

CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)

This could be an overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the program year.

The City of Duluth 2021 Program year began on April 1, 2021 and ended on March 31, 2022. During this year, the community transitioned from the pandemic state that was declared by the Presidential on March 13, 2020 to a hybrid environment, where people changed their living and work habits to deal with the impacts resulting from the coronavirus pandemic. During the pandemic, the City of Duluth was awarded additional \$1,927,758 in CDBG and \$2,972,199 in ESG funding from the Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security Act, also known as the CARES Act, to assist people negatively impacted by the pandemic. The City was able to use these "CV" funds to provide assistance to over 9000 people, a spreadsheet is attached to Administrative Section of the CAPER to provide an overview of these programs and the people who were assisted. Not all the CV funding has been spent, therefore will be additional accomplishments reported next year. It appears that the CV funding will help the city meet and exceed some of the strategic goals. To minimize confusion, the chart below shows only the accomplishments that was achieved with the Entitlement Funding. City Staff is attaching another spreadsheet that includes the CV results for Strategic Plan.

Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee's program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Rental units constructed	Household Housing Unit	250	72	28.80%			

Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	500	70	14.00%	40	59	147.50%
Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	50	16	32.00%	1	8	800.00%
Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	500	81	16.20%	100	63	63.00%
Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Housing for Homeless added	Household Housing Unit	0	0		0	0	
Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Housing for People with HIV/AIDS added	Household Housing Unit	0	0		0	0	
Childcare Access	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	500	150	30.00%	120	70	58.33%
Create Living Wage Jobs	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Businesses assisted	Businesses Assisted	70	36	51.43%	48	20	41.67%
Food Access	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	85250	42051	49.33%	15625	21464	137.37%

Food Access	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Homeless Person Overnight Shelter	Persons Assisted	0	0		0	0	
Health Services	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0		20000	0	0.00%
Health Services	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	1000	0	0.00%			
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Public service activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	15000	10330	68.87%	3562	6247	175.38%
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Tenant-based rental assistance / Rapid Rehousing	Households Assisted	270	39	14.44%	69	11	15.94%
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Homeless Person Overnight Shelter	Persons Assisted	8150	3943	48.38%	1720	1870	108.72%

Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Homelessness Prevention	Persons Assisted	26	44	169.23%	50	18	36.00%
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Other	Other	0	0		406	176	43.35%
Increase Incomes	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	200	130	65.00%			
Increase Incomes	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	0	0		190	175	92.11%
Infrastructure Improvements	Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	1000	0	0.00%			
Neighborhood Revitalization	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0		5986	0	0.00%

Neighborhood Revitalization	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0		75	0	0.00%
Neighborhood Revitalization	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Buildings Demolished	Buildings	5	0	0.00%	7	0	0.00%
Public Services	Homeless Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	17500	4842	27.67%	1225	175	14.29%
Staff Administration	Affordable Housing Public Housing Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Other	Other	1	1	100.00%	1	1	100.00%
Transportation Access	Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	50	0	0.00%			

Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date

Assess how the jurisdiction’s use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.

Housing continues to be a major concern in Duluth, as public agencies who assist people experiencing homelessness a other housing crises lack affordable housing units within the City. The vacancy rate is usually under 4% for market rate rentals and under 1% for public housing, restricting renter options and creating pent up demand. [In 2021, the city’s vacancy rate for public housing was 4.25% and the overall vacancy rate for rental units was 2.1%. Because the options for affordable rental units are so few, the waiting list for subsidized housing averaged over 1,000 people during 2021.] The City recently approved the Imagine Duluth 2035 Comprehensive Plan to in part address housing and will work closely with housing agencies, sub-recipients, and the Housing and Redevelopment Authority of Duluth to achieve the goals listed in the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan and subsequent Annual Action Plans. A primary focus will be the construction of new affordable rental units and housing rehabilitation.

The COVID-19 pandemic and supply chain delays continued to delay several construction projects in 2021, but the city was able to begin catching up on housing projects that had been postponed in 2020. The newly completed Decker Dwellings project added 42 affordable units to Duluth’s rental stock. Two rental building rehabilitation projects that had been postponed in 2020 were completed in 2022, adding a total of 48 units to the city’s stock. All told, the city added 212 units to its stock in 2022. Rehabilitation work also continued or began on 90 additional units. Housing is and will continue to be addressed in the Actions Plans. In addition, Burke and Redruth were able to complete rehab, resulting in 38 rehab units for very low income households.

CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	CDBG	HOME	ESG
White	11,562	27	1,147
Black or African American	2,830	28	364
Asian	163	0	10
American Indian or American Native	5,595	22	598
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	33	0	7
Total	20,183	77	2,126
Hispanic	39	0	0
Not Hispanic	20,144	77	2,126

Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds

Narrative

The information in the above chart is not complete and does not accurately represent the population. Due to a computer system error in the IDIS system, the chart does not list: American Indian/Alaska Native & White; Asian & White; Black/African American & White; American Indian/Alaska Native & White; and Other Multi-Racial information. In addition, the ESG demographics have not been fully represented due to this issue. For the entitlement funding, there were 32,673 people served. The additional CV funds were used to provide assistance to 8933 people, the racial data is also not represented in the chart above.

According to the 2016-2019 American Community Survey the racial demographic breakdown in Duluth is 89.7% White, 2.3% Black or African American, 1.8% American Indian or American Native, 1.6% Asian or Pacific Islander and the remaining percentage is people who are other race or more than one race. CDBG and HOME funds assisted the racial and ethnic groups with the percentages: 54% White, 21% Black or African American, and 23% American Indian or American Native; and less than 1% of funds assisted other racial groups.

CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)

Identify the resources made available

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	public - federal	27,172,495	3,549,369
HOME	public - federal	565,149	610,751
ESG	public - federal	206,941	172,900

Table 3 - Resources Made Available

Narrative

For the CDBG and HOME funds, more funds were expended than what was received for the 2021 Action Plan. The reason for this difference is that the multifamily development and rehab projects (ie- Decker Dwelling, Burk Apartments, Reduth Apartments, and Birchwood) were received 2020 funds, but due to COVID stalled. These projects were completed in the spring of 2022, therefore the allocated funds were also spent in the spring of 2022. CR-15 does not include the CV funds, of which an additional \$1,927,758 in CDBG-CV was allocated to the City and as of this date, \$1,559,432.57 has been spent and \$369,325.43 remains. These funds are planned to be spent in 2022. An additional \$1,972,199 of ESG-CV funds was allocated to the City; \$1,234,935.12 has been spent; and the remaining \$737,263.88 is allocated to be spent during the summer of 2022. The activities associated to the CV funds are attached in the Administration Section of the CAPER.

Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description

Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Narrative

Funds were appropriately spent for the 2021 Program Year. Although the amount expended on Public Services exceeded the 15% limitation, it was allowable due to the overage being allocated towards CBDO agencies. SOAR Career Solutions and Life House are qualified Community Based Development Organization (CBDO) that conducts job training activities under the Economic Development category. Projects High-Demand, Living-Wage Job Training Program received \$190,139 and Futures Program received \$50,037 to conduct job training. Under the HUD regulations 24 CFR 570.204, CBDO's are exempted from the HUD Public Service Cap, therefore (\$240,176) is exempted from the CDBG cap.

Leveraging

Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.

In 2021, Agencies provided a total of \$12,634,790 in matching funds. The breakdown of those matching funds includes:

Private Funds: \$4,993,656

Other Public Funds: \$7,641,134

The agencies submitted funding match numbers for the ESG activities and the agencies exceeded the 50/50 match requirement.

No publicly owned land or property was used during 2021 to address the needs identified in the plan.

Fiscal Year Summary – HOME Match	
1. Excess match from prior Federal fiscal year	9,375,851
2. Match contributed during current Federal fiscal year	1,850,000
3. Total match available for current Federal fiscal year (Line 1 plus Line 2)	11,225,851
4. Match liability for current Federal fiscal year	100,713
5. Excess match carried over to next Federal fiscal year (Line 3 minus Line 4)	11,125,138

Table 5 – Fiscal Year Summary - HOME Match Report

Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year								
Project No. or Other ID	Date of Contribution	Cash (non-Federal sources)	Foregone Taxes, Fees, Charges	Appraised Land/Real Property	Required Infrastructure	Site Preparation, Construction Materials, Donated labor	Bond Financing	Total Match
One Roof CLT New Acquisition Rehab	04/01/2021	1,850,000	0	0	0	0	0	1,850,000

Table 6 – Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year

HOME MBE/WBE report

Program Income – Enter the program amounts for the reporting period				
Balance on hand at begin-ning of reporting period \$	Amount received during reporting period \$	Total amount expended during reporting period \$	Amount expended for TBRA \$	Balance on hand at end of reporting period \$
17,690	0	17,690	0	0

Table 7 – Program Income

Minority Business Enterprises and Women Business Enterprises – Indicate the number and dollar value of contracts for HOME projects completed during the reporting period						
	Total	Minority Business Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Contracts						
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sub-Contracts						
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Total	Women Business Enterprises	Male			
Contracts						
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			
Number	0	0	0			
Sub-Contracts						
Number	0	0	0			
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			

Table 8 - Minority Business and Women Business Enterprises

Minority Owners of Rental Property – Indicate the number of HOME assisted rental property owners and the total amount of HOME funds in these rental properties assisted						
	Total	Minority Property Owners				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 9 – Minority Owners of Rental Property

Relocation and Real Property Acquisition – Indicate the number of persons displaced, the cost of relocation payments, the number of parcels acquired, and the cost of acquisition						
Parcels Acquired		0		0		
Businesses Displaced		0		0		
Nonprofit Organizations Displaced		0		0		
Households Temporarily Relocated, not Displaced		0		0		
Households Displaced	Total	Minority Property Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Cost	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 10 – Relocation and Real Property Acquisition

CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	5,267	8,281
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	141	246
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	557	838
Total	5,965	9,365

Table 11 – Number of Households

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	116	13
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	2	89
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	115	59
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	24	7
Total	257	168

Table 12 – Number of Households Supported

Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.

COVID-19 impacted many of the goals. Housing production and public facilities projects slowed, therefore those goals for the 2021 Action Plan were not met. However, the multifamily development projects that were allocated funding in the 2020 Action Plan were able to be completed, therefore there were many new units added to the community.

In addition, the St. Louis County Continuum of Care received additional funding for rental assistance due to COVID-19; and the community used those funds for rental assistance, which reduced the need at the time for the City's rental assistance. Those additional COC funds have been spent or are not longer available and the City of Duluth expects to see a need for the rental assistance programs in 2022.

Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.

The City of Duluth expects to see an increase in housing and public facility accomplishments. The City also expects to see an increase in rental assistance and other programs that serve people who are homeless or have a high potential of becoming homeless.

Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.

Number of Households Served	CDBG Actual	HOME Actual
Extremely Low-income	30,158	11
Low-income	275	30
Moderate-income	51	8
Total	30,484	49

Table 13 – Number of Households Served

Narrative Information

HUD Defines extremely low-income are households are 0 to 30% of the area median income; Public Service activities served these households. Low-income households are 30 to 50% of the area median income, which were primarily assisted by Economic Development Activities and the new housing development projects (Decker Dwelling, Birchwood) and Rehab Projects (Burke and Redurth). Moderate to Low Income are 50 to 80% AMI, which were primarily served by Housing Activities.

CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)

Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:

Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs

During the 2021 program year, the City of Duluth funded CHUM's street outreach program to connect social workers with homeless youth and adults. Staff at CHUM go throughout Duluth looking for clients that could be sleeping under bridges, in abandoned buildings and homes, or living in the woods. Once staff are able to identify where clients are choosing to sleep, an evaluation of basic needs is completed and hygiene items, clothing, blankets, etc. are provided to clients that need them. At this point, it is determined if a case file will be created for the client in an effort to set goals and start working their way out of homelessness, or if the client chooses to not start a case file, the outreach worker continues to engage the client if that is something that they are open to. CHUM was able to connect with over 170 people.

The City of Duluth collaborated with St. Louis County and local homelessness service providers, such as CHUM and Loaves & Fishes during winter 2021 to operate a warming center to provide temporary shelter to people experiencing homelessness. St. Louis County provided local funding support to staff the warming center, and the City provided the space at a local community center as local match at no cost to the program. CHUM and Loaves & Fishes provided staff and logistics support to operate the warming center. 554 unique individuals used this facility from April 1, 2021 to March 31, 2022. The City granted \$487,172 to HRA/CHUM in ESG-CV funds to make this a permanent facility to assist people experiencing homelessness who need shelter during the cold months.

Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons

All emergency shelter and transitional housing options funded by the City of Duluth participate in Coordinated Entry as a part of the Saint Louis County Continuum of Care Program. The City of Duluth, in addition to using ESG Flex Funds (emergency assistance to clients facing eviction, or in need of rental deposit assistance), leverages funds from Saint Louis County's FHPAP program to assist individuals and families access housing or remain in their homes. The 2021 program goal was to assist many individuals or families during the program year. Flex funds are provided to people in need through case management at ESG contract agencies. Case managers meet weekly to prioritize service need and determine if ESG would be an appropriate funding source to assist their client stay with housing stability so they will not become homeless.

Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care

facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs

Through CDBG Public Service funds, the City of Duluth supports a plethora of services that address housing, health, social services, employment, and youth needs. CHUM, Damiano Center, and The Salvation Army provide food access across Duluth through food pantries and on-site meals. MACV provides case management to veterans and their families. Life House provides a drop in center for homeless and at-risk youth. Safe Haven provides shelter for those experiencing domestic violence. Overall, the City of Duluth works with over 20 different programs to provide critical public services to LMI families in the community. The 2020 COVID-19 Pandemic created unfortunate circumstances for many people at risk of becoming homeless, fortunately the City of Duluth was able to use ESG-CV dollars to provide additional assistance.

Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again

In coordination with the Saint Louis County Continuum of Care (CoC), the City of Duluth funds a portion of the Coordinated Entry Coordinator who manages the CoC waitlist, works with sub recipients to input data into HMIS correctly, in addition to ensuring that the hardest to house (individuals with a VISPDAT scores of 12-17) are housed as soon as units become available. To further shorten the time of those experiencing homelessness, sub recipients, the City of Duluth, and the Saint Louis County CoC established a monthly meeting where all participating agencies, in addition to United Way's 211 program staff, meet to discuss any client housing issues, share success stories, and work as a cohort to ensure the system works well. Providing this opportunity allows consistent partnership and new staff training, while simultaneously correcting systemic issues and improving the overall process.

CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)

Actions taken to address the needs of public housing

The City of Duluth does not spend any CDBG, HOME or ESG funds to address the needs of Public Housing. The Duluth HRA utilizes various other resources to keep public housing units in good repair through its use of its annual HUD Capital Fund grant, occasional use of energy performance contracting, and use of general obligation bond funded loans provided by the Minnesota Housing Finance Agency, when appropriated by the state legislature. The HRA has also used its local levy resources to augment such funds when needed.

Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership

HRA has regular meetings during the year with its Resident Advisory Board (RAB) and also promotes resident attendance at high rise resident club meetings. Staff are made available to attend Club meetings as warranted and requested. The HRA also has a self-sufficiency program and a Section 8 Homeownership program, both of which were promoted during the year. The HRA also has a Public Housing Outreach program which provides various information and referral of interest to residents on a regular basis.

Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs

NA

CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)

Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)

The City supports proactive removal of blighted or vacant buildings through thoughtful and selective demolition. Sites unfit for redevelopment due to location (e.g., located in a flood zone), are left free of buildings and other impervious surfaces to provide open space and prevent cyclical building degradation. Waste is removed on sites with redevelopment potential.

CDBG- and HOME-funded rehab projects were completed during Program Year 2021, with all code and lead-based paint issues addressed, and the resulting housing units assessed for healthy home deficiencies.

Vacant properties in LMI neighborhoods: One Roof Community Housing acquired, rehabbed, and sold formerly vacant or foreclosed properties in the Central and East Hillside, Lincoln Park, and West Duluth neighborhoods. These properties are systematically enrolled in One Roof's Community Land Trust program, which preserves long-term housing affordability while encouraging homeownership.

Energy requirements: Energy efficiency was increased by weatherization rehab projects in existing homes. Lessening the burden of energy costs for LMI people contributes to overall affordability.

TBRA for "hard-to-house": HOME funds were used to provide rental subsidies.

Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

CDBG funds were utilized for the Tenant Landlord Connection, which provides services to landlords and tenants. Services include: education on fair housing rules, responsible renting, lead based paint hazards, education on rights and responsibilities, and mediation between landlords and tenants. These services help alleviate homelessness by mediating disputes, and thereby reducing the number of evictions of individuals and families. The Salvation Army's Landlord Incentive program continued in Program Year 2021, assisting landlords who rent units to people who have been incarcerated. This program will be continued in the next Action Plan. HOME funds provided tenant based rental assistance for homeless, formerly homeless, and "hard to house" persons. This assistance is part of the Coordinated Entry system in Duluth, which involves several partners addressing homeless.

Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The City partnered with the Duluth Housing and Redevelopment Authority to work to reduce lead-based paint hazards. The HRA's staff during this period included a number of lead-certified inspectors, which allowed for a timely and thorough review of lead-based paint risks in affordable housing projects.

Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The City collaborated with partners to review services for families that might be experiencing or were at risk of poverty. Through strong partnerships with sub-recipients; Center City Housing Corporation and CHUM, services were provided to at-risk families at Steve O’Neil Apartments and the CHUM Shelter. Additional services of youth programming and food were provided through the Neighborhood Youth Services (NYS) JET Food program. The City worked with its affordable housing providers to consider future options for family supportive housing. CDBG funds supported SOAR Career Solutions, who administered the Duluth at Work collaborative, which helps low income people to receive training, get hired, and increase their income. Duluth at Work is being reimaged through coordination with the Workforce Development Department for the program year in order to best serve low to moderate income people. Additionally, Entrepreneur Fund assists low-income business owners to increase their revenue.

Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Duluth’s Tenant Landlord Connection (TLC) is managed and staffed by One Roof Community Housing. The TLC educates existing and potential landlords and tenants of their respective rights and responsibilities; it mediates disputes, helps work to avoid evictions whenever possible, provides Ready-to-Rent classes for hopeful tenants looking to improve their or establish their rental history, and refers individuals experiencing discrimination to fair housing resources. Furthermore, the Salvation Army through their Landlord Incentive program works with landlords to address structural issues in the housing market for those with criminal backgrounds and searching for housing.

Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Duluth’s Tenant Landlord Connection (TLC) is managed and staffed by One Roof Community Housing Organization. The TLC educates existing and potential landlords and tenants of their respective rights and responsibilities; it mediates disputes, helps work to avoid evictions whenever possible, provides Ready-to-Rent classes for hopeful tenants looking to improve upon or establish their rental history, and refers individuals experiencing discrimination to fair housing resources. Furthermore, the Salvation Army through their Landlord Incentive program works with landlords to address structural issues in the housing market for those with criminal backgrounds searching for housing.

Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)

In 2020, the City updated the Fair Housing Plan by conducting a new Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice. The study reported four major impediments to fair housing choice, and created unique implementation strategies throughout the five year consolidated plan period. The four major impediments identified were: exclusionary rental housing practices and policies directed at Section 8 Housing Choice voucher holders, exclusionary rental housing practices and policies directed at persons with criminal backgrounds, involuntary displacement and limited housing choice caused by

gentrification, and policies and physical limitations in the built environment. Strategies developed in response to these impediments include campaigns to work with local partners and landlords to incentivize more inclusive rental policies, while implementing tracking mechanisms that measure sources of displacement for more informed policy changes to properly address these issues. The City continued to fund the Tenant Landlord Connection (TLC) and Landlord Incentive Program to help address fair housing concerns. In Program Year 2021, the City worked with the HRA to assess their Section 8 housing voucher program to make it more accessible to landlords so there is less discrimination based on voucher status. The City's Human Rights Officer provides residents with information about their rights regarding fair and accessible housing. The City has a Human Rights Commission, a Commission on Disabilities, and Community Planning Committee, all of which discuss affordable housing needs on a regular basis.

During the Imagine Duluth 2035 comprehensive planning process, the City actively engaged with both stakeholders and residents to develop long-range strategies pertaining to housing access. The Duluth 2035 plan was adopted on June 25, 2018 and included two new principles relating to fair housing, "Develop a healthy community" and "Integrate fairness into the fabric of the community." These guiding principles are utilized in the review of development projects to insure the decision making process includes people of all backgrounds, including those of the federally protected classes. These principles have been incorporated into the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan process.

CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230

Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements

All CDBG, HOME and ESG funded programs receive this type of monitoring based upon a risk assessment. Every individual community development project is monitored annually. This is done through either a program desk monitoring or by an on-site monitoring that inspects and reviews client records using the HUD Monitoring spreadsheets. In addition, annually, a financial monitoring is conducted on all of the agencies through audit reports. During onsite visits, staff verifies that program activities are meeting a national objective, serving homeless people, operating rental properties within rent and income limits, and that funds are expended appropriately on eligible activities. Staff also reviews the Agency's policies and procedures, including their communication and outreach plans. Specific activities, such as the Entrepreneur Fund actively outreaches to minority owned businesses to include them in their business co-hort. HRA, One Roof and Eco 3 participate in the MBWE programs. The Imagine Duluth 2035 Comprehensive Plan was adopted on June 25 of 2018 and it includes principles to insure fair housing and equity.

Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)

Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.

A public notice about the 2021 CAPER was published on June 4, 2022 in the Duluth News Tribune. The draft 2021 CAPER is available on the City's Website. A public hearing on the 2021 CAPER and the agencies performance was held at meeting open to the public on June 21, 2022. Agencies and public attended this meeting.

CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)

Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction's program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.

Based on community input and housing data, the Committee chose to continue recommending a stronger funding focus on affordable housing in 2021. This was to meet the needs that were identified during community input through the Imagine Duluth 2035 Comprehensive Plan process in addition to the annual community needs survey, and other input opportunities held throughout the year.

Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?

No

[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.

CR-50 - HOME 91.520(d)

Include the results of on-site inspections of affordable rental housing assisted under the program to determine compliance with housing codes and other applicable regulations

Please list those projects that should have been inspected on-site this program year based upon the schedule in §92.504(d). Indicate which of these were inspected and a summary of issues that were detected during the inspection. For those that were not inspected, please indicate the reason and how you will remedy the situation.

Eleven rental properties that received HOME funds are still within their respective affordability periods. The City of Duluth tracks a project at the following milestones: initial project approval, during construction, at construction completion, and the subsequent monitoring visits in compliance with HOME regulations.

The Housing and Redevelopment Authority of Duluth, Minnesota (HRA) is contracted to provide building inspection services, with Certified Building Inspectors and Lead-based Paint Assessors. There were six rental buildings that were inspected: Gimaajii, Burke Apartments, New San Marco, Steve O'Neil, Homes on the Hill, and Garfield Square.

All units and buildings have passed the required inspection for the HOME Program, and are in compliance, with the exception of Homes on the Hill 11 W 5th Street. This unit had a loose toilet that was subsequently repaired and the unit is in compliance.

The remaining properties participated in virtual monitoring and submitted documentation demonstrating compliance. These properties are scheduled for on-site monitoring in 2023 and 2024.

Provide an assessment of the jurisdiction's affirmative marketing actions for HOME units. 92.351(b)

Agencies receiving HOME funds are required to submit an Affirmative Marketing Plan to the City of Duluth at which time it is reviewed for consistency, fairness, and to ensure that programs are adequately marketed to community members.

Refer to IDIS reports to describe the amount and use of program income for projects, including the number of projects and owner and tenant characteristics

Describe other actions taken to foster and maintain affordable housing. 91.220(k) (STATES ONLY: Including the coordination of LIHTC with the development of affordable housing). 91.320(j)

Recognizing the need for gap financing for affordable housing projects, the City of Duluth works with Developers seeking Low Income Housing Tax Credits from the State of Minnesota. The City coordinates proposal review in partnership with St. Louis County Health and Human Services Division Staff, the HRA, and the Affordable Housing Coalition of Duluth. Projects that meet local housing priorities are presented to Duluth City Council for project support; which is included with Developers applications to MN Housing. In 2021, four Developers sought Duluth Council support for 2022 Round 1 Tax Credits.

Additionally, the City of Duluth works with local Developers to support Tax Abatement or Tax Increment Financing when appropriate to assist mixed-income housing development. When public assistance is utilized, the City of Duluth negotiates a number of units to be rent restricted/affordable units.

CR-58 – Section 3

Identify the number of individuals assisted and the types of assistance provided

Total Labor Hours	CDBG	HOME	ESG	HOPWA	HTF
Total Number of Activities	0	0	0	0	0
Total Labor Hours	0				
Total Section 3 Worker Hours	0				
Total Targeted Section 3 Worker Hours	0				

Table 14 – Total Labor Hours

Qualitative Efforts - Number of Activities by Program	CDBG	HOME	ESG	HOPWA	HTF
Outreach efforts to generate job applicants who are Public Housing Targeted Workers					
Outreach efforts to generate job applicants who are Other Funding Targeted Workers.					
Direct, on-the job training (including apprenticeships).					
Indirect training such as arranging for, contracting for, or paying tuition for, off-site training.					
Technical assistance to help Section 3 workers compete for jobs (e.g., resume assistance, coaching).					
Outreach efforts to identify and secure bids from Section 3 business concerns.	0				
Technical assistance to help Section 3 business concerns understand and bid on contracts.					
Division of contracts into smaller jobs to facilitate participation by Section 3 business concerns.					
Provided or connected residents with assistance in seeking employment including: drafting resumes,preparing for interviews, finding job opportunities, connecting residents to job placement services.					
Held one or more job fairs.					
Provided or connected residents with supportive services that can provide direct services or referrals.					
Provided or connected residents with supportive services that provide one or more of the following: work readiness health screenings, interview clothing, uniforms, test fees, transportation.					
Assisted residents with finding child care.					
Assisted residents to apply for, or attend community college or a four year educational institution.					
Assisted residents to apply for, or attend vocational/technical training.					
Assisted residents to obtain financial literacy training and/or coaching.					
Bonding assistance, guaranties, or other efforts to support viable bids from Section 3 business concerns.					
Provided or connected residents with training on computer use or online technologies.					
Promoting the use of a business registry designed to create opportunities for disadvantaged and small businesses.					
Outreach, engagement, or referrals with the state one-stop system, as designed in Section 121(e)(2) of the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act.					

Other.					
--------	--	--	--	--	--

Table 15 – Qualitative Efforts - Number of Activities by Program

Narrative

Section 3 requirements apply to all contractors and subcontractors receiving contracts or subcontracts for covered funds in excess of \$200,000 to complete a Section 3 Project. A project is the site or sites together with any building(s) and improvements located on the site(s) that are under common ownership, management, and financing.

Prior to November 30, 2020 the Section 3 goals were related to hiring people who met the definition of Section 3 worker. The new regulations is the shift away from tracking new hires of low-income persons and instead tracking the labor hours performed by low-income persons. The goal it to recognize sustained employment rather than short-term hiring.

Guidance published by the Department of Housing and Urban Development Office of Field Policy and Management for Section 3 states that contracts executed and funds committed prior to November 30, 2020 are required to adhere to the requirements of the old rule. For projects that receive funding after November 30, 2020 but before July 1, 2021, they are subject to the new Section 3 rules, however reporting was transitional. City Staff required agencies to submit Section 3 reports for PY 2021, however due to the change in metrics for the program, the records are not complete. The new reporting will be in IDIS for the FY 2022 projects and reported in 2022 CAPER.

CR-60 - ESG 91.520(g) (ESG Recipients only)

ESG Supplement to the CAPER in *e-snaps*

For Paperwork Reduction Act

1. Recipient Information—All Recipients Complete

Basic Grant Information

Recipient Name	DULUTH
Organizational DUNS Number	077627883
UEI	
EIN/TIN Number	416005105
Identify the Field Office	MINNEAPOLIS
Identify CoC(s) in which the recipient or subrecipient(s) will provide ESG assistance	Duluth/Saint Louis County CoC

ESG Contact Name

Prefix Mr
First Name Steven
Middle Name
Last Name Robertson
Suffix
Title Interim Manager

ESG Contact Address

Street Address 1 411 W 1st Street B
Street Address 2
City Duluth
State MN
ZIP Code -
Phone Number 2187305295
Extension
Fax Number
Email Address Srobertson@duluthmn.gov

ESG Secondary Contact

Prefix Mr
First Name Adam
Last Name Fulton
Suffix
Title Manager
Phone Number 2187305325
Extension
Email Address Afulton@duluthmn.gov

2. Reporting Period—All Recipients Complete

Program Year Start Date 04/01/2021
Program Year End Date 03/31/2022

3a. Subrecipient Form – Complete one form for each subrecipient

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: CENTER CITY HOUSING CORP

City: Duluth

State: MN

Zip Code: 55801, 0039

DUNS Number:

UEI:

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: N

Subrecipient Organization Type: Other Non-Profit Organization

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 24870

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: LIFE HOUSE

City: Duluth

State: MN

Zip Code: 55802, 2003

DUNS Number:

UEI:

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: N

Subrecipient Organization Type: Other Non-Profit Organization

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 31834

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: SALVATION ARMY (DULUTH)

City: Duluth

State: MN

Zip Code: 55806, 1802

DUNS Number:

UEI:

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: N

Subrecipient Organization Type: Other Non-Profit Organization

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 8456

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: MN Assistance Council for Veterans

City: St. Paul

State: MN

Zip Code: ,

DUNS Number: 137825696

UEI:

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: N

Subrecipient Organization Type: Other Non-Profit Organization

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 3134

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: Churches United in Ministry (CHUM)

City: Duluth

State: MN

Zip Code: 55802, 2017

DUNS Number: 032768371

UEI:

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: N

Subrecipient Organization Type: Other Non-Profit Organization

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 36808

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: Safe Haven

City: Duluth

State: MN

Zip Code: 55803, 3558

DUNS Number: 134306125

UEI:

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: Y

Subrecipient Organization Type: Other Non-Profit Organization

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 18901

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: Housing and Redevelopment Authority of Duluth

City: Duluth

State: MN

Zip Code: 55805, 1807

DUNS Number: 010351005

UEI:

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: N

Subrecipient Organization Type: Unit of Government

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 63420

CR-65 - Persons Assisted

4. Persons Served

4a. Complete for Homelessness Prevention Activities

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	3
Children	3
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	6

Table 16 – Household Information for Homeless Prevention Activities

4b. Complete for Rapid Re-Housing Activities

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	28
Children	15
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	43

Table 17 – Household Information for Rapid Re-Housing Activities

4c. Complete for Shelter

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	550
Children	3
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	553

Table 18 – Shelter Information

4d. Street Outreach

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	175
Children	1
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	176

Table 19 – Household Information for Street Outreach

4e. Totals for all Persons Served with ESG

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	2,040
Children	370
Don't Know/Refused/Other	3
Missing Information	0
Total	2,413

Table 20 – Household Information for Persons Served with ESG

5. Gender—Complete for All Activities

	Total
Male	1,300
Female	1,085
Transgender	21
Don't Know/Refused/Other	7
Missing Information	0
Total	2,413

Table 21 – Gender Information

6. Age—Complete for All Activities

	Total
Under 18	370
18-24	189
25 and over	2,038
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	2,597

Table 22 – Age Information

7. Special Populations Served—Complete for All Activities

Number of Persons in Households

Subpopulation	Total	Total Persons Served – Prevention	Total Persons Served – RRH	Total Persons Served in Emergency Shelters
Veterans	102	0	0	102
Victims of Domestic Violence	532	0	0	532
Elderly	99	0	0	99
HIV/AIDS	17	0	0	0
Chronically Homeless	803	0	0	803
Persons with Disabilities:				
Severely Mentally Ill	1,318	0	0	0
Chronic Substance Abuse	363	0	0	0
Other Disability	779	0	0	0
Total (Unduplicated if possible)	0	0	0	0

Table 23 – Special Population Served

CR-70 – ESG 91.520(g) - Assistance Provided and Outcomes

10. Shelter Utilization

Number of New Units - Rehabbed	0
Number of New Units - Conversion	0
Total Number of bed-nights available	1,700
Total Number of bed-nights provided	1,700
Capacity Utilization	100.00%

Table 24 – Shelter Capacity

11. Project Outcomes Data measured under the performance standards developed in consultation with the CoC(s)

City of Duluth ESG funds are used for two overnight shelters, CHUM and Safe Haven. Both of these agencies exceeded their goals. These agencies are part of the St. Louis County COC and comply with all the required performance standards.

CR-75 – Expenditures

11. Expenditures

11a. ESG Expenditures for Homelessness Prevention

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2019	2020	2021
Expenditures for Rental Assistance	0	25,273	15,771
Expenditures for Housing Relocation and Stabilization Services - Financial Assistance	0	0	0
Expenditures for Housing Relocation & Stabilization Services - Services	0	0	0
Expenditures for Homeless Prevention under Emergency Shelter Grants Program	0	0	0
Subtotal Homelessness Prevention	0	25,273	15,771

Table 25 – ESG Expenditures for Homelessness Prevention

11b. ESG Expenditures for Rapid Re-Housing

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2019	2020	2021
Expenditures for Rental Assistance	0	16,848	7,495
Expenditures for Housing Relocation and Stabilization Services - Financial Assistance	0	0	0
Expenditures for Housing Relocation & Stabilization Services - Services	0	0	0
Expenditures for Homeless Assistance under Emergency Shelter Grants Program	0	0	0
Subtotal Rapid Re-Housing	0	16,848	7,495

Table 26 – ESG Expenditures for Rapid Re-Housing

11c. ESG Expenditures for Emergency Shelter

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2019	2020	2021
Essential Services	0	0	97,352
Operations	0	0	0
Renovation	0	0	0

Major Rehab	0	0	0
Conversion	0	0	0
Subtotal	0	0	97,352

Table 27 – ESG Expenditures for Emergency Shelter

11d. Other Grant Expenditures

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2019	2020	2021
Street Outreach	0	15,000	12,883
HMIS	0	0	0
Administration	0	0	0

Table 28 - Other Grant Expenditures

11e. Total ESG Grant Funds

Total ESG Funds Expended	2019	2020	2021
	0	57,121	133,501

Table 29 - Total ESG Funds Expended

11f. Match Source

	2019	2020	2021
Other Non-ESG HUD Funds	0	0	0
Other Federal Funds	0	0	2,334,529
State Government	0	0	0
Local Government	0	0	0

Private Funds	0	0	133,501
Other	0	0	0
Fees	0	0	0
Program Income	0	0	0
Total Match Amount	0	0	2,468,030

Table 30 - Other Funds Expended on Eligible ESG Activities

11g. Total

Total Amount of Funds Expended on ESG Activities	2019	2020	2021
	0	57,121	2,601,531

Table 31 - Total Amount of Funds Expended on ESG Activities