Duluth Racial Bias Audit – June 2023 Progress Update

Summary

CJI has been participating in monthly meetings with the Racial Bias Audit Team (RBAT) since September 2022. The purpose of these meetings is for CJI to provide progress updates towards the 11 audit objectives, for RBAT to provide input on the approach for the audit objectives, and to allow both groups to work collaboratively toward the most comprehensive assessment possible. At the request of RBAT members, CJI also began providing a biweekly update to RBAT between monthly meetings as an opportunity to solicit questions, determine the need for an additional meeting within the month, and obtain agenda items for the scheduled monthly meeting.

In May 2023, CJI began synthesizing information and assembling the framework for a final report on the assessment of the audit objectives. The community survey closed on April 30, garnering an exceptional response turnout. An overview of work to date on each of the audit objectives is below. The audit team has completed assessments for all objectives and is finalizing the draft report. This draft will be provided to the RBAT and DPD at the end of June 2023, allowing time for the group to review, provide commentary, and ask questions about the findings and considerations. This process is meant to strengthen the accessibility of the final report for public consumption. During the July RBAT meeting, this group will discuss revisions to the report that CJI may have made based on the feedback provided. CJI intends to publicly release the report at the beginning of August. The community will be invited to presentations regarding the findings and considerations of the assessment; those dates/times will be announced in July through social media, the racial bias audit webpage, and outreach with local community organizations. CJI will also make presentation materials available to the public through these same outlets.

CJI and RBAT began the implementation planning process, discussing accessible ways to present the audit findings and foster collaboration between the department and the community. Specifically, CJI aims to present findings and facilitate discussion in environments that can encourage shared learning and commitments from both DPD and the community through honest and robust conversations. Implementation planning sessions with the DPD and the community are anticipated to occur in August and September 2023.

Audit Objective #1: Recruitment, Hiring, and Personnel Practices

This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:
- Developed an assessment protocol that incorporates best practices in recruiting, hiring, promoting, and retaining a diverse workforce.
- Compiled and reviewed more than 250 relevant policies, training materials, and hiring materials relevant to recruitment, hiring, and personnel practices.

- Developed an interview protocol for staff involved with recruiting, hiring, and personnel processes in preparation for the February site visit.
- Conducted interviews with DPD staff who work on recruiting, hiring, and retention to better understand whether their practices and policies align with best practices in promoting a diverse workforce.
- Participated in officer interview panels to observe the civil service interview portion of the hiring process.
- Summarized findings and considerations based on a review of policies and other materials related to recruitment, hiring, and personnel practices into assessment draft report.

Audit Objective #2: Bias and Interracial Relations Trainings

This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:
- Developed an assessment protocol for measuring how trainings focused on bias have been received by DPD staff and whether there has been a measurable impact on officer behavior.
- Drafted and distributed an anonymous web-based survey of DPD staff.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with relevant training staff.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for DPD officers relevant to audit objectives 2, 3, and 4.
- Conducted an anonymous web-based survey of DPD staff to assess attitudes towards the Racial Bias Audit, opinions about the prevalence of white supremacism or racism within the Department (by individuals or departmental culture), and how the department addresses issues about race and ethnicity through policy and practice.
- Interviewed relevant training staff to assess DPD's implementation of bias and interracial relations trainings.
- Conducted focus groups with Patrol and Investigations Division officers and supervisors to discuss their perception of these trainings and application of skills learned.
- Compiled and reviewed training materials relevant to bias and interracial relations training.
- Analyzed findings from the anonymous web-based survey of DPD staff conducted in January.
- Integrated key takeaways and findings from resource review and survey into assessment draft report.

Audit Objective #3: BIPOC Community Relations

This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:
- Developed an assessment protocol that outlines the framework by which CJI will assess DPD's engagement with BIPOC communities and the two groups' attitudes toward each other.
- Compiled and reviewed more than 30 policies, directives, and resources relevant to community engagement, diversity, equity, and inclusion staffing.
- Drafted an interview protocol for and conducted a meeting with DPD's Public Information Officer.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for Community Engagement Officers.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for DPD officers relevant to audit objectives 2, 3, and 4.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for Duluth BIPOC community members.
- Compiled a list of best practices for law enforcement engagement with BIPOC communities.
- Conducted a focus group with Community Engagement Officers as well as focus groups with Patrol and Investigations Division officers and supervisors to discuss department members'

interactions with BIPOC community members and any possible impact of racial tensions within their work.
- Met with leaders and members of the BIPOC organizations in Duluth to inform pathways for information collection about BIPOC community members' interactions with and perception of DPD.
- Developed and launched a community survey to assess community members' interactions with DPD, opinions on race and culture in Duluth, awareness of the Duluth Civilian Review Board, and knowledge of the complaint process.
- Conducted individual interviews and four community forums with members of the BIPOC community to inform our assessment of DPD's community engagement and interactions with the BIPOC community. Community forums were conducted with the assistance of two community partners: the American Indian Community Housing Organization and the University of Minnesota Duluth's Office of Diversity and Inclusion.
- Extended the close date for the online community survey at the request of RBAT and the greater Duluth community to gain additional responses.
- Analyzed findings from the community survey conducted in March-April.
- Conducted further community outreach to recommended individuals.
- Summarized findings from the community-wide survey, interviews, individual meetings, focus groups, and forums, and drafted considerations based on best practices.

Audit Objective #4: Suspicious and Criminal Activity
This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:
- Developed an assessment protocol that outlines the framework by which CJI will assess how DPD evaluates reports of suspicious or criminal activity for possibly racially motivated exaggerations and/or fabrications.
- Compiled and reviewed information relating to how officers evaluate reports of suspicious or criminal activity and detecting racially biased motivations for such reports.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with relevant dispatch staff.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for DPD officers relevant to audit objectives 2, 3, and 4.
- Conducted focus groups with DPD officers and supervisors within the Patrol and Investigations Divisions to discuss how officers approach calls regarding suspicious or criminal activity.
- Interviewed personnel from the St. Louis County Dispatch Center to learn more about how staff intake and dispatch calls related to suspicious persons including the information they typically provide to officers.
- Assessed data on responses to community generated calls and officer-initiated stops for demographic or outcome differences.
- Reviewed policies, procedures, and common practices related to how officers approach calls about suspicious persons.
- Summarized findings and considerations related to possibly racially motivated calls about suspicious or criminal activity.

Audit Objective #5: Gathering and Interpreting DPD Data
This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:
- Developed an assessment protocol that outlines the framework by which CJI will assess how DPD gathers and interprets data.

- Completed a review of publicly available data dashboards, DPD policies, directives, presentations, and reports regarding racial/ethnic breakdown of stops and other police-public interactions (e.g., use of force).
- Drafted an interview protocol and conducted preliminary interviews with data analytics staff.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with command staff.
- Observed a COMPSTAT meeting and conducted an interview with command staff related to the internal use of data.
- Conducted a review and assessment of data collection systems.
- Presented benchmarks and assessment recommendations for public data to RBAT for feedback and discussion.
- Participated in ridealongs with patrol to better inform how DPD's data collection systems work in practice.
- Summarized findings and considerations related to DPD's data collection and interpretation of data.

Audit Objective #6: Vehicle and Pedestrian Stops
This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:
- Developed methodology to assess racial disparities in vehicle and pedestrian stops and stop outcomes that occurred in 2022.
- Received data from DPD on the data elements necessary for assessment of vehicle and pedestrian stops and stop outcomes.
- Presented methodology to RBAT to solicit feedback and provide any necessary clarifications.
- Completed data analysis for vehicle and pedestrian stops based on data provided by DPD.
- Summarized findings and considerations assessing the impact of enforcement actions on BIPOC communities based on the stops analysis.

Audit Objective #7: Civil Disturbance
This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:
- Developed an assessment protocol to evaluate DPD's practices with respect to civil disturbances based on national standards of best practice.
- Compiled more than 20 policies, directives, and trainings relevant to civil disturbance.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with command staff.
- Completed a review of DPD policies, directives, and trainings relevant to the Department's response to civil disturbances.
- Conducted an interview with command staff relevant to civil disturbances.
- Conducted a follow up interview with command staff regarding responses to civil disturbances.
- Summarized findings and considerations based on information learned about DPD's response to civil disturbances and best practices in the field.

Audit Objective #8: Immigrant and Refugee Populations
This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:

- Developed an assessment protocol to evaluate DPD's practices in interactions with immigrant and refugee populations.
- Compiled and reviewed relevant policies and directives from DPD and a select group of law enforcement agencies that interact with immigrant communities.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with community leaders that work with or serve immigrant and refugee populations in Duluth.
- Compiled a list of best practices for law enforcement procedures related to immigrant and refugee populations.
- Conducted interviews with community members who are engaged with the immigrant and refugee populations of Duluth to inform our assessment of DPD's interactions with these communities.
- Summarized assessment of DPD's procedures for interacting with immigrant and refugee populations and made considerations based on nationally recognized best practices for these interactions.

Audit Objective #9: Duluth Citizen Review Board
This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:
- Developed an assessment protocol that outlines the framework by which CJI will assess the role of the DCRB and determine recommendations for increased effectiveness.
- Compiled and reviewed more than 20 public communications, reports, and resources relevant to the DCRB's activities over the past nine years.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with DPD staff engaged with the DCRB.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for current and past DCRB members.
- Compiled a list of best practices for civilian review boards with powers comparable to the DCRB.
- Conducted interviews with DPD staff engaged with the DCRB to discuss their practices relative to engagement and information sharing and the relationship between the two groups.
- Conducted a focus group with current and past DCRB members to discuss the DCRB's role, effectiveness, and visibility within the Duluth community.
- Conducted two one-on-one interviews with past DCRB members.
- Developed and launched a community survey to assess community members' interactions with DPD, opinions on race and culture in Duluth, awareness of the Duluth Civilian Review Board, and knowledge of the complaint process.
- Reviewed DPD complaint data from the past five years to assess complaint outcomes and complainant satisfaction level.
- Analyzed findings from the community survey conducted in March-April.
- Summarized findings and considerations for the DCRB based on our review of resources, research on best practices, interviews and focus groups with relevant stakeholders, community survey, and assessment of complaint satisfaction levels.

Audit Objective #10: DPD Camera Data Review
This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:
- Developed an assessment protocol that details the level of review that body-worn camera information can provide and the actions and behaviors that may represent biased behavior.
- Completed the sampling methodology and received approval from RBAT.

- Defined the sample of stops and provided to DPD to ensure video retention and compilation of supplementary data for each encounter.
- Received a data file with associated documentation.
- Reviewed videos associated with the sampled stops and analyzed findings regarding officer demeanor.
- Summarized findings and considerations based on video reviews regarding bias activities, to include any identified patterns of behavior and language.

Audit Objective #11: Use of Force

This audit objective is complete, see 'Completed Milestones' below.

Completed Milestones:
- Developed an assessment protocol that details the benchmarked standards for documenting, investigating, and adjudicating officer use of force as well as public transparency of the process.
- Compiled more than 400 DPD policies, directives, documents, and data regarding use of force incidents.
- Reviewed and assessed DPD's publicly available use of force information.
- Conducted a preliminary interview with the Use of Force Coordinator to understand the documentation and review process associated with uses of force in the Department.
- Summarized findings and considerations based on a review of DPD policies, directives, and data regarding use of force incidents.