



# **City of Duluth Minnesota**

---

## **Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report -- Fiscal Year 2020 --**

**Year 1 of the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan for Housing  
and Community Development**

---

# Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report FY 2020

---

The preparation of this document was financed through a Community  
Development Block Grant from the Department of  
Housing and Urban Development  
through the Housing and Community Development Act of  
1974 as amended.

## CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

### Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)

This could be an overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the program year.

The City of Duluth 2020 Program year began on April 1, 2020 and ended on March 31, 2021. The President, by Proclamation 9994, declared a national emergency concerning the coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic on March 13, 2020. The Governor of Minnesota issued an Emergency Executive Order (20-99) restricting activities outside the home and limiting social interactions for the health, safety, and security of people. These restrictions impacted some goals, especially those related to construction. The regular duties of contractors and inspectors were limited, impacting the start of rental rehab projects, delaying rental unit construction, and reducing the number of homeowner rehab projects. Neighborhood revitalization projects were also not started. The pandemic created a greater need for community services than anticipated. Local agencies that provide shelter, food, and other services were faced with an increase in demand; therefore, those accomplishments were exceeded. To assist with community needs resulting from the pandemic, Congress and President Trump signed the Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security Act, also known as the CARES Act, which provided additional CDBG and ESG funding to the City of Duluth to assist people negatively impacted by the pandemic. Those funds and accomplishments were allocated separate and therefore not part of the 2020 Action Plan or this 2020 CAPER Report. City Staff have attached an addendum to describe how CARES Act funds assisted the Duluth community.

### Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee’s program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Rental units constructed	Household Housing Unit	250	0	0.00%	72	0	0.00%

Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	500	11	2.20%	149	11	7.38%
Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	50	8	16.00%	8	8	100.00%
Affordable Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	500	18	3.60%	90	18	20.00%
Childcare Access	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	500	80	16.00%	100	80	80.00%
Create Living Wage Jobs	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Businesses assisted	Businesses Assisted	70	16	22.86%	16	16	100.00%
Food Access	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	85250	20587	24.15%	17050	20587	120.74%
Health Services	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	1000	0	0.00%			

Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Public service activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	15000	4083	27.22%	3011	4083	135.60%
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Tenant-based rental assistance / Rapid Rehousing	Households Assisted	270	26	9.63%	26	26	100.00%
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Homeless Person Overnight Shelter	Persons Assisted	8150	2073	25.44%	1600	2073	129.56%
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Homelessness Prevention	Persons Assisted	26	26	100.00%	26	26	100.00%
Increase Incomes	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	200	37	18.50%	41	37	90.24%
Infrastructure Improvements	Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	1000	0	0.00%			

Neighborhood Revitalization	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0		10200	0	0.00%
Neighborhood Revitalization	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Buildings Demolished	Buildings	5	0	0.00%			
Public Services	Homeless Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	17500	2195	12.54%	1865	2195	117.69%
Staff Administration	Affordable Housing Public Housing Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$ / ESG: \$	Other	Other	1	1	100.00%	1	1	100.00%
Transportation Access	Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	50	0	0.00%			

**Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date**

**Assess how the jurisdiction’s use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.**

Housing continues to be a major concern in Duluth, as public agencies who assist people experiencing homelessness or other housing crises lack affordable housing units within the City. The vacancy rate is usually under 4% for market rate rentals and under 1% for public housing, restricting renter options and creating pent up demand. The City recently approved the Imagine Duluth 2035 Comprehensive Plan to in part address housing and will work closely with housing agencies, sub-recipients, and the Housing and Redevelopment Authority of Duluth to achieve the goals listed in the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan and subsequent Annual Action Plans. A primary focus will be the construction of new affordable rental units and housing rehabilitation. Two projects in 2020 program year- Decker Dwellings (42 units) and Birchwood Apartments (30 units), were able to start in 2020; despite initial delays due to the pandemic. There were three rental building rehab projects (Burke, Redruth, and Pine Grove/Superview), a total of 87 units, that have not started due to the pandemic. Housing is and will continue to be addressed in the Actions Plans.

## CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	CDBG	HOME	ESG
White	13,359	21	817
Black or African American	5,225	1	311
Asian	213	0	8
American Indian or American Native	5,545	0	346
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	200	0	2
<b>Total</b>	<b>24,542</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>1,484</b>
Hispanic	151	0	48
Not Hispanic	24,391	22	1,436

Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds

### Narrative

The information in the above chart is not complete and does not accurately represent the population. Due to a computer system error in the IDIS system, the chart does not list: American Indian/Alaska Native & White (517 people); Asian & White (13 people); Black/African American & White (446 people); American Indian/Alaska Native & Black 466 people; and Other Multi-Racial information (information not available). It is possible that some people received service from more than one CDBG funded activity, therefore the numbers could contain duplicated information. There is an additional 470 people that were assisted with ESG that did not contain demographic information.

According to the 2016-2019 American Community Survey the racial demographic breakdown in Duluth is 89.7% White, 2.3% Black or African American, 1.8% American Indian or American Native, 1.6% Asian or Pacific Islander and the remaining percentage is people who are other race or more than one race. CDBG and HOME funds assisted the racial and ethnic groups with the percentages: 54% White, 21% Black or African American, and 23% American Indian or American Native; and less than 1% of funds assisted other racial groups.



## CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)

### Identify the resources made available

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	public - federal	2,426,160	3,553,246
HOME	public - federal	549,634	514,594
ESG	public - federal	208,704	219,308

**Table 3 - Resources Made Available**

### Narrative

Funds were appropriately spent for the 2020 Program Year. Although the amount expended on Public Services exceeded the 15% limitation, it was allowable due to the overage being allocated towards the SOAR Career Solutions Duluth At Work project.

SOAR Career Solutions is a qualified Community Based Development Organization (CBDO) that conducts job training activities under the Economic Development category. The project Duluth at Work Collaborative received \$272,000 to conduct job training for 41 candidates. Under the HUD regulations 24 CFR 570.204, CBDO's are exempted from the HUD Public Service Cap.

### Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description

**Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments**

### Narrative

## Leveraging

**Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.**

In 2020, Agencies provided a total of \$11,021,756 in matching funds. The breakdown of those matching funds includes:

Other Federal Funds: \$1,756,837

State/Local Funds: \$1,411,650

Private Funds: \$1,386,690

Other Funds: \$6,466,579

The agencies submitted funding match numbers for the ESG activities and the agencies exceeded the 50/50 match requirement.

No publicly owned land or property was used during 2020 to address the needs identified in the plan.

<b>Fiscal Year Summary – HOME Match</b>	
1. Excess match from prior Federal fiscal year	8,613,901
2. Match contributed during current Federal fiscal year	9,375,851
3. Total match available for current Federal fiscal year (Line 1 plus Line 2)	17,989,752
4. Match liability for current Federal fiscal year	2,375,851
5. Excess match carried over to next Federal fiscal year (Line 3 minus Line 4)	15,613,901

**Table 5 – Fiscal Year Summary - HOME Match Report**

Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year								
Project No. or Other ID	Date of Contribution	Cash (non-Federal sources)	Foregone Taxes, Fees, Charges	Appraised Land/Real Property	Required Infrastructure	Site Preparation, Construction Materials, Donated labor	Bond Financing	Total Match
Birchwood Apartments	04/01/2020	6,692,000	0	0	0	0	0	6,692,000
One Roof CLT New Acquisition Rehab	04/01/2020	1,850,000	0	0	0	0	0	1,850,000

Table 6 – Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year

**HOME MBE/WBE report**

Program Income – Enter the program amounts for the reporting period				
Balance on hand at begin-ning of reporting period \$	Amount received during reporting period \$	Total amount expended during reporting period \$	Amount expended for TBRA \$	Balance on hand at end of reporting period \$
62,000	0	0	0	62,000

Table 7 – Program Income

<b>Minority Business Enterprises and Women Business Enterprises – Indicate the number and dollar value of contracts for HOME projects completed during the reporting period</b>						
	Total	Minority Business Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
<b>Contracts</b>						
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
<b>Sub-Contracts</b>						
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Total	Women Business Enterprises	Male			
<b>Contracts</b>						
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			
Number	0	0	0			
<b>Sub-Contracts</b>						
Number	0	0	0			
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			

**Table 8 - Minority Business and Women Business Enterprises**

<b>Minority Owners of Rental Property – Indicate the number of HOME assisted rental property owners and the total amount of HOME funds in these rental properties assisted</b>						
	Total	Minority Property Owners				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0

**Table 9 – Minority Owners of Rental Property**

<b>Relocation and Real Property Acquisition</b> – Indicate the number of persons displaced, the cost of relocation payments, the number of parcels acquired, and the cost of acquisition						
Parcels Acquired		0		0		
Businesses Displaced		0		0		
Nonprofit Organizations Displaced		0		0		
Households Temporarily Relocated, not Displaced		0		0		
Households Displaced	Total	Minority Property Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Cost	0	0	0	0	0	0

**Table 10 – Relocation and Real Property Acquisition**

## CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	3,011	1,650
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	640	19
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	236	156
<b>Total</b>	<b>3,887</b>	<b>1,825</b>

**Table 11 – Number of Households**

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	50	52
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	72	0
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	165	29
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	8	8
<b>Total</b>	<b>295</b>	<b>89</b>

**Table 12 – Number of Households Supported**

**Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.**

The COVID-19 pandemic delayed construction on for the two rental projects -Decker Dwelling and Birchwood Apartments, which will add 72 units for low income households. Construction was also delayed for the rental rehab projects, especially due that people were living in these units; and could not be displaced during construction. Units that were vacant were able to be acquired and rehabbed, or just rehabbed during this time. Additionally, people experiencing homelessness is a priority in the

community, unfortunately the need exceeds what shelters can currently provide, displaying the need for new or larger capacity shelter facilities in Duluth.

**Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.**

The city is continuing to work with housing partners to build capacity, acquire other funding, and facilitate projects that result in more affordable housing. The Imagine Duluth 2035 Plan has adopted the Housing Action Framework which sets priorities and aligns partners.

**Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.**

<b>Number of Households Served</b>	<b>CDBG Actual</b>	<b>HOME Actual</b>
Extremely Low-income	0	16
Low-income	39	3
Moderate-income	7	5
<b>Total</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>24</b>

**Table 13 – Number of Households Served**

**Narrative Information**

HUD Defines extremely low-income are households are 0 to 30% of the area median income; low-income households are 30 to 50% of the area median income; and moderate-income are 50 to 80% area median income.

## **CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)**

**Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:**

### **Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs**

The City of Duluth collaborated with St. Louis County and local homelessness service providers, such as CHUM and Loaves & Fishes during winter 2020 to operate a warming center to provide temporary shelter to people experiencing homelessness. St. Louis County provided local funding support to staff the warming center, and the City provided the space at a local community center as local match at no cost to the program. CHUM and Loaves & Fishes provided staff and logistics support to operate the warming center. No federal funds were used. 566 unique individuals used this facility from November 2020 to March 2021. Last winter, starting November 2019 to spring 2020, it was the first year pilot for this warming center. It operated during extreme cold events, when temperatures were below 0 degrees Fahrenheit. The warming center was activated 29 nights and served 164 unique individuals. The City and partners will continue to pursue funding that creates a more permanent solution for this community need.

### **Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons**

All emergency shelter and transitional housing options funded by the City of Duluth participate in Coordinated Entry as a part of the Saint Louis County Continuum of Care Program. The City of Duluth, in addition to using ESG Flex Funds (emergency assistance to clients facing eviction, or in need of rental deposit assistance), leverages funds from Saint Louis County's FHPAP program to assist individuals and families access housing or remain in their homes. The 2020 program goal was to assist 50 individuals or families, and within the last program year, that number was doubled, serving 106 people. Flex funds are provided to people in need through case management at ESG contract agencies. Case managers meet weekly to prioritize service need and determine if ESG would be an appropriate funding source to assist their client stay with housing stability so they will not become homeless.

### **Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs**

Through CDBG Public Service funds, the City of Duluth supports a plethora of services that address housing, health, social services, employment, and youth needs. CHUM, Damiano Center, and The



Salvation Army provide food access across Duluth through food pantries and on-site meals. MACV provides case management to veterans and their families. Life House provides a drop in center for homeless and at-risk youth. Safe Haven provides shelter for those experiencing domestic violence. Overall, the City of Duluth works with over 20 different programs to provide critical public services to LMI families in the community. The 2020 COVID-19 Pandemic created unfortunate circumstances for many people at risk of becoming homeless. An addendum explaining how CARES funding assisted the community is attached.

**Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again**

In coordination with the Saint Louis County Continuum of Care (CoC), the City of Duluth funds a portion of the Coordinated Entry Coordinator who manages the CoC waitlist, works with sub recipients to input data into HMIS correctly, in addition to ensuring that the hardest to house (individuals with a VISPDAT scores of 12-17) are housed as soon as units become available. To further shorten the time of those experiencing homelessness, sub recipients, the City of Duluth, and the Saint Louis County CoC established a monthly meeting where all participating agencies, in addition to United Way's 211 program staff, meet to discuss any client housing issues, share success stories, and work as a cohort to ensure the system works well. Providing this opportunity allows consistent partnership and new staff training, while simultaneously correcting systemic issues and improving the overall process.

## **CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)**

### **Actions taken to address the needs of public housing**

The City of Duluth does not spend any CDBG, HOME or ESG funds to address the needs of Public Housing. The Duluth HRA utilizes various other resources to keep public housing units in good repair through its use of its annual HUD Capital Fund grant, occasional use of energy performance contracting, and use of general obligation bond funded loans provided by the Minnesota Housing Finance Agency, when appropriated by the state legislature. The HRA has also used its local levy resources to augment such funds when needed.

### **Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership**

HRA has regular meetings during the year with its Resident Advisory Board (RAB) and also promotes resident attendance at high rise resident club meetings. Staff are made available to attend Club meetings as warranted and requested. The HRA also has a self-sufficiency program and a Section 8 Homeownership program, both of which were promoted during the year. The HRA also has a Public Housing Outreach program which provides various information and referral of interest to residents on a regular basis.

### **Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs**

NA

## **CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)**

**Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)**

The City supports proactive removal of blighted or vacant buildings through thoughtful and selective demolition. Sites unfit for redevelopment due to location (e.g., located in a flood zone), are left free of buildings and other impervious surfaces to provide open space and prevent cyclical building degradation. Waste is removed on sites with redevelopment potential.

CDBG- and HOME-funded rehab projects were completed during Program Year 2020, with all code and lead-based paint issues addressed, and the resulting housing units assessed for healthy home deficiencies.

Vacant properties in LMI neighborhoods: One Roof Community Housing acquired, rehabbed, and sold formerly vacant or foreclosed properties in the Central and East Hillside, Lincoln Park, and West Duluth neighborhoods. These properties are systematically enrolled in One Roof's Community Land Trust program, which preserves long-term housing affordability while encouraging homeownership.

Energy requirements: Energy efficiency was increased by weatherization rehab projects in existing homes. Lessening the burden of energy costs for LMI people contributes to overall affordability.

TBRA for "hard-to-house": HOME funds were used to provide rental subsidies.

## **Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

CDBG funds were utilized for the Tenant Landlord Connection, which provides services to landlords and tenants. Services include: education on fair housing rules, responsible renting, lead based paint hazards, education on rights and responsibilities, and mediation between landlords and tenants. These services help alleviate homelessness by mediating disputes, and thereby reducing the number of evictions of individuals and families. The Salvation Army's Landlord Incentive program continued in Program Year 2020, assisting landlords who rent units to people who have been incarcerated. This program will be continued in the next Action Plan. HOME funds provided tenant based rental assistance for homeless, formerly homeless, and "hard to house" persons. This assistance is part of the Coordinated Entry system in Duluth, which involves several partners addressing homeless.

## **Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

The City partnered with the Duluth Housing and Redevelopment Authority to work to reduce lead-based paint hazards. The HRA's staff during this period included a number of lead-certified inspectors, which allowed for a timely and thorough review of lead-based paint risks in affordable housing projects.

## **Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

The City collaborated with partners to review services for families that might be experiencing or were at risk of poverty. Through strong partnerships with sub-recipients; Center City Housing Corporation and CHUM, services were provided to at-risk families at Steve O’Neil Apartments and the CHUM Shelter. Additional services of youth programming and food were provided through the Neighborhood Youth Services (NYS) JET Food program. The City worked with its affordable housing providers to consider future options for family supportive housing. CDBG funds supported SOAR Career Solutions, who administered the Duluth at Work collaborative, which helps low income people to receive training, get hired, and increase their income. Duluth at Work is being reimaged through coordination with the Workforce Development Department for the program year in order to best serve low to moderate income people. Additionally, Entrepreneur Fund assists low-income business owners to increase their revenue.

**Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

Duluth’s Tenant Landlord Connection (TLC) is managed and staffed by One Roof Community Housing. The TLC educates existing and potential landlords and tenants of their respective rights and responsibilities; it mediates disputes, helps work to avoid evictions whenever possible, provides Ready-to-Rent classes for hopeful tenants looking to improve their or establish their rental history, and refers individuals experiencing discrimination to fair housing resources. Furthermore, the Salvation Army through their Landlord Incentive program works with landlords to address structural issues in the housing market for those with criminal backgrounds and searching for housing.

**Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

Duluth’s Tenant Landlord Connection (TLC) is managed and staffed by One Roof Community Housing Organization. The TLC educates existing and potential landlords and tenants of their respective rights and responsibilities; it mediates disputes, helps work to avoid evictions whenever possible, provides Ready-to-Rent classes for hopeful tenants looking to improve upon or establish their rental history, and refers individuals experiencing discrimination to fair housing resources. Furthermore, the Salvation Army through their Landlord Incentive program works with landlords to address structural issues in the housing market for those with criminal backgrounds searching for housing.

**Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)**

Last year the City updated the Fair Housing Plan by conducting a new Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice. The study reported four major impediments to fair housing choice, and created unique implementation strategies throughout the five year consolidated plan period. The four major impediments identified were: exclusionary rental housing practices and policies directed at Section 8 Housing Choice voucher holders, exclusionary rental housing practices and policies directed at persons with criminal backgrounds, involuntary displacement and limited housing choice caused by

gentrification, and policies and physical limitations in the built environment. Strategies developed in response to these impediments include campaigns to work with local partners and landlords to incentivize more inclusive rental policies, while implementing tracking mechanisms that measure sources of displacement for more informed policy changes to properly address these issues. The City continued to fund the Tenant Landlord Connection (TLC) and Landlord Incentive Program to help address fair housing concerns. In Program Year 2020, the City began working with the HRA to assess their Section 8 housing voucher program to make it more accessible to landlords so there is less discrimination based on voucher status. The City's Human Rights Officer provides residents with information about their rights regarding fair and accessible housing. The City has a Human Rights Commission, a Commission on Disabilities, and Community Planning Committee, all of which discuss affordable housing needs on a regular basis.

During the Imagine Duluth 2035 comprehensive planning process, the City actively engaged with both stakeholders and residents to develop long-range strategies pertaining to housing access. The Duluth 2035 plan was adopted on June 25, 2018 and included two new principles relating to fair housing, "Develop a healthy community" and "Integrate fairness into the fabric of the community." These guiding principles are utilized in the review of development projects to insure the decision making process includes people of all backgrounds, including those of the federally protected classes. These principles have been incorporated into the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan process.

## **CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230**

**Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements**

All CDBG, HOME and ESG funded programs receive this type of monitoring based upon a risk assessment. Every individual community development project is monitored annually. This is done through either a program desk monitoring or by an on-site monitoring that inspects and reviews client records using the HUD Monitoring spreadsheets. In addition, annually, a financial monitoring is conducted on all of the agencies through audit reports. During onsite visits, staff verifies that program activities are meeting a national objective, serving homeless people, operating rental properties within rent and income limits, and that funds are expended appropriately on eligible activities. Staff also reviews the Agency's policies and procedures, including their communication and outreach plans. Specific activities, such as the Entrepreneur Fund actively outreaches to minority owned businesses to include them in their business co-hort. HRA, One Roof and Eco 3 participate in the MBWE programs. The Imagine Duluth 2035 Comprehensive Plan was adopted on June 25 of 2018 and it includes principles to insure fair housing and equity.

## **Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)**

**Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.**

A public notice about the 2020 CAPER was published on June 12, 2021 in the Duluth News Tribune. The draft 2020 CAPER is available on the City's Website. A public hearing on the 2020 CAPER and the agencies performance will be held on a virtual meeting open to the public on June 22, 2021. Agencies are notified of this meeting are expected to attend.

**CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)**

**Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction’s program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.**

Based on community input and housing data, the Committee chose to continue recommending a stronger funding focus on affordable housing in 2020. This was to meet the needs that were identified during community input through the Imagine Duluth 2035 Comprehensive Plan process in addition to the annual community needs survey, and other input opportunities held throughout the year.

**Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?**

No

**[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.**

## **CR-50 - HOME 91.520(d)**

### **Include the results of on-site inspections of affordable rental housing assisted under the program to determine compliance with housing codes and other applicable regulations**

Please list those projects that should have been inspected on-site this program year based upon the schedule in §92.504(d). Indicate which of these were inspected and a summary of issues that were detected during the inspection. For those that were not inspected, please indicate the reason and how you will remedy the situation.

Nine rental properties that received HOME funds are still within their respective affordability periods. The City of Duluth tracks a project at the following milestones: initial project approval, during construction, at construction completion, and the subsequent monitoring visits in compliance with HOME regulations. All nine properties participated in virtual monitoring in 2020 due to the COVID-19 Pandemic. The Housing and Redevelopment Authority of Duluth, Minnesota (HRA) is contracted to provide building inspection services, with Certified Building Inspectors and Lead-based Paint Assessors.

Assessors. Due to COVID-19, rental projects that were scheduled for on-site inspection in 2020 were added to the 2021 on-site inspection list and conducted by the HRA in spring 2021. There were five rental buildings that were inspected: Burke Apartments, Transitional Rehab Upper, Transitional Rehab Lower, Center for Changing Lives, and Mac-V.

The Transitional Rehab Upper Building, Center for Changing Lives, and Vet's Place passed on-site inspection without any issues or need for corrective action. The Transitional Rehab Lower Building failed the initial site inspection due to minor items, such as missing window screens. These issues were corrected by Center City Housing Corporation staff effective May 24, 2021. The Burke Apartments failed the initial site inspection. Staff at Accessible Space Inc. corrected issues noted at the first inspection; however, there is still one unit not in compliance as noted at the second site inspection. The corrective action is the responsibility of the current tenant. Due to the current eviction moratorium, this tenant cannot be evicted and Accessible Space Inc. will continue to work with tenant to encourage corrective action and inspection compliancy.

### **Provide an assessment of the jurisdiction's affirmative marketing actions for HOME units. 92.351(b)**

Agencies receiving HOME funds are required to submit an Affirmative Marketing Plan to the City of Duluth at which time it is reviewed for consistency, fairness, and to ensure that programs are adequately marketed to community members.

### **Refer to IDIS reports to describe the amount and use of program income for projects, including the number of projects and owner and tenant characteristics**



There is \$62,000 in HOME Program Income that has not been allocated to an activity in IDIS. It is expected that this funding will be allocated during the 2021 Program Year.

**Describe other actions taken to foster and maintain affordable housing. 91.220(k) (STATES ONLY: Including the coordination of LIHTC with the development of affordable housing). 91.320(j)**

Recognizing the need for gap financing for affordable housing projects, the City of Duluth works with Developers seeking Low Income Housing Tax Credits from the State of Minnesota. The City coordinates proposal review in partnership with St. Louis County Health and Human Services Division Staff, the HRA, and the Affordable Housing Coalition of Duluth. Projects that meet local housing priorities are presented to Duluth City Council for project support; which is included with Developers applications to MN Housing. In 2021, four Developers sought Duluth Council support for 2022 Round 1 Tax Credits.

Additionally, the City of Duluth works with local Developers to support Tax Abatement or Tax Increment Financing when appropriate to assist mixed-income housing development. When public assistance is utilized, the City of Duluth negotiates a number of units to be rent restricted/affordable units.

**CR-60 - ESG 91.520(g) (ESG Recipients only)**

**ESG Supplement to the CAPER in *e-snaps***

**For Paperwork Reduction Act**

**1. Recipient Information—All Recipients Complete**

**Basic Grant Information**

<b>Recipient Name</b>	DULUTH
<b>Organizational DUNS Number</b>	077627883
<b>EIN/TIN Number</b>	416005105
<b>Identify the Field Office</b>	MINNEAPOLIS
<b>Identify CoC(s) in which the recipient or subrecipient(s) will provide ESG assistance</b>	Duluth/Saint Louis County CoC

**ESG Contact Name**

<b>Prefix</b>	Mr
<b>First Name</b>	BENJAMIN
<b>Middle Name</b>	M

**Last Name** VANTASSEL  
**Suffix** 0  
**Title** Manager

**ESG Contact Address**

**Street Address 1** City Hall  
**Street Address 2** 411 W First ST  
**City** Duluth  
**State** MN  
**ZIP Code** -  
**Phone Number** 2187305299  
**Extension** 0  
**Fax Number** 0  
**Email Address** BVANTASSEL@DULUTHMN.GOV

**ESG Secondary Contact**

**Prefix** Mr  
**First Name** Adam  
**Last Name** Fulton  
**Suffix** 0  
**Title** Manager  
**Phone Number** 2187305325  
**Extension** 0  
**Email Address** Afulton@duluthmn.gov

**2. Reporting Period—All Recipients Complete**

**Program Year Start Date** 04/01/2020  
**Program Year End Date** 03/31/2021

**3a. Subrecipient Form – Complete one form for each subrecipient**

**Subrecipient or Contractor Name:** CENTER CITY HOUSING CORP  
**City:** Duluth  
**State:** MN  
**Zip Code:** 55801, 0039  
**DUNS Number:**  
**Is subrecipient a victim services provider:** N  
**Subrecipient Organization Type:** Other Non-Profit Organization  
**ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount:** 22000

**Subrecipient or Contractor Name:** DULUTH  
**City:** DULUTH  
**State:** MN  
**Zip Code:** 55802,  
**DUNS Number:** 077627883  
**Is subrecipient a victim services provider:** N  
**Subrecipient Organization Type:** Unit of Government  
**ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount:** 15652

**Subrecipient or Contractor Name:** LIFE HOUSE  
**City:** Duluth  
**State:** MN  
**Zip Code:** 55802, 2003  
**DUNS Number:**  
**Is subrecipient a victim services provider:** N  
**Subrecipient Organization Type:** Other Non-Profit Organization  
**ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount:** 30000

**Subrecipient or Contractor Name:** SALVATION ARMY (DULUTH)  
**City:** Duluth  
**State:** MN  
**Zip Code:** 55806, 1802  
**DUNS Number:**  
**Is subrecipient a victim services provider:** N  
**Subrecipient Organization Type:** Other Non-Profit Organization  
**ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount:** 8000

**Subrecipient or Contractor Name:** MN Assistance Council for Veterans  
**City:** St. Paul  
**State:** MN  
**Zip Code:** ,  
**DUNS Number:** 137825696  
**Is subrecipient a victim services provider:** N  
**Subrecipient Organization Type:** Other Non-Profit Organization  
**ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount:** 3000

**Subrecipient or Contractor Name:** Churches United in Ministry (CHUM)

**City:** Duluth

**State:** MN

**Zip Code:** 55802, 2017

**DUNS Number:** 032768371

**Is subrecipient a victim services provider:** N

**Subrecipient Organization Type:** Other Non-Profit Organization

**ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount:** 42000

**Subrecipient or Contractor Name:** Safe Haven

**City:** Duluth

**State:** MN

**Zip Code:** 55803, 3558

**DUNS Number:** 134306125

**Is subrecipient a victim services provider:** Y

**Subrecipient Organization Type:** Other Non-Profit Organization

**ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount:** 14000

**Subrecipient or Contractor Name:** Housing and Redevelopment Authority of Duluth

**City:** Duluth

**State:** MN

**Zip Code:** 55805, 1807

**DUNS Number:** 010351005

**Is subrecipient a victim services provider:** N

**Subrecipient Organization Type:** Unit of Government

**ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount:** 77052

## CR-65 - Persons Assisted

### 4. Persons Served

#### 4a. Complete for Homelessness Prevention Activities

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	56
Children	0
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>56</b>

Table 16 – Household Information for Homeless Prevention Activities

#### 4b. Complete for Rapid Re-Housing Activities

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	24
Children	0
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>24</b>

Table 17 – Household Information for Rapid Re-Housing Activities

#### 4c. Complete for Shelter

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	1,767
Children	120
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,887</b>

Table 18 – Shelter Information



#### 4d. Street Outreach

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	203
Children	0
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>203</b>

Table 19 – Household Information for Street Outreach

#### 4e. Totals for all Persons Served with ESG

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	1,503
Children	393
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,896</b>

Table 20 – Household Information for Persons Served with ESG

#### 5. Gender—Complete for All Activities

	Total
Male	899
Female	982
Transgender	12
Don't Know/Refused/Other	3
Missing Information	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,896</b>

Table 21 – Gender Information

**6. Age—Complete for All Activities**

	<b>Total</b>
Under 18	393
18-24	175
25 and over	1,328
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,896</b>

**Table 22 – Age Information**

**7. Special Populations Served—Complete for All Activities**

**Number of Persons in Households**

<b>Subpopulation</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>Total Persons Served – Prevention</b>	<b>Total Persons Served – RRH</b>	<b>Total Persons Served in Emergency Shelters</b>
Veterans	76	0	0	0
Victims of Domestic Violence	641	0	0	0
Elderly	65	0	0	0
HIV/AIDS	5	0	0	0
Chronically Homeless	557	0	0	0
<b>Persons with Disabilities:</b>				
Severely Mentally Ill	979	0	0	0
Chronic Substance Abuse	253	0	0	0
Other Disability	501	0	0	0
Total (Unduplicated if possible)	0	0	0	0

**Table 23 – Special Population Served**



## CR-70 – ESG 91.520(g) - Assistance Provided and Outcomes

### 10. Shelter Utilization

Number of New Units - Rehabbed	0
Number of New Units - Conversion	0
Total Number of bed-nights available	0
Total Number of bed-nights provided	0
Capacity Utilization	0.00%

Table 24 – Shelter Capacity

### 11. Project Outcomes Data measured under the performance standards developed in consultation with the CoC(s)

City of Duluth ESG funds are used for two overnight shelters, CHUM and Safe Haven. Both of these agencies exceeded their goals. These agencies are part of the St. Louis County COC and comply with all the required performance standards.

## CR-75 – Expenditures

### 11. Expenditures

#### 11a. ESG Expenditures for Homelessness Prevention

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2018	2019	2020
Expenditures for Rental Assistance	0	38,449	26,068
Expenditures for Housing Relocation and Stabilization Services - Financial Assistance	0	0	0
Expenditures for Housing Relocation & Stabilization Services - Services	0	0	0
Expenditures for Homeless Prevention under Emergency Shelter Grants Program	0	0	0
<b>Subtotal Homelessness Prevention</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>38,449</b>	<b>26,068</b>

Table 25 – ESG Expenditures for Homelessness Prevention

#### 11b. ESG Expenditures for Rapid Re-Housing

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2018	2019	2020
Expenditures for Rental Assistance	0	8,394	11,410
Expenditures for Housing Relocation and Stabilization Services - Financial Assistance	0	0	0
Expenditures for Housing Relocation & Stabilization Services - Services	0	0	0
Expenditures for Homeless Assistance under Emergency Shelter Grants Program	0	0	0
<b>Subtotal Rapid Re-Housing</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>8,394</b>	<b>11,410</b>

Table 26 – ESG Expenditures for Rapid Re-Housing

#### 11c. ESG Expenditures for Emergency Shelter

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2018	2019	2020
Essential Services	0	18,218	84,768
Operations	0	0	0
Renovation	0	0	0

Major Rehab	0	0	0
Conversion	0	0	0
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>18,218</b>	<b>84,768</b>

**Table 27 – ESG Expenditures for Emergency Shelter**

**11d. Other Grant Expenditures**

	<b>Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year</b>		
	<b>2018</b>	<b>2019</b>	<b>2020</b>
Street Outreach	0	0	0
HMIS	0	0	1,125
Administration	2,267	15,048	13,557

**Table 28 - Other Grant Expenditures**

**11e. Total ESG Grant Funds**

<b>Total ESG Funds Expended</b>	<b>2018</b>	<b>2019</b>	<b>2020</b>
	2,267	80,109	136,928

**Table 29 - Total ESG Funds Expended**

**11f. Match Source**

	<b>2018</b>	<b>2019</b>	<b>2020</b>
Other Non-ESG HUD Funds	0	0	0
Other Federal Funds	0	0	0
State Government	0	0	0
Local Government	0	0	0

Private Funds	0	0	81,890
Other	0	0	379,910
Fees	0	0	0
Program Income	0	0	0
<b>Total Match Amount</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>461,800</b>

**Table 30 - Other Funds Expended on Eligible ESG Activities**

**11g. Total**

<b>Total Amount of Funds Expended on ESG Activities</b>	<b>2018</b>	<b>2019</b>	<b>2020</b>
	2,267	80,109	598,728

**Table 31 - Total Amount of Funds Expended on ESG Activities**

## **First round of the CARES ACT funding- Summary report for the 2020 CAPER**

(all assistance was provided to recipients not receiving the assistance from Entitlement Funding)

**CDBG-CV- \$1,427,428** in HUD CDBG-CV Funds allocated to the City in 2020 have been paid to the agency or people, or are currently assisting them.

### **\$36,500- Increase Food Storage and Freezer Capacity at CHUM Food Shelf-CHUM-**

Project Summary: CHUM purchased a freezer to increase their food storage capacity in response to an increased demand from COVID-19

- This project assists thousands of people who utilize the food shelf.

### **\$72,600 -Hired a Community Health Worker at Community Action Duluth (CAD)**

Project Summary: CAD hired a Community Health Worker to assist individuals dealing with impacts from COVID-19

- This project is active and assisting least 150 individuals during 2021.

### **\$30,071 -Provide critical technology support for children & families during COVID-19-St Louis County**

Project Summary: Provide funding to St. Louis County Health and Human Services to purchase phones and chrome books for over 75 children and 32 families affected by COVID-19

- The project is complete and assisted 102 people.

### **\$87,247-Communication and Outreach for the Hillside Neighborhood- Healthy Hillside Campaign-Zeitgeist Center for Arts and Community**

Project Summary: Outreach and Communication to households in the Hillside Neighborhood to increase engagement with people affected by COVID-19, assisting approximately 16,000 people

- This project is in the process of being established.

### **\$139,040- Lincoln Park Neighborhood Digital Recover and Access Project-Ecolibrium3**

Project Summary: Installing equipment to provide free neighborhood-based wifi in Lincoln Park and hire a Technologist to oversee the process. This project will reduce the technology gap that has negatively affected households due to COVID-19, assisting approximately 5,000 people.

- This project is in the processing of being established.

**\$79,516- NYS COVID Response Programming-The Hills Youth and Family Services- NYS**

Project Summary: Increase staffing and equipment at an organization that services low-income families to provide safe access to distance learning equipment, and tutors so that children whose parents are essential workers don't fall behind in school due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

- This project is active and has already served 609 youth.

**\$27,500- Increase staff at the Youth Center-Life House, Inc**

Project Summary: Provide additional staffing and food to meet the increase in demand for care to homeless and at-risk youth impacted by COVID-19, assisting approximately 300 people

- This project is complete and served 571 youth.

**\$23,707-Increase technology access for low-income families impacted by the pandemic-Center City Housing Corp**

Project Summary: Purchase computers and associated equipment to increase technology access

- This project is complete and served 67 people.

**\$121,377- Computer Support Specialist Job Training-SOAR Career Solutions**

Project Summary: Increase programming to provide employment training and computer skills to people impacted by COVID-19- SOAR

- This project is in process.

**\$130,000 - Cultural Specific Entrepreneurship Workshop-Family Rise Together**

Project Summary: Providing technical and service support to LMI businesses; focusing on women and minority owned entrepreneurs who were impacted by COVID-19.

- This project is active and assisting 14 businesses.

**\$300,000-Supporting LMI Duluth Small Business Owners During COVID-19- Entrepreneur Fund**

Project Summary: Provide technical and service support to LMI businesses impacted by COVID-19 pandemic.

- This project is active and assisting 30 businesses.

**\$50,000-Family Coach Position at the Steve O'Neil Apartments- CHUM**

Project Summary: Increase staff capacity at the Steve O'Neil Apartments to address the effects of COVID-19 on families

- This project is active and has assisted 140 people

**ESG-CV- \$719,669** in HUD ESG-CV Funds, allocated to the City in 2020, have been paid to the agency or people, or are currently assisting them. As required by HUD, accomplishments are aggregated together and reported within the SAGE system.

**\$95,900-Improving Sanitation in the CHUM Shelter and Drop-In Center- CHUM**

Project Summary: Upgrading the hygiene, bathroom, and kitchen facilities at the CHUM's Emergency Shelter in response to COVID-19.

**\$43,000-Legal Hotline- Legal Aid Service of Northeastern MN**

Project Summary: Providing legal services to LMI households affected by COVID-19, assist approximately 975 people

**\$200,000-Shelter Expansion for Vulnerable Population-CHUM**

Project Summary: A 6-month pilot program to extend the lease of the Duluth Inn for use as a preventative shelter during the COVID-19 pandemic

**\$68,840-HRA Eviction Prevention Program- Housing & Redevelopment of Duluth, MN**

Project Summary: Funding will be used to prevent evictions of public housing residents by paying their late and/or unpaid rent and/or utility bills that occurred due to the COVID-19 pandemic, assist approximately 145 households

**ESG-CV Accomplishments**

870 people, including 26 children were assisted with ESG-CV funded programs as of the first quarter of 2020

35 people are Veterans,

359 people have been chronically homeless

552 are male, 253 are female, 7 are trans Female,

Of the children- 12 male, 14 female. Some gender data was not collected.

639 people are age 25-61; 56 people are over the age of 62; and 65 people are 18-25.