Duluth Parking Commission Sixty-First Meeting 7:30 a.m. Friday, April 6, 2018 City Council Chambers, Duluth City Hall

# **Members Present**

- Andy Goldfine, President
- Noland Makowsky
- Jessica Sterle
- Michael Warsop, Vice President
- Em Westerlund

#### **Members Absent**

Karin Swor

# **Guests Present**

- Mark Bauer, Parking Operations Specialist City of Duluth
- Carl Crawford, Human Rights Officer City of Duluth
- Charlie Deville Lincoln Park Business Group
- Tom Hanson Lincoln Park business owner
- Denette Lynch, Duluth resident
- Doug Melander, Duluth Operations Manager Interstate Parking Company, Inc.
- Garner Moffat Lincoln Park Business Group

# Approval of March 2018 meeting minutes

Commissioner Em Westerlund motioned to approve the minutes of the March 2018 Duluth Parking Commission meeting. Commission Vice President Michael Warsop seconded the motion, which was approved 5-0.

# **On-street ADA signage request**

City of Duluth Parking Operations Specialist Mark Bauer proposed that two on-street ADA signage requests be approved. He stated that he had reviewed the applications and visited the properties, verifying the accuracy of the applications and the need for the on-street parking spaces, and that he had consulted with the City of Duluth Commission on Disabilities regarding the requests. Commissioner Warsop motioned that the request related to 24 East 11<sup>th</sup> Street be approved. Commissioner Jessica Sterle seconded the motion, which was approved 5-0. Commissioner Warsop seconded the motion, which was approved 5-0.

# Report on Lincoln Park on-street parking study

Mr. Bauer reported on the parking division's findings thus far of the most recent study of the need for onstreet parking meters and associated fees in Lincoln Park. He stated that the parking division had been directed to conduct a new study by the Duluth City Council, in response to a request to do so by the Lincoln Park Business Group. Mr. Bauer stated that the City had conducted similar studies in 2011 and 2016 and that the findings of the associated stakeholder surveys had been similar in each of the three studies, including the new one – that the majority of area stakeholders were not in favor of removal of the on-street parking meters and fees and were fearful of the impact that the possibly resulting lack of turnover could have on their businesses. He stated that of the 41 surveys that were distributed, 14 were returned, with nine in favor of retaining the on-street meters and fees and five in favor of removal. Mr. Bauer stated that removal of the meters would be in conflict with the developing Imagine Duluth 2035 comprehensive plan, which contains language that specifies reinvestment of parking revenue in the areas in which it was collected, as well as the emerging future concept of pricing on-street parking at a premium to better encourage off-street parking. He stated that a Lincoln Park apartment building manager had recently called him and inquired when the meters would be removed so that their residents could begin parking in the business district, which Mr. Bauer indicated supported the concerns about parking availability for business patrons. Mr. Bauer stated that, for those reasons, the parking division did not recommend removal of the Lincoln Park meters and fees. He stated that he was actively working with the City of Duluth Business Development staff on alternative ideas to assist with Lincoln Park's parking needs and that new meter technology and the successful Park Duluth mobile parking payment system would provide a high level of convenience to on-street parkers in Lincoln Park. LPBG representative Garner Moffat stated that there were a number of parking issues in Lincoln Park that needed to be addressed. He stated that the City's review process had been inadequate and that there was a lack of parking enforcement in Lincoln Park. Mr. Moffat stated that the language in the survey that was distributed was misleading. Commissioner Warsop inquired whether the Lincoln Park Business Group had received a copy of the survey in advance of distribution. Mr. Moffat replied that they had and stated that public surveys were not helpful, indicating that he would prefer that the parking division meet in Lincoln Park with the LPBG to resolve the issue. Mr. Bauer stated that while the parking division respects the opinions of Mr. Moffat and the LPBG, it was important that all area stakeholders' input be considered, whether or not they were member of or participated in the LPBG. LPBG representative Charlie Deville stated that the survey results showed that business owners don't have faith in the City. He stated that it was "worth it to roll the dice" and that instead of surveying stakeholders, the City should hold meetings in Lincoln Park. Mr. Deville indicated that the City should explore diagonal versus parallel parking in the area. Lincoln Park business owner Tom Hanson stated that the reason business owners don't come to meetings is that they are busy running their businesses. He stated that he would like to see more parking enforcement in Lincoln Park. Mr. Hanson indicated that he was sorry to see the divisiveness that had arisen in the Lincoln Park business community. Because of a potential conflict of interest, one commissioner was unable to vote on the item, and therefore a quorum of voting commissioners could not be obtained. However, Mr. Bauer agreed to meet with Mr. Moffat prior to the May commission meeting to further discuss the Lincoln Park meters and other items.

#### Report on West Duluth on-street time limits study

Mr. Bauer reported on the parking division's findings thus far on a study of the on-street time limits in portions of West Duluth. He stated that an area stakeholder had requested a study on the need for the existing two-hour time limit parking in areas of Grand Avenue, Bristol Street, and Ramsey Street. He stated that 57 surveys were distributed, and of those 18 were returned. Mr. Bauer stated that of the 18 returned, nine were in favor of eliminating the time limits and nine supported retaining the time limits. He stated that the parking division would like to see greater support for a configuration change prior to recommending such a change and that, therefore, the parking division did not recommend any changes at that time. Duluth resident Denette Lynch stated that the West Duluth Business Club was planning to meet the following week. Commissioner Westerlund motioned that the item be tabled until the May parking commission meeting to allow time for Mr. Bauer to attend the upcoming WDBC meeting to discuss the item and gather further input. Commissioner Warsop seconded the motion, which was approved 5-0.

# **Recommendation of 2018 Canal Park seasonal rates**

Mr. Bauer presented a recommendations package for 2018 Canal Park seasonal rates. Interstate Parking Company, Inc. Duluth Operations Manager Doug Melander described that all Canal Park off-street parking rates would remain the same in 2018 as they had in 2017 except for those at Irvin Lot and Steam Plant Lot. He stated that Interstate and the City's parking division had agreed that those rates should adjust from \$.50 per hour with a daily maximum of \$4.00 to \$1.00 per hour with a daily maximum of \$8.00 to better reflect parking demand in the area and to align the rate structures with those in other nearby lots. Commissioner Warsop motioned to approve the 2018 Canal Park seasonal rates proposal. Commissioner Sterle seconded the motion, which was approved 5-0.

# Off-street parking update

Mr. Melander provided an update on off-street parking operations. He stated that structural repairs to the Hart District Ramp were continuing, with several items that could not be completed in the winter due to cold scheduled to be completed in the spring.

# **On-street parking update**

Mr. Bauer provided an update on on-street parking operations. He stated that usage of the Park Duluth mobile parking payment application continued to grow and that feedback had been overwhelmingly positive. He stated that he was actively exploring new on-street parking payment technology and that he would continue to update the commission as plans to upgrade the existing on-street payment system moved forward.

# **Public Comments**

Denette Lynch stated that she would like to see improved wayfinding between the Norshor Theater and the nearby Medical District Ramp. She stated that she would like to see more specificity in the parking commission agenda items. She expressed concern that visitors to Duluth may not know about the widespread alternate side parking configuration and stated she was surprised that multi-space parking pay stations were so expensive.

Respectfully submitted,

Mark Bauer Parking Operations Specialist