



City of Duluth Minnesota

Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report -- Fiscal Year 2019 --

**Year 5 of the 2015-2019 Consolidated Plan for Housing and Community
Development**

CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)

This could be an overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the program year.

The program year began on April 1, 2019 and ended on March 31, 2020; this was also the final year for the 2015-2019 Consolidated Plan. A significant accomplishment this past year was the construction and completion of the Garfield Center City Apartments, a 50 unit building to provide supportive housing to 50 low income individuals. Another accomplishment this past year was the streamlining approach for the Aquisition Rehab program which assisted in more units (including ones under construction from previous years) being completed; therefore the City accomplished the goal of adding 50 affordable units to the community. During the past five years, the City was also able to leverage the CDBG and HOME funding by constructing 210 new rental units; the majority of these developments included tax credit funding. The City continues to explore additional methods to increase new construction. The City exceeded the Rental Rehab goal, this was in part due to increased financing initiatives from Minnesota Housing. The City did not meet the goal for homeowner rehab, only 47% of the goal was accomplished, this was due to decreased funding from the weatherization programs, increased availability in home interest improvement loans from private banks, and lack of available contractors interested in smaller projects- typically homeowner rehabs are smaller in scale than other rehab/construction projects. During this past year there were additional funding sources from Minnesota Housing as the need in the State became more prevalent which assisted in the City meeting its goal for rehab in 2019. The City intended to improve seven public facilities during the 2015-2019 Consolidated Plan year, 13 public facilities (including community centers, parks, homeless shelters and health facilities) were proposed in the actions plans; however 2 of these activities were not completed due to loss of other funds; while 3 are still in progress and expected to be completed in the 2020 PY. The goals for Economic Development and Public Services were either met or exceeded, showing the need for business investment, job training, and public services needs including food access, youth assistance, homeless facilities and case management.

Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee’s program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Affordable Home Owner Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$338545 / HOME: \$470000	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	50	50	100.00%	12	30	250.00%
Affordable Home Owner Housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$338545 / HOME: \$470000	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	725	338	46.62%	87	101	116.09%
Affordable Rental Housing	Affordable Housing Public Housing Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Rental units constructed	Household Housing Unit	300	210	70.00%	0	50	

Affordable Rental Housing	Affordable Housing Public Housing Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	250	317	126.80%	106	63	59.43%
Affordable Rental Housing	Affordable Housing Public Housing Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	0	0		0	0	
Affordable Rental Housing	Affordable Housing Public Housing Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	0	0		0	0	
Affordable Rental Housing	Affordable Housing Public Housing Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Housing for Homeless added	Household Housing Unit	0	0		0	0	

Affordable Rental Housing	Affordable Housing Public Housing Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Housing for People with HIV/AIDS added	Household Housing Unit	0	0		0	0	
Community Development Infrastructure	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	100	100	100.00%			
Community Development Infrastructure	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	1	1	100.00%			
Community Public Facilities	Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	28200	19345	68.60%	912	912	100.00%
Community Public Facilities	Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	2460	760	30.89%	3748	3718	99.20%

Community Public Facilities	Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Buildings Demolished	Buildings	0	0		14	0	0.00%
Community Public Facilities	Homeless Non-Homeless Special Needs Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	7	11	157.14%			
Economic Development	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0				
Economic Development	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	163	163	100.00%	41	67	163.41%
Economic Development	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Businesses assisted	Businesses Assisted	40	46	115.00%	8	6	75.00%
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$64000 / ESG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	19400	24334	125.43%			

Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$64000 / ESG: \$	Public service activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	0	0				
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$64000 / ESG: \$	Tenant-based rental assistance / Rapid Rehousing	Households Assisted	350	330	94.29%	50	53	106.00%
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$64000 / ESG: \$	Homeless Person Overnight Shelter	Persons Assisted	6000	6839	113.98%	1540	1793	116.43%
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$64000 / ESG: \$	Overnight/Emergency Shelter/Transitional Housing Beds added	Beds						
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$64000 / ESG: \$	Homelessness Prevention	Persons Assisted	300	307	102.33%		0	
Homelessness	Homeless	CDBG: \$64000 / ESG: \$	Other	Other	0	0				
Neighborhood Revitalization	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Buildings Demolished	Buildings	10	8	80.00%			
Neighborhood Revitalization	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	0	0				
Public Services	Homeless Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	104670	104336	99.68%	18175	20110	110.65%

Public Services	Homeless Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities for Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Households Assisted	19400	29455	151.83%	431	442	102.55%
Public Services	Homeless Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Homeless Person Overnight Shelter	Persons Assisted		0		0	0	
Tenant Based Rental Assistance	Homeless	HOME: \$	Tenant-based rental assistance / Rapid Rehousing	Households Assisted	100	89	89.00%	13	33	253.85%

Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date

Assess how the jurisdiction’s use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.

The lack of affordable housing is a major concern in Duluth and it impacts public organizations and public agencies who assist people currently experiencing homelessness or other housing crises. The current rental vacancy rate is less than 4% for market rate rentals and less than 1% for public housing, which makes finding affordable housing options very difficult. The City recently approved the Imagine Duluth 2035 Comprehensive Plan to in part address housing and will be working closely with housing partners, sub-recipients and the Housing and Redevelopment Authority of Duluth to achieve the goals listed in the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan and Annual Action Plans. A primary focus will be the construction of new affordable rental units and housing rehabilitation, the City will be working on two projects for the 2020 program year- Decker Dwellings and Birchwood Apartments which will provide much needed affordable housing in Duluth. Both of these projects received tax credit financing and will help to further the strategies identified in our Analysis to Impediments of Fair Housing plan by providing housing opportunities throughout all neighborhoods in Duluth.

CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	CDBG	HOME	ESG
White	11,087	21	642
Black or African American	4,171	12	212
Asian	124	2	18
American Indian or American Native	4,387	10	259
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	55	0	0
Total	19,824	45	1,131
Hispanic	141	3	0
Not Hispanic	19,683	42	0

Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds

Narrative

CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)

Identify the resources made available

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	public - federal	2,625,204	2,109,303
HOME	public - federal	541,106	668,718
ESG	public - federal	200,644	173,825

Table 3 - Resources Made Available

Narrative

The HOME amount expended during the program year exceeded the 2019 allocation (resources made available) due to expending HOME funds from previous years to complete the 2018 Garfield Square project.

Funds were appropriately spent for the 2019 Program Year and helped to further the efforts of assisting low and moderate income people in Duluth. Although the amount expended on Public Services exceeded the 15% cap, it was allowable due to the overage being allocated towards the SOAR Career Solutions Duluth At Work project.

SOAR Career Solutions is a qualified Community Based Development Organization (CBDO) that is able to carry out job training activities under the Economic Development category. The project Duluth at Work Collaborative received \$272,000 to conduct job training for 41 candidates. Under the HUD regulations 24 CFR 570.204, activities carried out by CBDO's are exempted from the HUD Public Service Cap of 15%.

Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description

Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Narrative

Leveraging

Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.

In 2019, Agencies provided a total of \$11,021,756 in matching funds. The breakdown of those matching funds include:

Other Federal Funds: \$1,756,837

State/Local Funds: \$1,411,650

Private Funds: \$1,386,690

Other Funds: \$6,466,579

ALL ESG activities funded in 2019 received a local match which exceeded the 50/50 match requirement.

No publicly owned land or property was used during 2019 to address the needs identified in the plan.

Fiscal Year Summary – HOME Match	
1. Excess match from prior Federal fiscal year	105,490
2. Match contributed during current Federal fiscal year	2,601,000
3. Total match available for current Federal fiscal year (Line 1 plus Line 2)	2,706,490
4. Match liability for current Federal fiscal year	117,500
5. Excess match carried over to next Federal fiscal year (Line 3 minus Line 4)	2,588,990

Table 5 – Fiscal Year Summary - HOME Match Report

Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year								
Project No. or Other ID	Date of Contribution	Cash (non-Federal sources)	Foregone Taxes, Fees, Charges	Appraised Land/Real Property	Required Infrastructure	Site Preparation, Construction Materials, Donated labor	Bond Financing	Total Match
One Roof CLT Aqu Rehab- CHDO	0	1,890,000	0	0	0	0	0	1,890,000
One Roof CLT New Construction -CHDO	0	711,000	0	0	0	0	0	711,000

Table 6 – Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year

HOME MBE/WBE report

Program Income – Enter the program amounts for the reporting period				
Balance on hand at begin-ning of reporting period \$	Amount received during reporting period \$	Total amount expended during reporting period \$	Amount expended for TBRA \$	Balance on hand at end of reporting period \$
0	0	0	0	0

Table 7 – Program Income

Minority Business Enterprises and Women Business Enterprises – Indicate the number and dollar value of contracts for HOME projects completed during the reporting period						
	Total	Minority Business Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Contracts						
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sub-Contracts						
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Total	Women Business Enterprises	Male			
Contracts						
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			
Number	0	0	0			
Sub-Contracts						
Number	0	0	0			
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			

Table 8 - Minority Business and Women Business Enterprises

Minority Owners of Rental Property – Indicate the number of HOME assisted rental property owners and the total amount of HOME funds in these rental properties assisted						
	Total	Minority Property Owners				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 9 – Minority Owners of Rental Property

Relocation and Real Property Acquisition – Indicate the number of persons displaced, the cost of relocation payments, the number of parcels acquired, and the cost of acquisition						
Parcels Acquired		0	0			
Businesses Displaced		0	0			
Nonprofit Organizations Displaced		0	0			
Households Temporarily Relocated, not Displaced		0	0			
Households Displaced	Total	Minority Property Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Cost	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 10 – Relocation and Real Property Acquisition

CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	3,590	3,804
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	106	130
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	431	453
Total	4,127	4,387

Table 11 – Number of Households

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	63	92
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	3	52
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	87	154
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	8	10
Total	161	308

Table 12 – Number of Households Supported

Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.

Garfield Square, a 50 unit LMI rental development was completed this year, therefore the goal was exceeded. The housing agencies received increased assistance from Minnesota Housing, along with streamlining efforts. The goals for affordable housing rehab were exceeded in 2019. Additionally, people experiencing homelessness is a priority in the community, unfortunately the need exceeds what shelters can currently provide, displaying the need for new or larger capacity shelter facilities in Duluth.

Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.

The city is continuing to work with housing partners to build capacity, acquire other funding, and facilitate projects that result in more affordable housing. The Imagine Duluth 2035 Plan has adopted the Housing Action Framework which sets priorities and aligns partners.

Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.

Number of Households Served	CDBG Actual	HOME Actual
Extremely Low-income	46	70
Low-income	13	2
Moderate-income	6	5
Total	65	77

Table 13 – Number of Households Served

Narrative Information

HUD Defines extremely low-income are households are 0 to 30% of the area median income; low-income households are 30 to 50% of the area median income; and moderate-income are 50 to 80% area median income.

CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)

Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:

Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs

During winter 2019, the City of Duluth collaborated with St. Louis County and a local homelessness service provider, CHUM, to open a warming center on a pilot basis. The intent was to be open during extreme cold events for homeless individuals at temperatures below 0 degrees Fahrenheit. St. Louis County provided local funding support to provide staff for the warming center, and the City provided the facility at a local community center as local match at no cost to the program. CHUM provided the staff and logistics support to operate the center. Between the months of January and March, the warming center was activated 29 nights. For each of those nights, CHUM provided two overnight staff at the center for the entirety of the open period. The center served 164 unique individuals. No federal funding was provided for the project, as it was conducted on a pilot basis. However, staff at the Warming Center indicated that many of the 164 unique individual were people who had not previously been in contact with homelessness support professionals. Several individuals were also able to be placed into permanent supportive housing.

Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons

All of the emergency shelters and transitional housing options that are funded by the City of Duluth participate in Coordinated Entry as a part of the Saint Louis County Continuum of Care Program. The City of Duluth in addition to using ESG Flex Funds (which provides emergency assistance to clients that are facing eviction, or need assistance paying for a deposit for an apartment) leverages funds from Saint Louis County's FHPAP program to help individuals and families access housing or remain in their homes. The goal of this program was to assist 50 individuals or families, and within the last program year that number was doubled by serving 106 people. Flex funds are provided to people in need through case management at agencies that have ESG contracts with the City of Duluth. Case managers meet weekly to identify those in need, and determine if ESG would be a good source of funds to help their client stay in their home, or to provide funds for their client for housing, so they will not be homeless.

Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs

Through our CDBG Public Service funds, the City of Duluth funds a plethora of services that address housing, health, social services, employment or youth needs.

The Lake Superior Health Clinic provides low cost medical care and free dental care for low- moderate income clients. CHUM, Damiano Center, and The Salvation Army provide food access across Duluth through food pantries and on-site meals. MACV provides case management to veterans and their families. Life House provides a drop in center for homeless and at-risk youth. Safe Haven provides shelter for those experiencing domestic violence. Overall, the City of Duluth works with over 20 different programs to provide critical public services to LMI families in the community.

Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again

In coordination with the Saint Louis County Continuum of Care (CoC), the City of Duluth funds a portion of the Coordinated Entry

Coordinator who manages the CoC waitlist, works with sub recipients to input data into HMIS correctly, in addition to ensuring that the hardest

to house (individuals with a VISPDAT scores of 12-17) are housed as soon as units become available. To further shorten the time of those experiencing homelessness, sub recipients, the City of Duluth, and the Saint Louis County CoC established a monthly meeting where all agencies that participate in the CoC, in addition to United Way's 211 program meet to discuss any issues with getting clients housed, share success stories, and work as a cohort to ensure that the system works well. Providing this opportunity allows consistent partnership, training of new staff, and allows for time to correct any systemic issues and improve the process.

CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)

Actions taken to address the needs of public housing

The City of Duluth does not spend any CDBG, HOME or ESG funds to address the needs of Public Housing. The Duluth HRA utilizes various other resources to keep public housing units in good repair through its use of its annual HUD Capital Fund grant, occasional use of energy performance contracting, and use of general obligation bond funded loans provided by the Minnesota Housing Finance Agency, when appropriated by the state legislature. The HRA has also used its local levy resources to augment such funds when needed.

Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership

Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership

The HRA held regular meetings during the year with its Resident Advisory Board (RAB) and also promotes resident attendance at high rise resident club meetings. Staff are made available to attend Club meetings as warranted and requested. The HRA also has a self-sufficiency program and a Section 8 Homeownership program, both of which were promoted during the year. The HRA also has a Public Housing Outreach program which provides various information and referral of interest to residents on a regular basis.

Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs

NA

CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)

Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)

Support selective demolition: The City proactively removes blighted, vacant buildings. When a site is unfit for redevelopment due to its location (e.g., located in a flood zone), that site is then left free of buildings or impervious surfaces in order to provide open space and prevent cyclical building degradation. On sites with the potential for redevelopment, all waste is removed.

Complete housing rehabs: CDBG- and HOME-funded rehab projects were completed, with all code and lead-based paint issues addressed, and the resulting housing units assessed for healthy home deficiencies.

Vacant properties in LMI neighborhoods: One Roof Community Housing acquired, rehabbed, and sold formerly vacant or foreclosed properties in the Central and East Hillside, Lincoln Park, and West Duluth neighborhoods. These properties are systematically enrolled in One Roof's Community Land Trust program, which preserves long-term housing affordability while encouraging homeownership.

Energy requirements: Energy efficiency was increased by at least 20% by rehab projects in existing homes.

TBRA for "hard-to-house": HOME funds were used to provide rental subsidies

Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

CDBG funds were utilized to fund the Tenant Landlord Connection which assists in providing services to landlords and tenants. The services include education on fair housing rules, responsible renting, lead based paint hazards, education on rights and responsibilities, and mediation between landlords and tenants. These services help to eliminate homelessness by mediating disputes, and thereby reducing the number of evictions of individuals and families. HOME funds were utilized to provide tenant based rental assistance with homeless, formerly homeless, and "hard to house" persons. This assistance is part of the coordinated entry system in Duluth, which involves several homeless individual-serving partners. The 2019 PY was the first year for Salvation Army's Landlord Incentative program, which works with landlords to rent unit to people who have been incarcerated. This program will be continued in the next Action Plan.

Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The City partnered with the Duluth Housing and Redevelopment Authority to work to reduce lead-based paint hazards. The HRA's staff during this period included a number of lead-certified inspectors, which allowed for a timely and thorough review of lead-based paint risks in affordable housing projects.

Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The City collaborated with partners to review services to families that might be experiencing or were at risk of poverty. Through strong partnerships with sub-recipients; Center City Housing and CHUM, services were provided to at-risk families at Steve O'Neil Apartments and the CHUM Shelter. Additional services of youth programming and food were provided through the Neighborhood Youth Services (NYS) JET Food program. The City worked with sub-recipient NYS to discuss options for expanded job training for at-risk youth, with a focus on one of Duluth's job growth sectors, food services. The City worked with its affordable housing providers to consider future options for family supportive housing.

With support from CDBG funds, SOAR Career Solutions administers the Duluth at Work collaborative which helps low income people to receive training, get hired, and increase their income. The Entrepreneur Fund assists low-income business owners to increase their revenue.

Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Duluth's Tenant Landlord Connection (TLC) is managed and staffed by One Roof Community Housing. The TLC educates existing and potential landlords and tenants of their respective rights and responsibilities; it mediates disputes, helps work to avoid evictions whenever possible, provides Ready-to-Rent classes for hopeful tenants looking to improve their or establish their rental history, and refers individuals experiencing discrimination to fair housing resources.

Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

In 2019, the City partnered with Local Initiatives Support Corporation – Duluth to establish the Quality of Life Neighborhoods Initiative. This initiative will use a cross-sector, collective impact approach to work to reduce poverty, improve quality of life, and address disparities through a focused partnership between organizations. Two CDBG neighborhoods will serve as focal points: Hillside and Lincoln Park. Two neighborhood intermediaries, Ecolibrium3 in Lincoln Park and Zeitgeist in Hillside, will provide support and ensure a high level of engagement. The Quality of Life Neighborhoods Initiative includes working groups focused on housing, health, asset and income, economic development, and education. The City of Duluth, including the City's Community Development program and Planning and Development staff, is closely involved in this work as it seeks to build capacities for residents and neighborhoods.

Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The City and St. Louis County (SLC) worked together to secure federal, state and local resources and to ensure coordination of services for homeless families and individuals. The City and County continued to provide leadership for the update of the 5-Year Plan to End Homelessness. Also, the Duluth HRA continues to manage the coordinated entry system in Duluth, which assists with the coordination and placement of homeless/at-risk of being homeless people. Relationships with the emergency shelters, transitional housing and other housing and homeless service provider agencies have continued and cooperation between all of the entities working within the continuum has increased.

Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions

analysis of impediments to fair housing choice.

Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)

In 2019, the City updated the Fair Housing Plan by conducting a new Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice. The City of Duluth reviewed demographic data, collected input from community members and organizations, and researched trends in housing and real estate in order to identify the main impediments to fair housing choice, and develop strategies that lay out the City's planned actions to affirmatively further fair housing in the next five years. The study successfully reported four major impediments to fair housing choice, and created unique strategies for each to be implemented throughout the next five years. The four major impediments identified were exclusionary rental housing practices and policies directed at Section 8 Housing Choice voucher holders, exclusionary rental housing practices and policies directed at persons with criminal backgrounds, involuntary displacement and limited housing choice caused by gentrification, and policies and physical limitations in the built environment. Strategies developed in response to these impediments include campaigns to work with local partners and landlords to incentivize more inclusive rental policies as well as measures to further track and research sources of displacement in order for the city to make more well informed policy changes to properly address these issues. The City has continued to fund the Tenant Landlord Connection (TLC) in order to educate both tenants and landlords about their rights and to provide mediation services to reduce evictions and fair housing violations. A fair housing and reasonable accommodations training provided in 2016 contributed to subgrantees' awareness of and preparation for fair housing issues in FY2017. The City's Human Rights Officer provides residents with information about their rights regarding fair and accessible housing. The City has a Human Rights Commission, a Commission on Disabilities, and Community Planning Committee, all of which discuss affordable housing needs on a regular basis. On an ongoing basis, the Human Rights Office and the Human Rights Commission are working to streamline the reporting and enforcement of fair housing complaints. In its Imagine Duluth 2035 comprehensive planning process, the City actively engaged with both stakeholders and residents to develop long-range strategies pertaining to housing access. The Duluth 2035 plan was adopted on June 25, 2018 and included two new principles relating to fair housing, "Develop a healthy community" and "Integrate fairness into the fabric of the community." These guiding principles are utilized in the review of development projects to insure the decision making process includes people of all backgrounds. These principles have been incorporated into the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan process which was developed in 2019.

CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230

Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements

All CDBG, HOME and ESG funded programs receive monitoring based upon an annual risk assessment. Every individual community development project is monitored annually. This is done through either a program desk monitoring or by an on-site monitoring that inspects and reviews client records using the HUD Monitoring Handbook. In addition, annually, a financial monitoring is conducted on all of the agencies through review of independent audit reports and other financial documentation. During onsite visits, staff verifies that program activities are meeting a national objective such as: serving homeless people, operating rental properties within rent and income limits, and that funds are expended appropriately on eligible activities. Staff also reviews the subrecipients policies and procedures, including their communication and outreach plans. Specific activities, such as the Entrepreneur Fund actively outreaches to minority owned businesses to include them in their business cohort. HRA, One Roof and Ecolibrium-3 participate in the MBWE programs. The Imagine Duluth 2035 Comprehensive Plan was adopted on June 25, 2018 and it includes principles to insure fair housing and equity, "Develop a healthy community and Integrate fairness into the fabric of the community.

Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)

Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.

A public notice about the 2019 CAPER was published on September 5, 2020 in the Duluth News Tribune. The draft 2019 CAPER is available on the City's Website. A public hearing on the 2019 CAPER and the agencies performance will be held on a virtual meeting open to the public on September 22, 2020.

CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)

Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction’s program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.

Based on community input and housing data, the Committee chose to recommend a stronger funding focus on affordable housing in 2019 than in previous years. This was to meet the needs that were identified during community input through the Imagine Duluth 2035 Comprehensive Plan process in addition to the annual community needs survey, and other input opportunities held throughout the year.

Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?

No

[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.

CR-50 - HOME 91.520(d)

Include the results of on-site inspections of affordable rental housing assisted under the program to determine compliance with housing codes and other applicable regulations

Please list those projects that should have been inspected on-site this program year based upon the schedule in §92.504(d). Indicate which of these were inspected and a summary of issues that were detected during the inspection. For those that were not inspected, please indicate the reason and how you will remedy the situation.

There are nine rental properties that have received HOME funds that are still within the affordability period. The City of Duluth tracks when a project was approved, built, first monitored, and the subsequent monitoring visits in compliance with the HOME regulations. All of these properties participated in virtual monitoring in 2020. The Duluth HRA is contracted to provide building inspection services, with Certified Building Inspectors and Lead-Based paint assessors. Due to the COVID pandemic, the HRA will provide the on-site monitoring in the spring of 2021.

Provide an assessment of the jurisdiction's affirmative marketing actions for HOME units. 92.351(b)

Agencies that receive HOME funds are required to submit to the city for review an affirmative marketing plan. It is reviewed for consistency, fairness, and to ensure that the programs are adequately marketed to people.

Refer to IDIS reports to describe the amount and use of program income for projects, including the number of projects and owner and tenant characteristics

No program income was used on HOME projects. Program income was used for CDBG housing rehab projects.

Describe other actions taken to foster and maintain affordable housing. 91.220(k) (STATES ONLY: Including the coordination of LIHTC with the development of affordable housing). 91.320(j)

The City of Duluth worked with developers for LIHTC and worked proactively on applications for Low Income Housing Tax Credits.

CR-60 - ESG 91.520(g) (ESG Recipients only)

ESG Supplement to the CAPER in *e-snaps*

For Paperwork Reduction Act

1. Recipient Information—All Recipients Complete

Basic Grant Information

Recipient Name	DULUTH
Organizational DUNS Number	077627883
EIN/TIN Number	416005105
Identify the Field Office	MINNEAPOLIS
Identify CoC(s) in which the recipient or subrecipient(s) will provide ESG assistance	Duluth/Saint Louis County CoC

ESG Contact Name

Prefix	Mr
First Name	BENJAMIN
Middle Name	M
Last Name	VANTASSEL
Suffix	0
Title	Manager

ESG Contact Address

Street Address 1	City Hall
Street Address 2	411 W First ST
City	Duluth
State	MN
ZIP Code	-
Phone Number	2187305299
Extension	0
Fax Number	0
Email Address	BVANTASSEL@DULUTHMN.GOV

ESG Secondary Contact

Prefix	Mr
First Name	Adam
Last Name	Fulton
Suffix	0
Title	Manager
Phone Number	2187305325
Extension	0
Email Address	Afulton@duluthmn.gov

2. Reporting Period—All Recipients Complete

Program Year Start Date	04/01/2019
Program Year End Date	03/31/2020

3a. Subrecipient Form – Complete one form for each subrecipient

Subrecipient or Contractor Name
City
State
Zip Code
DUNS Number
Is subrecipient a victim services provider
Subrecipient Organization Type
ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount

CR-65 - Persons Assisted

4. Persons Served

4a. Complete for Homelessness Prevention Activities

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	41
Children	3
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	44

Table 16 – Household Information for Homeless Prevention Activities

4b. Complete for Rapid Re-Housing Activities

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	35
Children	8
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	43

Table 17 – Household Information for Rapid Re-Housing Activities

4c. Complete for Shelter

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	1,833
Children	163
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	1,996

Table 18 – Shelter Information

4d. Street Outreach

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	162
Children	9
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	171

Table 19 – Household Information for Street Outreach

4e. Totals for all Persons Served with ESG

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	1,145
Children	63
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	1,208

Table 20 – Household Information for Persons Served with ESG

5. Gender—Complete for All Activities

	Total
Male	798
Female	344
Transgender	1
Don't Know/Refused/Other	2
Missing Information	63
Total	1,208

Table 21 – Gender Information

6. Age—Complete for All Activities

	Total
Under 18	63
18-24	119
25 and over	1,026
Don't Know/Refused/Other	0
Missing Information	0
Total	1,208

Table 22 – Age Information

7. Special Populations Served—Complete for All Activities

Number of Persons in Households

Subpopulation	Total	Total Persons Served – Prevention	Total Persons Served – RRH	Total Persons Served in Emergency Shelters
Veterans	75	0	0	0
Victims of Domestic Violence	324	0	0	0
Elderly	63	0	0	0
HIV/AIDS	4	0	0	0
Chronically Homeless	462	0	0	0
Persons with Disabilities:				
Severely Mentally Ill	689	0	0	0
Chronic Substance Abuse	142	0	0	0
Other Disability	276	0	0	0
Total (Unduplicated if possible)	0	0	0	0

Table 23 – Special Population Served

CR-70 – ESG 91.520(g) - Assistance Provided and Outcomes

10. Shelter Utilization

Number of New Units - Rehabbed	0
Number of New Units - Conversion	0
Total Number of bed-nights available	0
Total Number of bed-nights provided	0
Capacity Utilization	0.00%

Table 24 – Shelter Capacity

11. Project Outcomes Data measured under the performance standards developed in consultation with the CoC(s)

City of Duluth ESG funds are used for two overnight shelters, CHUM and Safe Haven. Both of these agencies exceeded their goals. These agencies are part of the St. Louis County COC and comply with all the required performance standards.

CR-75 – Expenditures

11. Expenditures

11a. ESG Expenditures for Homelessness Prevention

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2017	2018	2019
Expenditures for Rental Assistance	0	0	10,189
Expenditures for Housing Relocation and Stabilization Services - Financial Assistance	0	0	0
Expenditures for Housing Relocation & Stabilization Services - Services	0	0	0
Expenditures for Homeless Prevention under Emergency Shelter Grants Program	0	0	0
Subtotal Homelessness Prevention	0	0	10,189

Table 25 – ESG Expenditures for Homelessness Prevention

11b. ESG Expenditures for Rapid Re-Housing

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2017	2018	2019
Expenditures for Rental Assistance	0	0	12,062
Expenditures for Housing Relocation and Stabilization Services - Financial Assistance	0	0	0
Expenditures for Housing Relocation & Stabilization Services - Services	0	0	0
Expenditures for Homeless Assistance under Emergency Shelter Grants Program	0	0	0
Subtotal Rapid Re-Housing	0	0	12,062

Table 26 – ESG Expenditures for Rapid Re-Housing

11c. ESG Expenditures for Emergency Shelter

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2017	2018	2019
Essential Services	0	30,518	94,281
Operations	0	0	0
Renovation	0	0	0

Major Rehab	0	0	0
Conversion	0	0	0
Subtotal	0	30,518	94,281

Table 27 – ESG Expenditures for Emergency Shelter

11d. Other Grant Expenditures

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2017	2018	2019
Street Outreach	0	0	0
HMIS	0	4,000	4,000
Administration	6,202	12,570	0

Table 28 - Other Grant Expenditures

11e. Total ESG Grant Funds

Total ESG Funds Expended	2017	2018	2019
	6,202	47,088	120,532

Table 29 - Total ESG Funds Expended

11f. Match Source

	2017	2018	2019
Other Non-ESG HUD Funds	0	0	0
Other Federal Funds	0	0	276,264
State Government	0	0	309,650
Local Government	0	0	0

Private Funds	0	0	245,540
Other	0	0	37,070
Fees	0	0	0
Program Income	0	0	0
Total Match Amount	0	0	868,524

Table 30 - Other Funds Expended on Eligible ESG Activities

11g. Total

Total Amount of Funds Expended on ESG Activities	2017	2018	2019
	6,202	47,088	989,056

Table 31 - Total Amount of Funds Expended on ESG Activities