

APPENDICES



APPENDIX A

Bayfront District Small Area Plan Process

The time line for the planning process was carried out as follows:

- September 2009 - Stakeholder Committee formed. Planning Division Staff began gathering data and reviewing previous plans
- September 2009 - First Committee meeting to review process and previous plans
- October 2009 - City Planning Commission reviews scope of work
- October 2009 - Second Committee meeting to review sections of the Plan
- November 2009 - Third Committee meeting to develop process for 12/02/09 public meeting
- December 2009 - First public meeting to review previous plans and offer ideas regarding new opportunities and issues of concern
- December 2009 - Fourth Committee meeting to review proposed Small Area Plan recommendations
- January 2010 - Second Public meeting to review Small Area Plan recommendations.
- February 2010 - City Planning Commission review of the Small Area Plan (Public Hearing)
- March 2010 - City Council review of the Small Area Plan

Contained in Appendix A are the following documents:

- Stakeholder Committee Agendas
- Public Meeting Press Releases, Agendas, and Meeting Notes
- Small Area Plan Web Page

**Bayfront District Small Area Plan
Stakeholder Committee Meeting
September 28, 2009
2:00 – 3:30 p.m.**

AGENDA

- | | |
|---|-------------------|
| I. Introductions | 5 minutes |
| II. Small Area Plan components and format | 15 minutes |
| III. Discuss draft purpose statement and objectives | 15 minutes |
| IV. Overview of project, role of other agencies
(DNR, DEDA) | 15 minutes |
| V. Review of previous plans <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Discussion: what should be carried forward? | 30 minutes |
| VI. Next steps | 10 minutes |

**Bayfront District Small Area Plan
Stakeholder Committee Meeting
October 19, 2009
2:00 – 3:30 p.m.**

AGENDA

- | | |
|---|-------------------|
| I. New area Maps | 10 minutes |
| II. Review of previous plans | 15 minutes |
| III. Transportation | 10 minutes |
| IV. Economic, Opportunities & Trends | 15 minutes |
| V. Use / Development Restrictions | 10 minutes |
| VI. DEDA Activities | 10 minutes |
| VII. Public Process
(Public Meeting 12/09) | 20 minutes |
| VIII. Next steps | 10 minutes |

**Bayfront District Small Area Plan
Stakeholder Committee Meeting
November 23, 2009
2:00 – 3:30 p.m.**

AGENDA

- | | |
|--|-------------------|
| I. Project Status report
Revised project schedule (attached) | 20 minutes |
| II. DEDA Activities
DEDA / DNR contract
Environmental Assessment status | 15 minutes |
| III. Public Process
Public Meeting (12/09) Draft Format (attached) | 20 minutes |
| IV. Next steps | 15 minutes |



FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE
City of Duluth Communications Office

411 West First Street, Duluth, Minnesota 55802
218-730-5230 | www.duluthmn.gov | Don Ness, Mayor

For more information contact Pakou Ly, Public Information Coordinator 218-730-5309
or Amy Norris, Public Information Coordinator 218-730-4312

DATE: 11/25/2009

SUBJECT: Bayfront area public meeting to be held December 2

BY: Pakou Ly

Bayfront area public meeting to be held December 2

The City of Duluth Planning Division invites the public to participate in the development of a Small Area Plan for the Bayfront District on December 2, 2009 at 6:30 PM. The meeting will take place in the Great Hall of the Depot.

The purpose of the Bayfront District Small Area Plan is to study the area just west of Bayfront Park and determine the appropriate mix of land uses. The study area, which has been the focus of numerous planning efforts to date, includes property owned by the Duluth Economic Development Authority (DEDA) as well as the LaFarge cement property that is currently for sale. It is the intent of the current planning process to use the information and recommendations assembled in previous plans as the basis for the Small Area Plan.

The public will be asked to work in small groups to review and discuss the recommendations from those previous plans and to offer additional insights reflecting current opportunities for the site.

It is anticipated that the Bayfront District Small Area Plan will be completed and ready to present to the Planning Commission and City Council in February 2010.



CITY OF DULUTH

Community Resources Department
Planning Division

411 West First St · Rm 402 · Duluth, MN 55802-1197
218-730-5580 · www.duluthmn.gov

Bayfront District Small Area Plan

PUBLIC MEETING

Great Hall at the Depot
Wednesday, December 2, 2009
6:30 – 8:00 p.m.

AGENDA

1. Welcome / Introduction
2. What is a Small Area Plan?
3. Why a Small Area Plan now?
 - Public Interest and Opportunities
 - New Zoning Regulations
 - High Speed Rail/Depot Redevelopment
 - Cross-City Trail Extension
 - Multi-modal Transit Facility

 - DEDA Development Opportunities
 - Sale of LaFarge Property
 - DNR Grant Study
4. Previous Planning Efforts
5. Small Group Discussions
6. Next Public Meeting – January 2010

For more information visit the Planning webpage:
<http://www.duluthmn.gov/planning/sap/bayfrontdistrict.cfm>

**Round Table Discussion notes 12/02/09
(listed by heading and group table)**

What recommendations, ideas, and concepts from previous planning efforts make sense for Bayfront?

Table 1

- Commercial boating
- Restaurants (not too many with gentle ties to other activities that are water related.
- Design a waterfront village with continuity.
- Like the market place and reuse of the cement silos for hotel.
- Historical markers and industrial history (History reaches beyond industrial to the native cultures and natural landscape.
- Trees along Railroad Street and keep parking away
- Maintain public access
- Maximize the trail expansion and connection to the Munger trail/cross-city trail make accessible to multiple users
- Year-round amenities/ botanical Garden x-c skiing and skating

Table 2

- Transient boat Slips
- Boater amenities
- Visitor information center
- Fishing piers
- Remain a tourist area
- Integrate with Lakewalk

Table 3

- Mix of things and uses
- Stress connections to Canal Park and Downtown
- Education Important - Historic
- Tall Ships, Education Permanent display
- Commercial fishing Dock and Market
- Conservatory –mix with hotel
- Are there reasons for more condos or motels?

Table 4

- Transient dockage – privately owned / Tax payer
- Boardwalk
- Additional Commercial
- Limit height of buildings
- Room for cruise / large boats to dock
- Maintain the slip
- Conservatory

Table 5

- Citizens like to experience the Lakewalk and the Lake
- Transient Marina –provide good access to downtown
- Need to be retail, food, restaurants like Juneau AK shops and restaurants everywhere
- Need to be supported year-round and appeal to Local citizens
- Tax-base Jobs for Duluth
- Would like to see all money coming in to go for recreation but understand this is not possible
- Whatever is financially sustainable?

- Something unique!
- A small component should be parks use.

Table 6

- Reuse of old Lafarge structures
- Some retail shops OK
- Small number of condo/time shares
- Seattle-like food market
- Duluth's Focal point, destination point, Port of call
- Space to meet many opportunities

Table 7

- Marina
- Water Access
- Small watercraft with an adequate terminal
- Transit boat area
- Four season use
- Revenue producer
- Excursion boat docking
- Residential as part of mixed use maybe condos
- Public access (pedestrian) to waterfront
- Playfront stays there
- Food mall and gift shop, food market and common space.

Table 8

- Transit marina
- Retail to complement Canal Park not compete
- Botanical conservatory or other indoor activity to draw during winter
- Development (hotel or mixed use housing) that will generate money and support itself
- Parking close but not in development maybe transit connections
- Substantial buffer between site and industry.

Table 9

- Need retail services restaurant near transient boat facility
- Public market, farmers market should locate there.

What recommendations, ideas, and concepts do you think may no longer be appropriate?

Table 1

- No cinema-plex
- No condos

Table 2

- Multi-plex theatre
- Duplicating Canal Park / Miller Mall
- Residential units (bad place for people to live)
- Public food hall

Table 3

- Playfront is already established
- Aquarium/ Environmental Center already here
- Movie theater already here

- No more micro breweries.

Table 4

- Multiplex
- Water garden that doesn't treat all the water
- Replace the playground
- Historic boat basin (not a big market for historic boats)
- At this point be careful about eliminating ideas keep opinions broad
- No real heavy industry

Table 5

- Any type of housing that would become expensive/exclusive and prevent access
- Anything that would hurt neighboring industries 9 will the other industries be pushed out?
- Are Living Water Gardens and similar ideas financially sustainable?
- Duluth doesn't need more hotels or hockey arenas
- Museum or other things like the aquarium are not financially feasible
- Mini-mall or strip mall- but these might bring the best financial return
- Can't be all park because it is not sustainable

Table 6

- No arcade like entertainment
- Open-air sidewalk not covered
- Bayfront and Playfront parks meet the recreation needs
- Something other than the old industrial working harbor theme.
- Rain garden not "water garden"

Table 7

- Living water garden should be small/modest demonstration area.
- Botany / greenhouse
- Outlet Mall
- Multi-plex cinema
- Ramp Parking
- Skywalk not a fit maybe other connections
- Ice skating and park and playground already done in Bayfront
- No farmers market

Table 8

- What about mixed use housing?
- Cinema

Table 9

- Water garden should go to where flowing water would be used rather than pumped.
- Outlet mall, multi-plex cinema not needed
- Don't need more condos
- Don't need historical boat display
- Don't bridge the end of the slips like the Minnesota slip

What additional opportunities do you see for this area?

Table 1

- Indoor pool
- Shallow paddleboat, kayak, canoe area in the former slip #4 area
- Lafarge site for a farmers market and local foods (sustainability)

Table 2

- Segway rental
- Docking for "tall" ships
- Brewery
- Art Space
- Kayak rental
- Fish Market
- Indoor activities (skate boarding) for winter?

Table 3

- Transient port is great – good draw for boaters
- Consider a water taxi to other waterfront locations
- Living water garden
- Fish market – Fresh Fish
- Dock for commercial fishing Boat
- Trolleys for connections to other areas
- Working waterfront is good
- Need places for people to work at a living wage.
- Amusement Park "Coney Island" with food vendors (ice cream)
- Campground / RV Park
- Use lakewalk to totally circumvent the water?

Table 4

- Cruise Ship industry
- "Green" energy transport (battery powered boats)
- Transient docking as another reason for people to come to Duluth
- It would be a good place for a Club house/ boat house
- Do this right so this does not distract from downtown
- Great spot for mixed use
- Great area for pedestrians to walk around (like San Antonio TX)

Table 5

- Capitalize on the Historic character of the industries in the area.
- Use new technologies for cleaner water and air and for sustain able energy
- Capitalize on the marine traffic the lager boat passing by is unique.

Table 6

- Needs freeway access closer the site.
- Economic expansion
- Cruise Ship Building
- Multi-purpose Buildings
- Multi-modal transportation

Table 7

- Thunder Bay as an example
- Visitor center for the public
- Fishing and lake themes
- Attract "young professional to live in downtown
- Inter-modal transit would benefit site

Table 8

- Tax / revenue generating
- Multi seasonal uses

- Restaurants
- Creative construction, heights of buildings
- Control heights of buildings
- Potential “wow” factor to define Duluth

Table 9

- Micro-brewery would combine commercial with industrial use.
- Tall ship docking and display area needed
- Put cruise ship and transient boats in dock protect by breakwater
- Need a trolley or other transit facility to connect the area to the downtown and Canal Park
- Hotels would work well on site
- Like a winter garden for winter time use
- Need gardens and attractive landscaping (not just hard-scape)
- Already much green space don't need a lot more
- Commercial fishing location where you can buy fresh fish

What are the challenges for this area?

Table 1

- Habitat restoration
- Stormwater management garden (not Living Water/Rain Garden) to clean water on the site and educate in an artful manner. Slip location is Key.
- Mindful of stormwater issues re: the impervious surface in design decisions work for sustainability.
- Careful coordination / integration of this area into Bayfront
- Is the loss of industrial waterfront a bad thing, will it come back to haunt us.
- DEDA property seem to encroach on the Bayfront (Park) Need to keep Bayfront (Park)
- (Building) Height restrictions need to be kept in mind to protect open views
- Needs to have winter activities.

Table 2

- How does the “Jones Act “(public waters) affect this?
- Need a good connection t Canal park (tied into the Lake walk or a trolley service
- Ned to provide parking near developments
- Need year round issues (uses/activities)
- Need to guarantee public (pedestrian) easement & connections

Table 3

- Commercial fishing need an area the freezes last and opens first: Slips 2 & 3 harbor area is it!
- No place now to buy or eat fresh fish
- Duplicating the Canal Park area won't work
- Traffic (Auto) parking – Railroad Street
- Stress good connections

Table 4

- DNR as roadblock they have very little knowledge of boating
- Polluted Ground soil
- Don't over build; make sure height limits are in place.
- Good blend of commercial / retail / and open space.
- Ensure good quality design that ties pedestrian / bike and car parking together.
- Don't eliminate open space Need some to have a quality development.

Table 5

- Automobile and pedestrian access to the site, traffic problems.
- Proximity to Hotels
- What will draw people to the area?
- How to pay for it and make it financially feasible
- Keep the lake clean – make sure development does not contribute to the pollution.
- Clean up the sheet-piling and fill on the property
- Cost of development on a previous swampland.

Table 6

- Parking if a ramp move off site
- Needs public transportation
- Getting the vision out there
- Providing parking off site
- Special kids area – where?

Table 7

- What happen to the gravel parking lot?
- Area is a small space
- Still can't boat up to a restaurant.
- Need better access for boaters to reach downtown/canal Park restaurants
- Connectivity
- Parking will be a cost factor
- What happens to the existing buildings?
- Environmental concerns that exist on the site
- Homeland security for Cruise ships.

Table 8

- How opinions are captured and evaluated will be very important (Red Plan) Building on the site must respect sight lines and public access.
- Balancing Port uses for industry with recreation
- Balance of DNR, State City and Private
- Think long term
- Multi-seasonal to attract during winter

Table 9

- Is adaptive reuse of existing Lafarge possible?
- Need to resolve the customs facilities for cruise ships
- Don't close harbor drive when ships are here.
- Slip walls are failing need reinvestment and dredging
- Is there enough room for all of the ideas on the table?
- Need a winter time use for the area too.
- Need adequate and accessible parking

What other factors should be considered for this Small Area Plan?

Table 1

- Public space and commercial can combined to have an economic development impact.
- Vendors and mobile carts or retail
- Not all concrete the lake is the focus
- Parking should be concealed with landscaping and terrain.
- Look to Portland's use of "bioswales" for buffering

- RV parking area along Railroad Street or as buffer to industrial area.

Table 2

- Public Hotel better than private residential
- Keeping the "Slips" and water connection is essential
- Parking needs to be close.

Table 3

- LEED certified- leadership in construction an operations
- Vision in sustainability and alternative energy
- Proper stormwater handling
- Don't want charter boats here
- Concern over the buffer between the industrial and mixed use
- Need something for the "locals" to enjoy
- City Aquatic facility?
- Recognize budget woes

Table 4

- Involve other stakeholders, Power squadron, and yacht club superwood
- Balance of development and green space.
- Don't give the property away but look at the project and what it brings to the City.
- Balance the local economy we can't just focus on tourism ... balance of other jobs
- Successful cities have a mix of many people running the show
- If people (30,000) left Duluth over the last 30 years it should tell us something
- People that live here should research how successful other communities have been with their waterfront.
-

Table 5

- Nautical / water theme
- Job base industrial uses have traditionally provides the
- Cutler0magney previously wanted to purchase this land for industrial use and was rejected by DEDA
- Want to see a marina operated by a private business not DNR Don't complete with existing marina businesses
- Aesthetics don't want things like an ugly mini-storage buildings
- Would a marina require uses like fueling, repair etc?

Table 6

- Green space on roofs not need on the ground
- Destination/jumping off point for the region.
- Arts/ Gardens
- 2 week adventure package marketing-for the region
- Bike rental use on rail to trail
- Trail connection s to the region state
- People movers get pedestrians to downtown, DECC, Canal Park
- Independent restaurants, no cooperate chains
- Touch/feel Duluth and the water

Table 7

- Don't think too small access outside sources of funding
- Consider mixed use of the area
- Consider the importance of landscaping
- Connections to Downtown and Canal Park important

- Enhance the Connections to Downtown and Canal Park
- Minimal “commercial “restaurants
- Need to provide parking for future activities.
- Boat launch facility
- Small shallow pond for paddle boats and kids’ toy boats

Table 8

- Buffer w/neighbors
- More traffic
- Light Rail
- Connectivity
- Canal Park

Table 9

- Extension of the lakewalk to tie in with the cross-city trail
- Access to the waterfront is important to the general public
- Freezer warehouse foundation is a resource, with pilings and foundation and should be reused. Costly to remove.

**Bayfront District Small Area Plan
Stakeholder Committee Meeting
December 21, 2009
2:00 – 3:30 p.m.
City Hall, Room 402, Large Conference Rm.**

AGENDA

- | | |
|---|-------------------|
| I. Project Status report
Revised project schedule (attached) | 10 minutes |
| II. Review of Round Table Notes
From 12/02/09 Public meeting | 10 minutes |
| III. Draft recommendations | 20 minutes |
| IV. DEDA Activities
Environmental Assessment | 15 minutes |
| V. Next steps | 15 minutes |



FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE
City of Duluth Communications Office

411 West First Street, Duluth, Minnesota 55802
218-730-5230 | www.duluthmn.gov | Don Ness, Mayor

For more information contact Pakou Ly, Public Information Coordinator 218-730-5309
or Amy Norris, Public Information Coordinator 218-730-4312

DATE: 01/21/2010

SUBJECT: Public meeting on Bayfront District to be held January 27

BY: Pakou Ly

Public meeting on Bayfront District to be held January 27

The City of Duluth Planning Division invites the public to attend and participate in a meeting on January 27, 2010 at 6:30 PM to discuss the Small Area Plan for the Bayfront District. The meeting will take place in Room 405 in Duluth City Hall.

The City Planning Division and Duluth Economic Development Authority (DEDA) staff will be presenting the draft recommendations for the Bayfront District Small Area Plan. A question and answer session will follow the presentation.

The purpose of this Plan is to establish criteria for revising the Duluth Comprehensive Plan, Future Land Use Map, and changing the Bayfront District's current "Industrial" designation to a category that will allow for a more appropriate and desirable mix of land uses.

For this Small Area Plan, the City Planning Division has compiled information and recommendations assembled in previous plans, obtained input from a representative stakeholders committee, and collected additional public comment from a December 2009 meeting.

City staff will analyze any additional comments generated and present a draft of the Bayfront District Small Area Plan to the City Planning Commission in February and present the completed Plan to the City Council in March of this year.



CITY OF DULUTH

Planning Division

411 West First St · Rm 402 · Duluth, MN 55802-1197

218-730-5580 · www.duluthmn.gov

Bayfront District Small Area Plan

PUBLIC MEETING

City Hall Room 405
Wednesday, January 27, 2010
6:30 – 8:00 p.m.

AGENDA

1. Welcome / Introduction

2. Purpose of the Small Area Plan?
Map of study area.

3. Study Process

4. Draft Recommendations

5. Next Steps in the Public Process

For more information visit the Planning webpage:

<http://www.duluthmn.gov/planning/sap/bayfrontdistrict.cfm>

Bayfront District Small Area Plan

Public Meeting 1/27/2010

Public Input

- How do you make it pedestrian friendly and aesthetically pleasing?
- Importance of buffer space
- Drinking water
- Neighboring landowner supports this type of development
- Why not consider a broader area?
- Public access versus private property
- What will DNR component look like?
- Parking (for marina)
- Put more buildings rather than parking
- Are there green building standards? Green Roofs?
- This property already has stormwater; pipes/drainage
- Nearby waste heat that can be utilized (like Vaxjo)
- Be inclusive not too stringent
- Be a green model (Vaxjo)
- How to accommodate cruise ships
- Look at site design holistically, comprehensively
- Tribute to sailors - observed by land and water
- Floating barged with residences?
- Do we really want to expand the harbor and reduce land? (valuable real estate)
- Building height: 60' doesn't seem like a lot-go higher
- Couldn't have transient slips without a seawall

[home](#) » [PLANNING](#) » [SAP](#) » Bayfront District Small Area Plan

Bayfront District Small Area Plan

What's New!

- See [Round Table Comments](#) from the December 2 Public Meeting.

The Bayfront District Small Area Plan will study the area just west of Bayfront Park to determine whether any changes are required to future land use. This area has been the focus of numerous previous plans, and this Small Area Plan will take that information and recommendations of those plans into consideration.

Study Area

The study area includes the DEDA and Lafarge cement properties west of Bayfront Park ([map](#)). The area is also bordered by I35, the Cutler Magney property to the west, and the Duluth-Superior harbor. This area was identified because ownership and market characteristics are in transition, and a detailed study could help determine the future land use of the area.

Meetings & Documents

Public Meeting

A public meeting was held December 2, 2009, at the Great Hall of the Depot.

[Press Release](#)

[Agenda](#)

[Round Table Comments](#)

Previous Plans

- [Bayfront District Master Plan - 2002 \(2.2 MB\)](#)
- [Report to the Mayor - 2000 \(2.3 MB\)](#)
- [HarborPlace Strategic Development Plan - 1998 \(5.6 MB\)](#)
- [Bayfront Development Analysis and Recommendation - 1997 \(1.2 MB\)](#)

Bayfront District Small Area Plan Committee

The Bayfront District Small Area Plan Committee is working to review previous plans, examine current issues, and provide input in the development of the Small Area Plan.

- Sharla Gardner, City Council
- Mike Akervik, Planning Commission
- Heidi Timm-Bijold, Duluth Economic Development Authority
- Sandy Hoff, FI Salter
- Andy McDonough, Port Authority
- Larry Killien, DNR Harbors Coordinator
- Andy McDonald, Metropolitan Interstate Commission
- Gene Shaw, Visit Duluth
- Kristi Stokes, Greater Downtown Council

Tell Us What You Think...

Have you reviewed the information on the new Bayfront District Small Area Plan and want to tell us what you think? We're happy to receive your comments and use them in the process of developing the new Bayfront District Small Area Plan. However, we will not be responding to individual comments submitted.

Please provide your name and phone number as well as your email address with your comment. We will not utilize any comments from sources that have not included their contact information.

Also, please be aware that comments submitted to this web page become public information and may be published with other comments regarding the Bayfront District Small Area Plan.

First Name*