

## Duluth Racial Bias Audit – January 2023 Progress Update

### Summary

CJI's contract with the City of Duluth was fully executed September 14<sup>th</sup>, 2022, and we began forming working relationships with the Duluth Police Department and the Racial Bias Audit Team shortly thereafter. Since then, CJI has been participating in monthly meetings with the Racial Bias Audit Team. We plan to do this for the duration of our 12-month engagement with Duluth. These meetings involve CJI providing progress updates towards the 11 audit objectives, the RBAT providing input on the approach for audit objectives, and both groups working collaboratively to ensure the audit is as comprehensive as possible.

In January, CJI's team focused on finalizing assessment protocols for each of the 11 audit objectives, conducting document reviews for some of the objectives, and planning a site visit for February. The CJI project team lead, Katie Zafft, is participating in regular observation of DPD's patrol division through twice monthly ridealongs with different shifts, patrol crews, and officers. A summary of the status of work to date on each of the audit objectives is below.

### Audit Objective #1: Recruitment, Hiring, and Personnel Practices

CJI is working toward completing a review of policies, training materials, and hiring materials which will help inform the focus of interviews planned during the upcoming site visit.

#### Completed Milestones:

- Developed an assessment protocol that incorporates best practices in recruiting, hiring, promoting, and retaining a diverse workforce.
- Compiled more than 250 policies, training materials, and hiring materials relevant to recruitment, hiring, and personnel practices.
- Developed an interview protocol for staff involved with recruiting, hiring, and personnel processes in preparation for the February site visit.

### Audit Objective #2: Bias and Interracial Relations Trainings

CJI conducted an anonymous web-based survey of DPD staff from January 11<sup>th</sup> through January 25<sup>th</sup>. The survey was focused on assessing attitudes towards the Racial Bias Audit and opinions about the prevalence of white supremacy or racism within the Department (by individuals or departmental culture) and how the department addresses issues about race and ethnicity through policy and practice. We are preparing for interviews with relevant training staff, which will occur during the upcoming site visit, to assess DPD's implementation of bias and interracial relations trainings. CJI is also planning focus groups that will be held with Patrol and Investigations Division officers during the same site visit to discuss topics related to audit objectives 2, 3, and 4.

#### Completed Milestones:

- Developed an assessment protocol for measuring how trainings focused on bias have been received by DPD staff and whether there has been a measurable impact on officer behavior.
- Drafted and distributed an anonymous web-based survey of DPD staff.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with relevant training staff.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for DPD officers relevant to audit objectives 2, 3, and 4.

### Audit Objective #3: BIPOC Community Relations

CJI has begun assessing DPD's programming and engagement with BIPOC community organizations, their hiring of BIPOC individuals to engage with the community, and whether DPD is following best practices for interactions with BIPOC communities. We are preparing for a focus group with Community Engagement Officers, which will occur during the upcoming site visit. CJI is also planning focus groups that will be held with Patrol and Investigations Division officers during the same site visit to discuss topics related to audit objectives 2, 3, and 4. In addition, we are building connections with leaders and members of BIPOC organizations in Duluth which will lead to future focus group conversations about BIPOC community members' interactions with and perception of DPD relevant to this topic.

#### Completed Milestones:

- Developed an assessment protocol that outlines the framework by which CJI will assess DPD's engagement with BIPOC communities and the two groups' attitudes towards each other.
- Compiled and reviewed more than 30 policies, directives, and resources relevant to community engagement, diversity, equity, and inclusion staffing.
- Drafted an interview protocol for and conducted a meeting with DPD's Public Information Officer.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for Community Engagement Officers.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for DPD officers relevant to audit objectives 2, 3, and 4.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for Duluth BIPOC community members.

### Audit Objective #4: Suspicious and Criminal Activity

CJI has begun compiling information related to how officers evaluate reports of suspicious or criminal activity and detecting racially biased motivations for such reports. As DPD does not have a specific policy regarding this type of call for service, we are reviewing policies and trainings related to patrol officer assessment of incoming calls for service and self-initiated interactions related to incidents involving suspicious persons. CJI is preparing for officer focus groups with DPD officers within the Patrol and Investigations Divisions to discuss how officers approach these types of calls or incidents. CJI has contacted the St. Louis County Dispatch Center to learn more about how dispatchers intake calls related to suspicious persons and the information they typically provide to officers. While dispatchers are not DPD staff or subject to the Racial Bias Audit, understanding their protocol for taking calls for service is necessary for this audit objective.

#### Completed Milestones:

- Developed an assessment protocol that outlines the framework by which CJI will assess how DPD evaluates reports of suspicious or criminal activity for possibly racially motivated exaggerations and/or fabrications.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with relevant dispatch staff.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for DPD officers relevant to audit objectives 2, 3, and 4.

### Audit Objective #5: Gathering and Interpreting DPD Data

CJI has continued participating in ridealongs with patrol, which help inform how DPD's data collection systems work in practice. The ridealongs have also informed interview protocols for meetings with command staff and data analytics staff, which will occur during the upcoming site visit, to assess DPD use of collected data.

#### Completed Milestones:

- Developed an assessment protocol that outlines the framework by which CJI will assess how DPD gathers and interprets data.
- Completed a review of publicly available data dashboards, DPD policies, directives, presentations, and reports regarding racial/ethnic breakdown of stops and other police-public interactions (e.g., use of force).
- Drafted an interview protocol and conducted preliminary interview with data analytics staff.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with command staff relevant to audit objectives 5 and 7.

### Audit Objective #6: Vehicle and Pedestrian Stops

CJI is drafting an assessment protocol to evaluate whether DPD vehicle and pedestrian stops align with the expectations of the audit guidelines set forth in the request for proposals. Methodology will be discussed during the January Racial Bias Audit Team monthly meeting with a methodology review to be conducted in February.

### Audit Objective #7: Civil Disturbance

CJI is working toward completing a review of DPD policies, directives, and trainings relevant to the Department's response to civil disturbances. This review is informing the focus of our interviews with command staff relevant to this topic, which will occur during the upcoming site visit.

#### Completed Milestones:

- Developed an assessment protocol to evaluate DPD's practices with respect to civil disturbances based on national standards of best practice.
- Compiled more than 20 policies, directives, and trainings relevant to civil disturbance.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with command staff relevant to audit objectives 5 and 7.

### Audit Objective #8: Immigrant and Refugee Populations

CJI has begun assessing DPD's policies and protocols on interactions with immigrant and refugee populations and the Department's adherence to best practices. We are also building connections with leaders and members of organizations that serve immigrant and refugee populations in Duluth, which will lead to future interviews regarding the relationship between DPD and immigrant and refugee communities.

#### Completed Milestones:

- Developed an assessment protocol to evaluate DPD's practices in interactions with immigrant and refugee populations.
- Compiled and reviewed relevant policies and directives from DPD and a select group of law enforcement agencies that interact with immigrant communities.

- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with community leaders that work with or serve immigrant and refugee populations in Duluth.

### **Audit Objective #9: Duluth Civilian Review Board**

CJI has begun assessing the accomplishments of the DCRB over the last five years. CJI also has begun its comparative analysis of the DCRB and a sample of civilian review boards in other jurisdictions. CJI has begun assembling information to draft a community survey to assess the visibility, accessibility, and usefulness of the DCRB to the Duluth community. The review is informing the content of focus groups with current and past DCRB members and interviews with DPD staff engaged with the DCRB.

#### **Completed Milestones:**

- Developed an assessment protocol that outlines the framework by which CJI will assess the role of the DCRB and determine recommendations for increased effectiveness.
- Compiled and reviewed more than 20 public communications, reports, and resources relevant to the DCRB's activities over the past nine years.
- Drafted an interview protocol for a meeting with DPD staff engaged with the DCRB.
- Drafted a focus group protocol for current and past DCRB members.

### **Audit Objective #10: DPD Camera Data Review**

CJI has completed DPD's background check process necessary to begin receiving video footage and associated documentation for the sampled police interactions. DPD has provided a data file with associated documentation and CJI will work with DPD to gain access to videos associated with the sampled stops.

#### **Completed Milestones:**

- Developed an assessment protocol that details the level of review that body-worn camera information can provide and the actions and behaviors that may represent biased behavior.
- Completed the sampling methodology and received approval from RBAT.
- Defined the sample of stops and provided to DPD to ensure video retention and compilation of supplementary data for each encounter.

### **Audit Objective #11: Use of Force**

CJI has begun reviewing DPD policies, directives, and data regarding use of force incidents. DPD has agreed to include CJI as observers for any use of force review board meetings that occur during the audit period. To date, none have been conducted. CJI also conducted a preliminary interview with the Use of Force Coordinator to understand the documentation and review process associated with uses of force in the Department.

#### **Completed Milestones:**

- Developed an assessment protocol that details the benchmarked standards for documenting, investigating, and adjudicating officer use of force as well as public transparency of the process.
- Compiled more than 400 DPD policies, directives, documents, and data regarding use of force incidents.
- Reviewed and assessed DPD's publicly available use of force information.