predecessors constructed around the turn of the century. They range from two to 15 stories tall.

ARCHITECTS OF THE STUDY AREA

A number of notable Duluth architects have designed buildings in the study area. Information about many of them has been compiled in the previous East End studies. Other architects and builders have not been previously documented. The names were gathered from an examination of city building permit records, which are often written by hand and can be difficult to interpret. To the extent possible, names have been checked against listings in Duluth city directories.

Bray, William E. (Bray & Nystrom) (1868-1959)

William Bray began his architectural career in the early 1890s as a draftsman for Traphagen and Fitzpatrick. In 1896, Bray formed a partnership with John Wangenstein, which lasted until 1898. Bray partnered with Carl Wirth for a short time, then I. Vernon Hill during 1902-1904. Bray then formed a partnership with Carl Nystrom in 1905.²⁷ During this time, Bray designed at least one building in the survey area: St. Mary's Star of the Sea Catholic Church at 325 East 3rd Street (1907). Bray was responsible for a number of architecturally outstanding houses in the East End, both alone and in partnership with Nystrom (together they designed at least 25 residential buildings in Duluth). Bray also designed commercial buildings in downtown Duluth including the Commercial Club (1909) at 402 West First Street; the Christie Building (demolished); and a building located at 23-25 E. Superior Street (1912, demolished). Bray also designed many public schools on the Iron Range, including Hibbing High School.²⁸ A brief obituary in 1959 documents his retirement and subsequent move to California:

Former Duluth Architect Dies. William T. Bray, 91, retired Duluth architect who designed many schools on the Iron Range, died last Thursday at his home in Beverly Hills, Calif. He designed and supervised construction of schools throughout the Range while practicing here from 1897 to 1925. Largest of the schools he worked on is the Hibbing high school, erected between 1919-21. Mr. Bray was born in New York. He retired in 1925 and moved from Duluth to California in 1937.²⁹

Fitzpatrick, Francis (Fitzpatrick & Traphagen) (1863-1931)

Fitzpatrick was born in 1863 in Montreal, Quebec. He was working in moved to Minneapolis in 1884 and in that same year began work with Leroy Buffinton as a draftsman. In 1887, Fitzpatrick entered the office of George and Fremont Orff, where he worked for three years. He moved to Duluth in 1890, and entered a partnership with Oliver Traphagan for six years. During this time, they designed over 30 commercial and residential buildings in Duluth. In the survey area, the team designed First Presbyterian Church, 300 E 2nd Street (1890) and Fire Station No. 1 & Annex, 101 E 3rd Street (1889), both of which are listed in the National Register of Historic Places. Fitzpatrick moved to Washington, D.C. in 1896 to work as a foreman in the Office of the

²⁷ Lathrop, Alan K. <u>Minnesota Architects: A Biographical Dictionary</u>. (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press 2010) 27.

²⁸ Koop and Morris, F:3-4.

²⁹ Duluth News Tribune, 3 April 1959.

Supervising Architect of the Treasury. In 1903, Fitzpatrick had his own practice and in 1918, he became head of the architectural department of the Bankers Realty Investment Company in Omaha, Nebraska. By the 1920s, he was residing in Evanston, Illinois, it is unclear if he was practicing architecture or retired by this time. He died in 1931.³⁰

German, Frederick (German & Lignell) (1863-1937)

Architect Frederick German was a Canadian who came to Duluth in 1890 via New York, where he had worked for McKim, Mead & White. He first partnered for a year with Robert L. Young, then with John de Waard in the 1890s. In 1905, German entered into partnership with A. Werner Lignell. This partnership was responsible for many important buildings in Duluth as well as several residences in the East End. In the survey area, German & Lignell designed the New York Flats at 319 E. 1st Street (1905) and Nettleton Elementary School at 108 E. 6th Street (1906). From 1913 to about 1928 German partnered with Leif Jenssen.³¹ The firm designed the Ward Ames Building at 2 E. 2nd Street (1916).

German's 1937 obituary describes his many architectural contributions to the community:

F. G. German Came Here in 1892 PIONEER DIES. Prominent Architect Was Designer of Many Buildings. Stricken with a heart attack as he returned from a walk, F. G. German, widely known Duluth architect, died yesterday afternoon at the home of a son, George B. German, 4631 Jay Street. He was 73 years old. Born Nov. 9, 1863, at Bath, Ont., he attended the University of Toronto and later worked in New York architects' offices before settling here in 1892. Among organizations of which Mr. German was a member at the time of his death were the state board of registration for architects, to which he was appointed by Governor J. A. O. Preus at its inception in 1921; the Duluth city planning commission, on which he had also served continuously, and the American Institute of Architects. Mr. German gained recognition throughout this area for his work in designing numerous public buildings, churches and offices. Among those in Duluth for which he drew plans were the Central YMCA and YWCA, the boys' Y, the Pilgrim Congregational church, the Glen Avon Presbyterian church, St. Anthony's Catholic church, the Bradley Building, the new Marshall-Wells building and many large homes. He designed as well the new Virginia Memorial Recreation building and city hall, the Chisholm junior high school and the Green Bay post office.³²

Lignell, Anton Werner (German & Lignell) (1867-1954)

Anton Lignell's partnership with Frederick German is described above. According to Lignell's obituary, "Anton Werner Lignell was born in Aland, Sweden. He immigrated to Butte, Montana in 1888, where he designed the Anaconda Copper Mining Company Employees Club. He moved to Duluth in 1903 and by 1905 had formed an architectural partnership with Frederick German, which lasted until 1912."³³ Buildings designed by German and Lignell in the survey area during

³⁰ Koop and Morris, F:4.

³¹ Koop and Morris, F:5.

³² Duluth Herald, 14, October 1937.

³³ From Larson Fisher Associates, 62.

their partnership include the New York Flats at 319 East 1^{st} Street (1905) and Nettleton Elementary School (1906). Lignell died at age 85 in 1954 in Oahu, Hawai'i, where he had been living with his daughter for the last five years of his life.³⁴

Nystrom, Carl E. (Bray & Nystrom) (1867-1944)

Carl Nystrom was born in Sweden and immigrated to Ashland, Wisconsin in 1889 and then to Ironwood, Michigan. In the early 1890s he moved to Duluth, and after a brief move to Calumet, Michigan during the Panic of 1893, Nystrom returned to Duluth and partnered with Frank L. Young until 1905. After this date Nystrom became a partner of William T. Bray from 1906 to 1915. After Bray & Nystrom dissolved their partnership, Nystrom opened his own office in the Palladio Building in downtown Duluth. Nystrom died in 1944 at age 76.³⁵ Buildings within the survey are that were designed by Nystrom, either in partnership or on his own, include:

- 308-310 East 5th Street (1891)
- Gloria Dei Lutheran Church (First Swedish Lutheran), 219 N. 6th Avenue E. (1906)
- St. Josephat Polish National Church, 417 N 3rd Ave E (1908)
- Western Casket Company, 127 East 2nd Street (1922)
- J.L. Crawford & Son Mortuary, 131 East 2nd Street (1923)

Palmer, Hall & Hunt Emmet S. Palmer (1847-1935) Lucien Hall (1854-1933) William A. Hunt (1859-1930)

Emmet S. Palmer was born in La Porte, Indiana in 1847 and little else is known of his early career and subsequent move to Minnesota. After working in Duluth as a carpenter during the late 1880s, Palmer started an architecture practice with Lucien Hall in 1890.³⁶ Hall was born in New York State in 1855.³⁷ Nothing is known about Hall's early career and training prior to forming Palmer & Hall in 1890. William Hunt was born in 1859 in Ohio. Hunt apprenticed under Charles Cropsey in Cincinnati, Ohio before moving to Minneapolis in 1885. When Palmer and Hall formed their partnership, they hired Hunt to run their office, and two years later, Hunt became a partner.³⁸ Hall left the firm in 1904 to retire to Bay Lake, and by 1906, Palmer also left the firm.³⁹ Hunt remained in practice in Duluth until he moved to California in 1928. The firm of Palmer, Hall & Hunt was very successful in Duluth during the 1890s. The firm designed the NRHP-listed Central High School at 15 E. 2nd Street (1892).

Radcliffe, Edwin S. (1851-1925)

Edwin Radcliffe was born June 2, 1851 in Elmira, New York. The family moved first to Indiana then to Minneapolis. His father, Abraham Maby Radcliffe, was a master builder/architect whose

³⁴ Duluth News Tribune, 11 February1954.

³⁵ Henry A. Castle, <u>Minnesota: Its Story and Biography</u> (Chicago: Lewis Publishing Co., 1915) p1365; <u>Duluth</u> <u>Herald</u>, 8-3-1944.

³⁶ Lathrop, 168.

³⁷ Ibid., 89.

³⁸ Larson Fisher Associates, 60.

³⁹ Ibid., 89

offices (first in Minneapolis, then St. Paul) served as training ground for some of the Twin Cities' most notable architects.⁴⁰ Son Edwin attended Minneapolis public schools, then the University of Minnesota from 1869-72. He received subsequent technical education at the Art Institute in New York City in 1874. From 1875 to 1886 Radcliffe worked as draftsman in his father's St. Paul office, succeeding his father in the last year as head architect. He continued there until 1889 when he moved to Duluth and formed a partnership with Charles McMillan that continued until 1893.

After the partnership with McMillan dissolved, Radcliffe then partnered with Charles E. Willoughby as Radcliffe & Willoughby until 1900. He practiced alone from 1901 through 1906, after which he partnered with Vernon J Price under firm name of Radcliffe & Price until 1910. Radcliffe then practiced alone until he died in 1925.⁴¹ An individual design by Radcliffe within the survey area is St. Mark's African American Methodist Church at 530 Fifth Avenue East.

Terryberry, Austin (1853-1922)

Terryberry was born in Canada in 1853 and arrived in Duluth in 1887. Little is known regarding Terryberry, his early life or training. However, he was responsible for a number of significant buildings in Duluth including the Crane Building at 18th Avenue W. and Superior Street, and residences including townhouses at 1514-18 and 1610-12 E. Superior Street.⁴² Terryberry designed at least one building within the current survey area, the flats at 322 East 5th Street. It appears in city directories that he worked independently and did not partner with another architect.

Traphagen, Oliver (Fitzpatrick & Traphagen) (1854-1932)

Traphagen was born in Tarrytown, New York in 1854. His career started in Saint Paul as an apprentice to George Wirth. In 1882, Traphagen relocated to Duluth and worked as a carpenter and architect. In 1890, he became a partner with Francis Fitzpatrick.⁴³ The firm designed prominent buildings in Duluth, including the Board of Trade and First Presbyterian Church. They designed fire station at 101 East 3rd Street, listed in the NRHP and in the survey area. In addition to civic and commercial buildings, they designed the Dr. William Magie House at 1401 East Superior Street and Traphagan's own house at 1509-1511 East Superior Street in the Phase III survey area. In this survey area, Traphagen designed Salter Terrace (Bay View Flats) at 301-307 E. 3rd Street (1887). The partnership ended in 1896 when Fitzpatrick moved to Washington, D.C. Traphagen lived in Duluth another two years until he moved to Honolulu, Hawai'i because of illness in the family. In Honolulu he continued a successful career, including design of the Moana Beach Club in 1901 (one of the first tourist hotels on Waikiki Beach). Traphagan eventually moved to Alameda, California where he retired in 1925 and later died in 1932.⁴⁴

⁴⁰ Millett, 45.

⁴¹ Lathrop, 178

⁴² From Larson Fisher Associates. Accessed online: <u>http://zenithcity.com/zenith-city-history-</u> archives/biography/terryberry-austin/

⁴³ Ibid, 214.

⁴⁴ Ibid., 214.

Waddell, John T. (Waddell & Willoughby) (1851-?)

Little is known of J.T. Waddell. He was born in 1851, a native of Pennsylvania, and started practicing architecture in Duluth in 1880. In 1888, he formed the architectural firm Waddell & Clarke with William P. Clarke. After practicing for two years, Waddell then joined Charles E. Willoughby to form Waddell & Willoughby.⁴⁵ Waddell designed the Row Flats at 113-119 E. 3rd Street (1891). Waddell moved to Cleveland, Ohio in 1899. Willoughby practiced with Edwin Radcliffe until moving to Pennsylvania in 1902.

Wangenstein, John J. (1858-1942)

Wangenstein was born in Valdres, Norway and studied in Trondheim before immigrating to St. Paul in 1878 and then moving to Duluth in 1883. He had a prolific career designing numerous commercial, residential, and religious buildings in Duluth and across St. Louis County, beginning in the late nineteenth century and extending into the 1930s. From 1892 to about 1895 Wangenstein worked in partnership with William E. Baillie, establishing the firm of Wangenstein and Baillie. He also partnered with Olaf Roen and Ephraim Giliuson at various times. Wangenstein & Roen designed the Ingalls Flats at 214-216 East 4th Street (1891) in the survey area. The C.A. Erickson Flats, 30-34 E. 5th Street (1905) were designed by Wangenstein. Beginning in 1913, Wangenstein was the local architect for the St. Louis County Courthouse, in association with Daniel H. Burnham of Chicago. Prominent buildings in Duluth designed by Wangenstein include the Wolvin Building (1901) at 225-231 W. 1st St.; the Masonic Temple (1904) at 4 W. 2nd St.; and the DeWitt-Seitz Building (1911) in Canal Park along with numerous other commercial buildings throughout the downtown.

Willoughby, Charles E. (Waddell & Willoughby; Radcliffe & Willoughby)

Willoughby was born in England and was a draftsman for McKim, Mead & White in New York. He joined J.T. Waddell to form Waddell & Willoughby during the 1890s.⁴⁶ Willoughby partnered with Edwin Radcliffe between 1897 and 1900.⁴⁷ He practiced independently for a year before moving to Pennsylvania in 1902.

⁴⁵ Phoenix Publishing Company. Pen and Sunlight Sketches of Duluth, Superior and Ashland: Their Wonderful Development, Resources, Commerce, Manufactures, Financial Interests, Public Institutions and Prospects. Phoenix Publishing Company, 1892: 70.

⁴⁶ Phoenix Publishing Company, 70.

⁴⁷ Larson Fisher Associates, 72.

SURVEY RESULTS

SUMMARY

Andrew Schmidt served as Principal Investigator, assisted by Marjorie Pearson and Sara Nelson in the field. Fieldwork was conducted April 2 and 3, 2014. During the survey, all buildings, structures, and objects within the survey area that were 50 years in age or older and retained historic integrity were recorded. Previously surveyed properties were surveyed again to document current status, regardless of integrity. The survey population consisted of 227 properties: 113 single-family residential, 62 multiple-family residences (includes duplexes, triplexes, and apartment buildings), seven mixed commercial-residential, 23 commercial properties, seven religious buildings, two schools, two hospitals and four medical offices, two fire stations, two clubhouses, and one of each of the following: gas station, motel, mortuary, former casket manufacturing plant, and recreational (YMCA) building (Figure 2; Appendix A). Within the survey area, 78 of the previously inventoried properties are still standing but 31 others have been demolished. Recorded buildings range in time-period from 1871 to 1978.

The 1984 survey effort included 65 properties that were categorized at that time into four groups. Four properties in the survey area were categorized under Group I, defined as: "exceptional landmark structures of such irreplaceable value that they should be protected and preserved at almost any cost. These structures are of such significance that they already are on, or certainly meet, the criteria for listing in the National Register of Historic Places." An additional 26 properties were placed in Group II, which was defined as: "a generally important site or structure that contributes significantly to the visual and cultural heritage of Duluth and qualifies for listing in the NRHP." Group III included 26 properties, which were defined as: "a structure that contributes to the overall character of Duluth and worthy of preservation whenever feasible." Nine properties were placed in Group IV, which was defined as: "a structure of little, if any, historical, architectural, or related cultural significance." The properties have been reviewed as part of the current survey effort and determined whether they are eligible for listing in the National Register, would contribute to a National Register of Historic Places Multiple Property Documentation Form, are eligible for local designation, or are not eligible for either National Register listing or local designation.

Properties were considered for individual eligibility as well as their potential to contribute to a historic district. No potential historic districts were identified within the Phase V survey area. Many of the properties within the survey area have been altered to such an extent that they no long convey their historic characteristics and therefore do not retain historic integrity. As a result, there are no discrete areas within the survey area that contain a sufficient concentration of properties retaining historic integrity that could contribute to a historic district. As described below, however, multiple-family residential properties could be further studied and nominated for listing in the National Register through a Multiple Property Documentation Form or for designation as city historic landmarks through a local-level equivalent document.

Narrative write-ups for the surveyed properties are in Appendix A and are arranged by address. Each entry includes a description, brief historical information, assessment of significance, and one or more photographs. Figure 2. East End Phase V Survey Results

Properties Currently Listed in the National Register

Field #	House #	Street	Property Name
13	15	E. 2 nd Street	Duluth Central High School
30	101	E. 3 rd Street	Fire House Number One
224	530	N. 5 th Ave E.	St. Mark's African Methodist Episcopal Church

Four properties within the survey area are currently listed in the National Register:

Individual Properties Recommended for National Register Listing

The following properties within the survey area are recommended as eligible for listing in the National Register. A description and evaluation of eligibility is provided for each building in Appendix A. All properties recommended as National Register eligible are also recommended as eligible for historic landmark designation by the City.

Field #	House #	Street	Property Name	
11	2	E. 2 nd Street	Ward Ames Building	
14	22	E. 2 nd Street	Fire Hall Number One	
20	131	E. 2 nd Street	Crawford Funeral Chapel & Mortuary	
45, 46	227-231	E. 3 rd Street	Institute of the Sacred Heart / St. Mary's School of Nursing	
47	301-307	E. 3 rd Street	Salter Terrace / Bay View Flats	
49	325	E. 3 rd Street St. Mary Star of the Sea Catholic Church		
54	503	E. 3 rd Street 5 th Avenue Apartments ⁴⁸		
74	230	E. 4 th Street	cet Charles H. and Elizabeth Arthur House	
204	417	N. 3 rd Ave E.	St. Josephat Polish National Catholic Church	

Properties Recommended for a Multiple Property Documentation Form

There are many multiple-family residential buildings in the survey area, some of which were identified in the 1984 survey and placed into Group II or Group III. Some buildings retain more integrity than others, but as a group the buildings are a significant and distinguishable entity that is associated with Duluth's rapid growth during the 1890s through 1920s. As discussed in the historic contexts, multiple-family residences were a means of providing housing for the growing population and their construction was concentrated in the current survey area (as well as the Phase III and IV survey areas) due to its proximity to downtown. Some of the buildings were

⁴⁸ This property could also be nominated using a Multiple Property Documentation Form.

designed by local Duluth architects that had prolific careers locally and farther afield. A total of 43 multi-family residences appear to be eligible and could be nominated using a National Register Multiple Property Documentation Form or a local-level equivalent documentation. It should be noted that, because these are income-producing properties, if listed, they would be eligible for federal and state historic preservation tax credits.

Field #	Address	Property Name	Property Type
5	317 E. 1 ST Street		Duplex
6	319 E. 1 ST Street	New York Flats	Row Flat
7	323 E. 1 ST Street		Duplex
12	10-12 E. 2 ND Street	Chatham Flats	Apartment
31	113-115 E. 3 RD Street	(113-115, 117-119)	Row Flat
32	114-116 E. 3 RD Street	(114-116, 118-120, 122-124)	Row Flat
33	117 E. 3 RD Street	(113-115, 117-119)	Row Flat
34	118-120 E. 3 RD Street	(114-116, 118-120, 122-124)	Row Flat
35	119 E. 3 RD Street	(113, 115, 117, 119)	Row Flat
36	121-123 E. 3 RD Street	Evered Flats	Row Flat
37	122-124 E. 3 RD Street	(114-116, 118-120, 122-124)	Row Flat
38	125 E. 3 RD Street		Double House
40	201-203 E. 3 RD Street	Kehtel Flats	Duplex
42	209-211 E. 3 RD Street		Row Flat
47	301-307 E. 3 RD Street	Salter Terrace (Bay View Flats)	Row Flat
55	9 E. 4 TH Street	(9, 11)	Duplex
56	11 E. 4 TH Street	(9, 11)	Duplex
57	13-15 E. 4 TH Street	Bridgeman Flats	Row Flat
69	214-216 E. 4 TH Street	Bermuda Flats	Row Flat
89	6-8 E. 5 TH Street		Row Flat
187	30-34 E. 5 TH Street	C.A. Erickson Flats	Row Flat
113	213-215 E. 5 TH Street		Row Flat
127	308 E. 5 TH Street		Duplex
128	309 E. 5 TH Street		Row Flat
130	311 E. 5 TH Street		Duplex
133	322 E. 5 TH Street		Row Flat
135	405 E. 5 TH Street		Double House
136	407 E. 5 TH Street		Duplex
155	220-222 E. 6 TH Street		Double House
156	224-226 E. 6 TH Street		Double House
160	314-316 E. 6 TH Street		Duplex
164	414 E. 6 TH Street		Duplex
183	419-425 N. 1 ST Ave E		Row Flat

188	117-129 N. 2 ND Ave E.	St. Regis Flats	Apartment
189	213-215 N. 2 ND Ave E.	J.L Crawford Apartments	Row Flat
190	214-216 N. 2 ND Ave E.		Row Flat
191	217 N. 2 ND Ave E.	(217, 219)	Row Flat
192	219 N. 2 ND Ave E.	(217, 219)	Row Flat
194	310-316 N. 2 ND Ave E.		Row Flat
195	313-315 N. 2 ND Ave E.		Row Flat
196	417-419 N. 2 ND Ave E.		Row Flat
208	517-519 N. 3 RD Ave E.	Bob Dylan's Childhood Home	Double House
210	521-523 N. 3 RD Ave E.		Double House
216	517-523 N. 4 TH Ave E.		Row Flat

Properties Recommended for Local Designation

Six properties within the survey area are recommended as not eligible for listing in the National Register yet appear to meet criteria for designation as Duluth historic landmarks. National Register and City of Duluth criteria are described above in Research Design and Survey Methods. Evaluations of eligibility for these properties are included in Appendix A.

Field #	House #	Street	Property Name
2	309 ½	E. 1 st Street	House ⁴⁹
15	28 - 32	E. 2 nd Street	Hotel Argyle/Mitchell/Hillview Apts.
104	116	E. 5 th Street	William Butchart House/ "the bell house"
182	520	Lake Avenue N.	Anna Clayton House
208	517-519	N. 3 rd Ave E.	Bob Dylan's Childhood Home
225	219	N. 6 th Avenue E.	Gloria Dei Lutheran Church ⁵⁰

 ⁴⁹ This property may also be eligible for listing in the NRHP, pending additional research, see entry in Appendix A.
 ⁵⁰ This property may also be eligible for listing in the NRHP, pending additional research, see entry in Appendix A.

Figure 3. East End Phase V Properties Recommended for a Multiple Property Documentation Form

Properties Recommended Not Eligible for National Register or Local Designation

The following properties within the survey area are recommended as not eligible for listing in the National Register and not eligible for designation as Duluth historic landmarks.

Field #	Address	Property Name	
1	231 E. 1 ST Street	Auto service shop	
4	315 E. 1 ST Street	Duplex	
9	331 E. 1 ST Street	Commercial Building	
10	526 E. 1 ST Street	Medical Building	
17	112 E. 2 ND Street	National Cash Register	
18	118 E. 2 ND Street	Club House - Fraternal Order of Owls	
19	127 E. 2 ND Street	Western Casket Company (Service Printing)	
21	211 E. 2 ND Street	Club House - Fraternal Order of Eagles	
22	222 E. 2 ND Street	King Manor Apartments	
24	301 E. 2 ND Street	Grandview Manor Apartments	
25	316 E. 2 ND Street	Portland Apartments	
26	320 E. 2 ND Street	Commercial Building	
28	330 E. 2 ND Street	Dr. Maryland Medical Office	
29	504 E. 2 ND Street	Miller Dwan Hospital	
44	221 E. 3 RD Street	Double House	
48	302 E. 3 RD Street	Temple Adas Israel	
50	330 E. 3 RD Street	St. Anns Senior Living Apartments	
51	400 E. 3 RD Street	Essentia Health-Duluth Clinic 3rd Street Building	
52	407 E. 3 RD Street	St. Mary's Hospital	
53	420 E. 3 RD Street	Essentia Health-Duluth Clinic 3rd Street Parking Ramp (inventoried with 400 E. 3 rd)	
58	23 E. 4 TH Street	J.G. Ostby	
60	102 E. 4 TH Street	· · · · ·	
62	110 E. 4 TH Street	Commercial Building	
64	119 E. 4 TH Street	Commercial Building	
66	202 E. 4 TH Street	Commercial Building	
67	206 E. 4 TH Street	Commercial Building	
75	331 E. 4 TH Street	Loiselle Garage (Kaarbos Auto Repair)	
76	413 E. 4 TH Street	Goering Bldg	
77	415 E. 4 TH Street	Beschenbossel Building	
78	417 E. 4 TH Street	Commercial Building	
79	421 E. 4 TH Street	Medical Building	
220	501 E. 4 TH Street	Bartholdi Block	
80	502 E. 4 TH Street	Bell Apartment	
227	510-512 E. 4 TH Street	Commercial Building	
81	505 E. 4 TH Street	Commercial Building	

513 E. 4 TH Street	Tufia Bldg	
516 E. 4 TH Street	Daugherty Bldg	
520 E. 4 TH Street	Commercial Building	
522 E. 4 TH Street	Potswald Block	
526 E. 4 TH Street	Commercial Building	
2 E. 5 TH Street	Duplex	
122 E. 5 TH Street	Duplex	
130 E. 5 TH Street	Flats	
302 E. 5 TH Street	Flats	
421 E. 5 TH Street	Double House	
431 E. 5 TH Street	Commercial Building	
108 E. 6 TH Street	Nettleton Elementary School	
322 E. 6 TH Street	Double House	
432 E. 6 TH Street	Calvary Baptist Church	
333 E. SUPERIOR ST	Voyageur Motel	
405 E. SUPERIOR ST	Dodge Block (Amindola Building)	
413 E. SUPERIOR ST	Arrowhead Glass Co.	
521 N. 1 ST Ave E.	Duplex	
222 N. 2 ND Ave E.	Tri-Towers Apartments	
527 N. 6 TH Ave E.	Gas Station	
	$516 \text{ E. } 4^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $520 \text{ E. } 4^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $522 \text{ E. } 4^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $2 \text{ E. } 5^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $122 \text{ E. } 5^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $122 \text{ E. } 5^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $130 \text{ E. } 5^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $302 \text{ E. } 5^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $421 \text{ E. } 5^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $431 \text{ E. } 5^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $108 \text{ E. } 6^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $322 \text{ E. } 6^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $432 \text{ E. } 6^{\text{TH}} \text{ Street}$ $433 \text{ E. } \text{ SUPERIOR ST}$ $405 \text{ E. } \text{ SUPERIOR ST}$ $413 \text{ E. } \text{ SUPERIOR ST}$ $521 \text{ N. } 1^{\text{ST}} \text{ Ave E.}$	

Properties Demolished Since Being Inventoried

The following 31 properties within the survey area were previously inventoried, but have since been demolished.

Inventory #	House #	Street	Property Name/Type
SL-DUL-0117	315	E. 1st Street	Flats (duplex)
SL-DUL-0152	316	E. 1st Street	Flats (duplex)
SL-DUL-1074	401	E. 1st Street	Reliance Body Shop (commercial)
SL-DUL-1075	402	E. 1st Street	Kellerhaus Auto (commercial)
SL-DUL-1076	406	E. 1st Street	Single family residence
SL-DUL-1077	408-10	E. 1st Street	Curran Apartments
SL-DUL-1078	412	E. 1st Street	Amendola Warehouse
SL-DUL-1079	416-420	E. 1st Street	Berkeley Apartments
SL-DUL-1080	422	E. 1st Street	Single family residence
SL-DUL-1081	424	E. 1st Street	Single family residence
SL-DUL-1082	426-28	E. 1st Street	Duluth Auto (commercial)
SL-DUL-1083	514-518	E. 1st Street	Hampshire Apartments
SL-DUL-1084	532	E. 1st Street	Peerless Auto (commercial)
SL-DUL-1260	113	E. 3rd Street	Single family residence
SL-DUL-1261	117-19	E. 2nd Street	Single family residence
SL-DUL-1267	401	E. 2nd Street	Shoreview Apartments
SL-DUL-1268	420	E. 2nd Street	Single family residence
SL-DUL-1269	501	E. 2nd Street	Single family residence
SL-DUL-1271	517	E. 2nd Street	Single family residence
SL-DUL-1420	317	E. 3rd Street	Apartments (double house)
SL-DUL-1425	502	E. 3rd Street	Ashtabula Apartments
SL-DUL-1427	514	E. 3rd Street	Johnson Mortuary
SL-DUL-1586	120	E. 4th Street	Minnesota Building (apartments)
SL-DUL-1590	226	E. 4th Street	Single family residence
SL-DUL-1592	302	E. 4th Street	Messiah Lutheran Church
SL-DUL-1593	332	E. 4th Street	Jeffrey Black Bldg (commercial)
SL-DUL-1594	401	E. 4th Street	John's Used Furniture (commercial)
SL-DUL-1595	407	E. 4th Street	European Bakery (commercial)
SL-DUL-1596	419	E. 4th Street	The Barber shop (commercial)
SL-DUL-1704	402-04	E. 5th Street	Evergreen Apartments
SL-DUL-1706	417	E. 5th Street	Single family residence

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

The East End Residential Area-Phase V project was initiated by the Duluth Heritage Preservation Commission (DHPC) in order to document the historic resources within the area of the East End closest to downtown, roughly bounded by North Lake Avenue, East 2nd Street and East Superior Street, North 6th Avenue East, and East 6th Street. The survey population consisted of 227 properties: 113 single-family residential, 62 multiple-family residences (includes duplexes, triplexes, and apartment buildings), seven mixed commercial-residential, 23 commercial properties, seven religious buildings, two schools, two hospitals and four medical offices, two fire stations, two clubhouses, and one of each of the following: gas station, motel, mortuary, casket manufacturing facility, and YMCA building. Of those properties, 78 had been previously inventoried.

Several properties within the survey area were previously listed in or determined eligible for listing: Duluth Central High School, Fire Station Number One, First Presbyterian Church, and St. Marks African Methodist Church. In addition, nine properties are recommended as individually eligible for listing in the National Register as a result of the current survey. All properties recommended as National Register eligible are also recommended as eligible for designation as historic landmarks by the City. In addition, six properties within the survey area are recommended as eligible for designation by the City, but not eligible for listing in the National Register.

It is further recommend that a Multiple Property Documentation Form could be developed for the multiple-family residential properties in the East End. A number of the apartment buildings in the East End survey were identified in 1984 as being in Group II and III, which means the buildings contribute to the overall character of Duluth. Some buildings retain more integrity than others, but as a whole the buildings relate to the historic context of the East End neighborhood. Some of the buildings were designed by local Duluth architects that had prolific careers locally and farther afield. A total of 43 multiple-family residences are recommended to be included in a National Register Multiple Property Documentation Form or a local-level equivalent documentation. Note: this is in addition to the multiple-family residences surveyed as part of Phases III and IV.

The remaining properties are recommended as not eligible for listing in the National Register or for local designation by the City, either individually or as part of a historic district.

REFERENCES CITED

Castle, Henry A. *Minnesota: Its Story and Biography.* Chicago: Lewis Publishing Company, 1915.

Clarke, Sister Margaret. "Remembering Things Past: Gone but not Forgotten." Pathways, Fall 2012. Accessed online September 2014: <u>http://www.duluthbenedictines.org/stuff/contentmgr/</u>files/0/a8f293e9d54179a76804f8ab75f8b30c/files/rtp_10_gone_but_not_forgotten.pdf

- College of St. Scholastica. "A Brief History of the College of St. Scholastica." The College of St. Scholastica. Accessed online September 2014: http://www.css.edu/About/Centennial/History.html
- Dierckins, Tony and Maryanne Norton. Lost Duluth: Landmarks, Industries, Buildings, Homes, and the Neighborhoods in Which They Stood. Duluth: Zenith City Press, 2012.
- *Duluth City Directory*. Duluth: R. L. Polk & Company, 1884 1960. From Ancestry.com U.S. City Directory collection. <u>http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=2469</u> (accessed October 2, 2014).
- *Duluth, Minnesota 1888.* Map. New York: Sanborn Map & Publishing Co. From Hennepin County Library Sanborn Digital Maps Database. <u>http://sanborn.umi.com.ezproxy.hclib.org/</u> (March 18, 2014).
- Duluth, Minnesota 1908, rev. 1909. Map. New York: Sanborn Map & Publishing Co. From Hennepin County Library Sanborn Digital Maps Database. <u>http://sanborn.umi.com.ezproxy.hclib.org/</u> (accessed March 18, 2014).
- Duluth, Minnesota 1908, rev. 1950. Map. New York: Sanborn Map & Publishing Co. From Hennepin County Library Sanborn Digital Maps Database. <u>http://sanborn.umi.com.ezproxy.hclib.org/</u> (accessed March 18, 2014).
- Duluth, Minnesota 1908, rev. 1955. Map. New York: Sanborn Map & Publishing Co. From Hennepin County Library Sanborn Digital Maps Database. <u>http://sanborn.umi.com.ezproxy.hclib.org/</u> (accessed March 18, 2014).
- Essentia Health. "Essentia Health-Duluth 80th Anniversary Open House." August, 2014. Accessed online: <u>http://www.essentiahealth.org/EssentiaHealthStMarysChildrensHospital/</u> blogs/Essentia-HealthDuluth-80th-Anniversary-Open-House--637.aspx
- Eubank, Nancy. "The Zenith City of the Unsalted Sea Duluth Historic Contexts Study." Prepared for the Duluth Heritage Preservation Commission, 1991.
- Gebhard, David and Tom Martingson. A Guide to the Architecture of Minnesota. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1977.

- Hacket, John J. "Fire Department Number One." National Register of Historic Places Inventory
 Nomination Form. On file at the State Historic Preservation Office, Minnesota Historical Society, 1975, rev. 1989.
- Kellner, Debra. "Intensive Survey of Historic Resources in Duluth's East End Neighborhood." Prepared for the Duluth Heritage Preservation Commission, Duluth, MN, 2009.
- Koop, Michael and Chris Morris. "Historic Resources of Duluth's Central Business District, 1872-1933." National Register of Historic Places Multiple Property Documentation Form, prepared for Minnesota Historical Society and National Register of Historic Places, 2006.
- Larson Fisher Associates. "Intensive Survey of Historic Resources in Duluth's East End Neighborhood," prepared for the Duluth Heritage Preservation Commission, 2007. Available online at <u>http://zenithcity.com/zenith-city-history-archives/</u>
- Lathrop, Alan K. *Minnesota Architects: A Biographical Dictionary*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010.
- Longstreth, Richard. *The Buildings of Main Street: A Guide to American Commercial Architecture*. Washington, D.C.: The Preservation Press, 1987.
- McAlester, Virginia and Lee McAlster. A Field Guide to American Houses. New York: Knopf, 1989.
- Norton, Maryanne C. E-mail message to local historian & Duluth Public Library volunteer regarding Nettleton Elementary School and St. Josephat Polish National Catholic Church, June 8 and 10, August 30, 2014.
- Norton, Maryanne C. and Sheldon T. Aubut. *Images of America: Duluth Minnesota*. Charleston, SC: Arcadia, 2001.
- Olsen, P.M. "First Fire Hall, Duluth" Scaled Drawing, Historic American Buildings Survey. 1934. Accessed online September 2014: <u>http://www.loc.gov/pictures/item/mn0003/</u>
- Pen and Sunlight Sketches of Duluth, Superior and Ashland: Their Wonderful Development, Resources, Commerce, Manufactures, Financial Interests, Public Institutions and Prospects. Phoenix: Phoenix Publishing Company, 1892.
- Savage, Beth L. African American Historic Places. Preservation Press: Washington, D.C., 1994.
- Scott, James Allen. *Duluth's Legacy: Volume 1 Architecture*. Duluth: City of Duluth Department of Research and Planning, 1974.
- Shear, John Know, ed. *Religious Buildings for Today*. New York: F. W. Dodge Corporation, 1957.

- Sheppard, E.L. The Second Fifty Years: The Diocese of Minnesota and the Diocese of Duluth from 1907 to 1957. Minneapolis: The Diocese of Minnesota, 1972.
- Sommer, Lawrence J. "Duluth Historic Resources Survey Final Report." Duluth: St. Louis County Historical Society, 1984.
- Van Brunt, Walter. Duluth and St. Louis County, volume 1. Chicago: American Historical Society, 1922.
- Wagner, Philip Kent. "The Historical Geography of Apartment Housing in Minneapolis, Minnesota, 1870 to 1930." Ph.D. diss., University of Minnesota, 1991.

Duluth Public Library (Main Branch), Biography Files; Newspapers

Duluth Evening Herald "Divorce Day." September 1, 1899.

- Duluth Evening Herald "Livelier Outlook in Realty Market." September 8, 1905.
- Duluth Evening Herald Magazine Edition. "Pioneer Explorer of the Vermilion and Mesaba Iron Ranges." 1908.

Duluth Herald "JD Stryker, Realty Man, Dies in City." December 16, 1935.

Duluth Herald "Obituary: German Lignell" October 14, 1937.

Duluth News Tribune "Pioneer in Mesaba Exploration." November 29, 1906.

Duluth News Tribune "Obituary: Lignell" February 11, 1954.

Duluth News Tribune "Former Duluth Architect Dies (William T. Bray)" April 3, 1959.

APPENDIX A: SURVEYED PROPERTIES

APPENDIX B: SURVEY FORMS

ON FILE AT THE MINNESOTA STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE, SAINT PAUL