



**DULUTH ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY**

**REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR**

**FORMER LESTER GOLF COURSE PROPERTY APPRAISAL**

**RFP NUMBER 23-AA09**

**ISSUED May 18, 2023**

**PROPOSALS DUE WEDNESDAY JUNE 1, 2023 at 4:00 PM central time**

**SUBMIT TO**

**CITY OF DULUTH  
ATTN: PURCHASING DIVISION  
CITY HALL, ROOM 120  
411 WEST 1ST STREET  
DULUTH, MN 55802**

## PART I - GENERAL INFORMATION

**I-1. Project Overview.** The Duluth Economic Development Authority (DEDA) requests qualifications and fee schedules from licensed appraisers to determine fair market value in accordance with Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice for approximately 37-acres of DEDA owned property in the Lester Park neighborhood of Duluth, Minnesota.

**I-2. Calendar of Events.** DEDA will make every effort to adhere to the following schedule:

Activity	Date
Deadline to submit Questions via email to <a href="mailto:purchasing@duluthmn.gov">purchasing@duluthmn.gov</a>	5/24/23
Answers to questions will be posted to the City website no later than this date.	5/26/23
Proposals must be received in the Purchasing Office by 4:00 PM on this date.	6/1/23

**I-3. Rejection of Proposals.** DEDA reserves the right, in its sole and complete discretion, to reject any and all proposals or cancel the request for proposals, at any time prior to the time a contract is fully executed, when it is in its best interests. DEDA is not liable for any costs the Bidder incurs in preparation and submission of its proposal, in participating in the RFP process or in anticipation of award of the contract.

**I-4. Questions & Answers.** Any questions regarding this RFP must be submitted by e-mail to the City of Duluth Purchasing Office at [purchasing@duluthmn.gov](mailto:purchasing@duluthmn.gov) **no later than** the date indicated on the Calendar of Events. Answers to the questions will be posted as an Addendum to the RFP.

**I-5. Addenda to the RFP.** If DEDA deems it necessary to revise any part of this RFP before the proposal response date, the City Purchasing Office will post an addendum to its website <http://www.duluthmn.gov/purchasing/bids-request-for-proposals/> . Although an e-mail notification will be sent, it is the Bidder's responsibility to periodically check the website for any new information.

**I-6. Proposals.** To be considered, hard copies of proposals must arrive at the City Purchasing Office on or before the time and date specified in the RFP Calendar of Events. DEDA will not accept proposals via email or facsimile transmission. DEDA reserves the right to reject or to deduct evaluation points for late proposals.

Proposals must be signed by an authorized official. If the official signs the Proposal Cover Sheet attached as Appendix A, this requirement will be met. Proposals must remain valid for 60 days or until a contract is fully executed.

**Please submit one (1) paper copy of the Technical Submittal and one (1) paper copy of the Cost Submittal. The Cost Submittal must be in a separate, sealed envelope.** In addition, Bidders shall submit one copy of the entire proposal (Technical and Cost submittals, along with any requested documents) on flash drive in Microsoft Office-compatible or pdf format.

All materials submitted in response to this RFP will become property of the City/DEDA and will become public record after the evaluation process is completed and an award decision made.

**I-7. Mandatory Disclosures.** By submitting a proposal, each Bidder understands, represents, and acknowledges that:

- A. Their proposal has been developed by the Bidder independently and has been submitted without collusion with and without agreement, understanding, or planned common course of action with any other vendor or suppliers of materials, supplies, equipment, or services described in the Request for Proposals, designed to limit independent bidding or competition, and that the contents of the proposal have not been communicated by the Bidder or its employees or agents to any person not an employee or agent of the Bidder.
- B. There is no conflict of interest. A conflict of interest exists if a Bidder has any interest that would actually conflict, or has the appearance of conflicting, in any manner or degree with the performance of work on the project. If there are potential conflicts, identify the municipalities, developers, and other public or private entities with whom your company is currently, or have been, employed and which may be affected.
- C. It is not currently under suspension or debarment by the State of Minnesota, any other state or the federal government.
- D. The company is either organized under Minnesota law or has a Certificate of Authority from the Minnesota Secretary of State to do business in Minnesota, in accordance with the requirements in M.S. 303.03.

**I-8. Small Diverse Business Information.** DEDA encourage participation by minority, women, and veteran-owned businesses as prime contractors, and encourages all prime contractors to make a significant commitment to use minority, women, veteran owned and other disadvantaged business entities as subcontractors and suppliers. A list of certified Disadvantaged Business Enterprises is maintained by the Minnesota Unified Certification Program at <http://mnucp.metc.state.mn.us/>.

**I-9. Award.** The agreement award will be based on the time and materials submitted in the proposal, but will be a lump-sum, not-to-exceed agreement. This land appraisal project requires a high level of coordination with the selected consultant and DEDA/City staff.

## **PART II - PROPOSAL REQUIREMENTS**

Consulting firms must submit a complete package in order to be considered. The ideal submission package includes each of the sections below, in the following order:

TECHNICAL SUBMITTAL - Do NOT include any costs in the technical submittal.

1. Cover letter - A letter highlighting the proposed project team. The letter should indicate a single point of contact/overall project manager. The cover letter should also include: the firm's name, e-mail

address, business address, telephone and fax number, federal I.D. number, and Minnesota tax I.D. number (if applicable). The cover letter must state that the firm (with teamed partners identified) has personnel with the qualifications necessary to complete work in the contract program. The letter should also explain the benefits of using your company's/team's services. The cover letter will be limited to two pages.

2. Relevant projects - Include a maximum of six projects that highlight the team and/or team members' experience with property appraisals in a redevelopment/reuse context. There is no prescribed format for this section; however, it will be limited to six pages in length.

3. Resumes - Please submit a one-page resume for each proposed team member, highlighting experience in each of the above-listed skill areas. Resumes will be limited to a 10-page maximum total.

4. Work Plan and Timeline – Please submit a workplan that outlines appraisal approach and how industry standards and principles of highest and best use will inform the property appraisal and opinion of value. Please include a detailed timeline that reflects necessary meetings with DEDA staff, research, field work, and delivery of opinion of cost. DEDA is hopeful to complete the appraisal process by June 30, 2023 or soon thereafter.

COST PROPOSAL – Provide, in a separate sealed envelope, one copy of the cost proposal, clearly marked on the outside “Cost Proposal” along with the bidder’s official business name. Terms of the proposal as stated must be valid for the project length of time.

1. Personnel and materials Fee Schedule

### **PART III - CRITERIA FOR SELECTION**

The proposals will be reviewed by City/DEDA Staff. The intent of the selection process is to review proposals and make an award based upon qualifications as described therein. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations. The factors and weighting on which proposals will be judged are:

- 35% Qualifications of the Bidder and Personnel
- 35% Prior experience with land appraisals related to redevelopment/reuse
- 15% Objectives, deliverables and work plan timeline
- 15% Cost

### **PART IV – PROJECT DETAIL**

To inform redevelopment and reuse activities, DEDA seeks proposals from qualified appraisers to determine the fair market value of an approximately 37-acre portion of the former Lester Golf Course. The property is located in the eastern side of Duluth and situated near the popular Lester Park and Lester River. This area is known for its spectacular scenery, rich history and impressive views of Lake Superior. DEDA closed on the purchase of said property from the City of Duluth in April 2023 and work with qualified development entities to redevelopment the property for residential and mixed-use opportunities, with residential development meeting mixed-income and affordability goals for both rental and homeownership.

DEDA seeks a land appraisal that utilizes highest and best use practices to determine fair market land value. Principles to consider when informing an option of value include:

- Physically possible
- Legally permissible
- Financially feasibly
- Maximally productive

In addition to highest and best use principles, DEDA seeks appraisals that consider competitive market data in accordance with Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice.

**General Project Area**

This appraisal will cover the approximately 37-acre tract of land as depicted in the survey attached as Appendix B.

**APPENDIX A - PROPOSAL COVER SHEET  
DULUTH ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY  
RFP 23-AA09 Lester Property Appraisal**

<b>Bidder Information:</b>	
Bidder Name	
Mailing Address	
Contact Person	
Contact Person's Phone Number	
Contact Person's E-Mail Address	
Federal ID Number	
Authorized Signature	
Title	